


State, Citizens and Education in the Ottoman Empire: Civic Education Curriculum in the Early 20th Century

Mehmet Melik Kaya*

* Department of Social Studies Education,
Faculty of Education, Anadolu University,
Eskişehir, Turkey
E-mail: kymelik@gmail.com

Article Info

Received: October 14, 2021
Revised: November 18, 2021
Accepted: December 20, 2021

 10.46303/repam.2021.6

How to cite

Kaya, M. M. (2021). State, Citizens and Education in the Ottoman Empire: Civic Education Curriculum in the Early 20th Century. *Research in Educational Policy and Management*, 3(2), 42-72.
<https://doi.org/10.46303/repam.2021.6>

Copyright license

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International license (CC BY 4.0).

ABSTRACT

In Ottoman Empire, reform movements that started in the Tanzimat [Reorganization] period gained momentum in the 2nd Meşrutiyet [Constitutional Monarchy] Era and its aftermath. Education, which is a structure that cannot be isolated from the society and related educational institutions, also underwent change and transformation as a result of the reform movements. Tedrisat-ı İbtidaiye Kanun-ı Muvakkati [Primary Education Transitional Law] brought along a series of innovations in education. During this period, an educational approach based on Usul-i Cedid [New Method] was adopted, and thus, education became free and compulsory while education was divided into 3 levels, the duration of which was 6 years. This research was carried out to analyse how the Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiyye [Conversations on Morality] course was reflected in the 1913 Ottoman curriculum, and to determine what objectives, themes and values were aimed to be taught to students monthly and weekly during the first, second and third educational periods [Devre-i Üla, Devre-i Mutasavvita, Devre-i Aliye respectively] within the scope of this course. In this study designed in qualitative research design, historical research method was preferred. The data of the research were obtained by document analysis technique and literature review. The obtained findings were organized in such a form to serve the purpose of the study and analyzed by content analysis method.

KEYWORDS

Citizenship education; Ottoman Empire; Turkey; 1913 Primary Education Curriculum; historical research.

INTRODUCTION

Education basically plays a fundamental role in understanding the past of societies and establishing their futures, in addition to being the most important instrument for states to train and transform individuals (Mentiş Taş, 2004). States wish to create a qualified manpower resource through education and to build a community of citizens around a common ideal. While doing this in line with their own human resources and needs, they also determine their educational philosophies and contents (Şahin & Kartal, 2013).

Education is a significant method used to transform the physical, intellectual, mental and emotional structure of individuals into the most appropriate one. In other words, societies organize their educational curricula in order to raise the kind of people they want (Akyüz, 2011; Chuang & Ting, 2021; Hirshfield & Chachra, 2019; Ring-Whalen et al., 2018; Thurlings et al., 2019). One of the most crucial pillars of educational curricula is educational programs. Educational programs are an important tool to organize the desired behaviors that are planned to be acquired by the person receiving the information inside or outside the school (Evans & Kilinc, 2013; Hazar et al, 2021; Paek et al, 2021; Paul, 2021; Satvinder Singh et al, 2021; Şişman, 2011).

The 19th century has been accepted as the beginning of the treatment of education as a public service in the Ottoman Empire, as in many modernizing states. European-style education had begun to be seen as a means of progress, economic development, influencing the society and keeping society together. About determining its educational policies in this period, the Ottoman Empire had given priority to ensuring political unity, increasing social welfare and raising loyal people to the state. For this reason, the Ottoman Empire tried to expand the modern schools in order to shape the cultural and moral aspects of its citizens and also tried to push citizens' scientific level closer to Europe (Uyanık, 2006).

In such an atmosphere of discussion brought out by the 1908 Revolution, different opinions emerged on the problems of religion, state and law, and discussions flared up with the increased rush of magazines with the freedom of the press, and it was a common opinion that the way to prevent the collapse of the state was through education policies (Berkes, 1979).

Emrullah Efendi, who was one of the pioneers of the reformist education policies in this period, started to work as the Minister of Education for the first time in 1909 (Sakaoğlu, 1985). According to the "Theory of Heaven Tree" coined by Emrullah Efendi, inspired by the mythological Tree of Heaven, whose roots are above, branches and fruits below, innovation and regulation in education should start from the university, not from primary education. According to Emrullah Efendi first of all, higher science centers must primarily be active. For this reason, seven-grade high schools should have been established in order to replace the existing usual high schools, and the university should have been set to the most advanced level. As the number of those who were educated there increases, the people would also be enlightened (Akyüz, 2011; Sakaoğlu, 1985).

In this period, *Tedrisat-ı İptidaiye Kanun Muvakkati* [Primary Education Provisional Law], which is the most important roadmap of education policies, came into force and eliminated many problems in education, especially the financing problem. Again, the primary education curriculum, which will appear for the first time as a draft program in 1911, took its final form in 1913 and became the first general primary education curriculum that came into force throughout the country. With this educational program, primary education was divided into three parts as *Devre-i Üla* [First Grade], *Devre-i Mutevasıta* [Middle Grade] and *Devre-i Aliye* [High Grade], each of which was 2 years, and was extended to 6 years (2+2+2) in total. Also in this period, secondary schools were included in primary education within the scope of education policies, some attempts were done for the education of girls and French became the language of education (Hayta ve Ünal 2003).

Emrullah Efendi, who was under the influence of the French education system, aimed to draw a teaching policy that would instill happiness to the nation by adding courses such as religious knowledge, geography, country history, *Musahabat-ı Ahlakiyye ve Malumat-ı Vataniye* [Conversations on Morality, and Civic Knowledge] to the primary education program (Sakaoğlu, 1985, 1993). The sole purpose of the education policies in the last period of the Ottoman Empire was to create a common sense of loyalty through education. In order to build a new form of citizenship with curricula and school lessons, the civics lesson began to take place as an independent course in the curriculum in this period.

The Ottoman State gave importance to education in its last period and realized the importance of creating a common sense of belonging through education. A citizenship education course began to take place in the curriculum as an independent course in this period in order to create a new sense of citizenship with curricula and school programs. There was no class distinction like the caste system in the Ottoman Empire. However, the society was evaluated as Muslim and non-Muslim, and religion became the most important determinant of citizenship. In other words, citizenship gained meaning in the Ottoman country with a religious difference rather than a class difference (Anık, 2012). On the other hand, the Ottoman state was a country where the rules of Islamic and customary law were applied. Therefore, although the people were not under a constitutional guarantee, some of their rights were preserved within the scope of the laws applied in the Ottoman country (Pamuk, 2005).

In the Ottoman country, the concept of citizenship based on rights in the modern sense began to emerge in the last period of the state when the state was on the verge of collapse. This situation is not only dependent on internal developments, but also shaped in parallel with the development of human rights in the world.

The Ottoman Empire aimed to keep the non-Muslim subjects within the body of the state with some regulations in the periods when it implemented this understanding of citizenship based on rights. One of the arrangements made for this purpose was the abolition of the confiscation procedure, which dealt a great blow to private property. With the confiscation method, the property of the people in the Ottoman country could be confiscated. This was a

violation of an important citizenship right. During the reign of Mahmut II, this practice was abolished and it was aimed to prevent foreign merchants from leaving the Ottoman country (Akyılmaz, 2008). In the following years, it was desired to establish an Ottoman citizenship with the *Tanzimat* [Reorganization] (1839) and *Islahat* [Reform] (1856) Edicts. The concept of 'everyone' used at the beginning of the articles, especially in the *Tanzimat* Edict, is an effort to keep all Ottoman subjects together. With the *Tanzimat* Edict, the Sultan accepted the power of law, except for his own power, and this edict was accepted as the first stage of the transition to constitutionalism. Therefore, it is extremely significant in terms of the evolution of the Ottoman state from a subject to a citizen; because, the development of citizenship shows parallelism with democratization movements (Aktel, 1998; Kilinc, 2015).

The effect of the idea of Ottomanism could be seen in the *Tanzimat* Edict. Within the framework of the idea of Ottomanism, an attempt was made to create an Ottoman upper identity without discrimination of religion, language or race (Uçar, 2018). When the rights granted by the *Tanzimat* could not prevent the separation of minorities, the Ottoman state published the *Islahat* (Reform) Edict and tried to keep the minorities under its rule by giving some new rights to the minorities. With the *Islahat* Edict, it was tried to bring equal rights to Muslims and non-Muslims. After these edicts were published, they received reactions from the Muslim community. The Muslim people reacted to these edicts by saying that "we cannot even call the *gavur* [infidel] as *gavur*" (Gümüş, 2008).

Despite the *Tanzimat* and *Islahat* Edicts, the Ottoman Empire had lost the majority of its non-Muslim subjects at the end of the 19th century. On the other hand, the consulates opened by the Russians in the regions they did not lose were giving the state a significant headache. Again, a nationality problem arose due to the developments in this period. Those who took the passports of foreign states could easily travel in the Ottoman country and benefit from the privileges granted to foreigners (Temizer, 2013). The Ottoman state had enacted the 1869 Nationality Law to solve this problem. Another important feature of this law is that it is the first citizenship law in the Ottoman state. According to this law, which was modeled after the French Penal Code, there were two main ways to be considered an Ottoman citizen. The first was to be of age, and the second was to have resided in the Ottoman country for five years. In short, this law broke the Ottoman affiliation from a religious bond (Serbestoğlu, 2011).

When the published edicts and laws could not prevent the disintegration of the Ottoman Empire, *Kanun-i Esasi* [the First Ottoman Constitution] was put into effect in 1876, and the rights of the people were guaranteed by the *Kanun-i Esasi* for the first time. For the first time, the constitutional government was accepted and the people became part of the government, albeit partially (Birecikli, 2008). Intellectuals, called the *Yeni Osmanlılar* [New Ottomans], played the biggest role in this development. Because, parallel to the developments in Europe, these Intellectuals demanded some modern political rights such as the freedom to vote, be elected and freedom of expression in the Ottoman country (Akşin, 1980). However, this process of innovation and evolution from subjects to citizens, which was interrupted by Sultan Abdulhamid

II's suspension of the *Kanun-i Esasi* in 1878, and after a period of nearly thirty years, with the activities of the *Jön Türkler* [Young Turks] and the members of the Committee of Union and Progress, the second entry into force of the *Kanun-i Esasi* in 1908 and the proclamation of the Constitutional administration started again, and the Ottoman country turned into a community of citizens whose rights are guaranteed by the *Kanun-i Esasi* (Türkkan, 2018).

Having restored *Meşrutiyet* [Constitutional Monarchy] in 1908, then suppressing the 31 March Revolt (April 13, 1909), which first emerged against the new regime, and then dethroning Abdulhamid II and putting the *Kanun-i Esasi* into effect, in addition to having difficulties from time to time against the opposition, the Unionists eventually dominated the government alone with the *Babiali* Raid on January 23, 1913. It is no coincidence that the 1913 curriculum was put into effect in the same year, in parallel with this development. In other words, in this way, in order to establish a new understanding in many fields, especially to create a new identity, education was also used. Thus, when this new program is examined, it is understood that an important mission has been assigned to the program, and it is aimed to raise moral, conscious, respectful citizens of national values and obedient to the sultan and statesmen (Maarif Vekaleti, 1913).

The 1913 Ottoman Curriculum is important in that it is the first general-comprehensive program in Turkish history of education. In addition, citizenship education, which was tried to be given together with history and geography courses until the last periods of the Selçuk and Ottoman Empires, was included in this program for the first time as an independent course (Üstel, 2016). Therefore, this program has a special importance with its contribution to the evolution of the society from the subjects to the citizens in the process from the Ottoman Empire to the Republic (Kaya, 2020). Therefore, in this study, the content of the *Musahhabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* [Conversations on Morality and Civics] course in the 1913 curriculum in the transition process from a subject to a citizen in the Ottoman state and its effect on citizenship are discussed.

METHOD

Research Model

In this study, historical research method, one of the qualitative research designs, was used (Büyüköztürk et al., 2017). The historical research method is used to examine events and phenomena that have occurred in the past, or to investigate and analyze the relationship of a particular problem with the past or present. This research method allows to examine the combinations of social factors that cause social change by leading to a certain result and to create theory by reaching general conceptualizations (Kaptan, 1991). The data of this research, in which the historical research method was employed, were obtained by using the document analysis technique. Document analysis is a technique in which all kinds of written materials containing information about the subject studied are examined and analyzed. These written

materials that make up the documents can be various such as diaries, letters, official documents of the states (Balçı, 2006; Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2016).

Data Collection

The data were obtained by the document analysis technique in this study employing the historical research method. Document review has advantages in terms of quality, low cost, sample size, long-term analysis, lack of reactivity, individuality and originality (Balçı, 2006; Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2016). Relevant data were obtained from the Ministry of National Education Ferit Ragıp Tuncor archive and documentation library. The obtained data were first transcribed from Ottoman Turkish to modern Turkish, and after the transcription process was done, it was checked by those who are experts in Ottoman Turkish. After the control of the translations was ensured, the data were classified into related subjects and themes.

Data Analysis

In this study, the findings obtained by the document analysis technique were analyzed by the content analysis method. In content analysis, it is tried to reach the concepts and relations that can explain the obtained data. The themes belonging to the concepts are determined after the conceptualization of the data. Content analysis consists of four stages: coding the data, finding the themes, organizing the codes and themes, defining and interpreting the findings (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2016). In this direction, in this study, the data of the 1913 curriculum was translated from Ottoman Turkish to modern Turkish and understood. The findings obtained after the translation process were coded according to the objectives thought to belong. Then, the themes belonged the coded data were determined. These codes are grouped under five main themes: national and spiritual consciousness, moral values, rights and responsibilities, environmental and health awareness, government and state bodies. At the last stage, the coding and contents under the themes were given in the tables, discussed and interpreted.

FINDINGS

This section gives the findings related to the research. Research findings were divided into themes by content analysis method. These themes are national and spiritual consciousness, moral values, rights and responsibilities, environmental and health awareness, government and state bodies.

Table 1 shows the objectives, themes and values that are aimed to be taught weekly and monthly according to grade levels in the *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* [Conversations on Morality] course taught in the 1913 curriculum of the Ottoman primary education.

With the 1913 curriculum, primary education was extended to six years in total by dividing it into three levels, each of which consists of 2 years. These levels are *Devre-i Üla*, *Devre-i Mutevasıta* and *Devre-i Aliye*. *Devre-i Üla* covers the age range of 7-8 and the first and second grades, which are the first two years of primary education. *Devre-i Mutavassıta* covers the age

range of 9-10 and the middle level of primary education; that is, the third and fourth grades. *Devre-i Âliye* covers the age range of 11-12 and the fifth and sixth grades, which are the last level of primary education.

Table 1. Objectives, Themes and Values of *Devre-i Üla* [First level of the primary school] 1st and 2nd Grades in the 1913 Curriculum of *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* [Conversations on Morality] Course

Period	Month	Week	Objective	Theme	Code
1st Grade of Devre- i Üla	1	1	Loving Mother and Father.	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Family
	1	1	Loving brothers and fellow countrymen	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Family
	1	2	We must obey our sultan and our elders	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Obedience to the Sultan, obedience to the Elders
	1	2	We must respect our elderly relatives	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Respect for Elders
	1	3	We should not fight with our friends	Moral Values	Human Relations
	1	3	We should not slander others.	Moral Values	Honesty
	1	4	We should not play with naughty children	Moral Values	Human Relations
	1	4	We should avoid dangerous games.	Environmental and Health Awareness	Health
	2	1	Attention to duty	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
	2	2	Nobody likes lazy kids	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
	2	2	Working is a definition	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
	2	3	Employee wins	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
	2	3	Your friends should not touch their notebooks and pens	Rights and Responsibilities	Respect for Property
	2	4	Diligent boy	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
	2	4	Laziness	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
	3	1	Do not leave today's work for tomorrow	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence

3	1	Should help the needy	Moral Values	Benevolence
3	2	Do not eat much	Environmental and Health Awareness	Health
3	2	Do not drink water while sweaty	Environmental and Health Awareness	Health
3	3	To be honest	Moral Values	Honesty
3	3	Do not touch someone else's property	Rights and Responsibilities	Respect for Property
3	4	Revision	Revision	Revision
4	1	People need each other	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Solidarity
4	1	Returning something found on the way to its owner	Rights and Responsibilities	Respect for Property
4	2	Should help the poor	Moral Values	Benevolence
4.	2	Not be arrogant	Moral Values	Humility
4	2	Not to waste	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness
4	3	Not to speak ill of others	Moral Values	Do not Gossip
4	3	Not hold grudges	Moral Values	Compassion
4	3	Revenge	Moral Values	Compassion
4	4	Not to harm flowers and trees	Environmental and Health Awareness	Doğayı Koruma
4	4	Not harming animals or birds	Environmental and Health Awareness	Love of Animals
4	4	We should help each other	Moral Values	Benevolence
5	1	Do not misbehave	Moral Values	Human Relations
5	1	We should love animals, birds	Environmental and Health Awareness	Love of Animals
5	1	We should love flowers, trees	Environmental and Health Awareness	Nature Conservation
5	2	Get fresh air	Environmental and Health Awareness	Health
5	2	We must love our country	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism

	5	3	We must protect the flag, the ancestors and the relics of our ancestors	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Commitment to National and Cultural Values
	5	3	We must abide by our traditions	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Commitment to National and Cultural Values
	5	4	We should be happy with what we have	Moral Values	Not being Greedy
	5	4	Treason and truth	Moral Values	Honesty
	6	1	Lying	Moral Values	Honesty
	6	1	Economics and Trade	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness
	6	2	Jealousy	Moral Values	Jealousy
	6	2	Alcoholic and no smoking	Environmental and Health Awareness	Health
	6	3	Be ashamed	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Religious Consciousness
	6	3	It is hard but it is not too late	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
	6	4	Revision	Revision	Revision
	7	1	Some legends and blacksmith's advice	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
	7	2	Ant and Cicada - Two Travelers - Spider and Silkworm	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
	7	3	Sparrow with Rabbit	Fables	Fables
	7	4	Goat and Fox- Lamb and Wolf- Fox and Stork	Fables	Fables
	8	1	The Frog and the Firefly - The Crow and the Fox	Fables	Fables
	8	2	Two goats, Fisherman, Rabbit and Tortoise	Fables	Fables
	8	3	Some historical anecdotes	Fables	Fables
	8	4	Biography of country elders and children	National and Spiritual Consciousness	National Heroes
	9	1	General Revision	General Revision	General Revision
2nd Grade of Devre-i Üla	1	1	Family benefits	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Family
	1	2	The downsides of orphanhood	Moral Values	Benevolence

1	3	Respect for elders and love for younger	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Family
1	4	Love everyone	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Solidarity
2	1	The good and the bad of the nanny and the maids - responsibilities to them	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Family
2	2	Obedience and love to our sultan and elders	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Obedience to the Sultan, obedience to the Elders
2	3	Importance of health	Environmental and Health Awareness	Health
2	4	Activity	Fables	Fables
3	1	The importance of science	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
3	2	School	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
3	3	Study for lessons	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
3	4	Revision	Revision	Revision
4	1	Duty responsibility	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
4	2	Love and help to friends	Moral Values	Tolerance
4	3	Homeland and foreign countries	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism
4	4	Homeland benefits	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism
5	1	Respect for the flag	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism
5	2	Heirlooms: mosques, madrasas, fountains, tombs, bridges, soup kitchens, caravanserais, schools, roads	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Commitment to National and Cultural Values
5	3	Respect for our home, our field and our couple animal	Environmental and Health Awareness	Natural Conversation
5	4	Love and sacrifice for the country	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism
6	1	The importance of military service	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty

6	2	Tax	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness
6	3	Obedience to the law	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
6	4	Revision	Revision	Revision
7	1	Kindness and fineness	Moral Values	Tolerance
7	2	Waste and savings	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness
7	2	Lying	Moral Values	Honesty
7	3	Truth	Moral Values	Honesty
7	4	Respect for the dignity of another - not seeing other people's faults	Rights and Responsibilities	Respect for Human Rights
8	1	Courage and anger	Moral Values	To be Brave
8	2	Service of animals to humans- not to torture animals	Environmental and Health Awareness	Love of Animals
8	3	Good and evil	Moral Values	Beneficence
8	4	Peace of mind - remorse	Moral Values	Conscientious Responsibility

As can be seen in Table 1, the first two-year period (*Devre-i Üîâ*) of the program in the form of 2+2+2 years is for the 7-8 age group. In addition, it is seen that the program is planned over nine months and the topics that will be covered weekly are specified. In the program, the hours of the relevant course are planned as three hours a week in the first year and two hours in the second year of *Devre-i Üîâ*.

Table 2. Objectives, Themes and Values of *Devre-i Mutevasita* 1st and 2nd Grades in the 1913 Curriculum of *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* [Conversations on Morality] Course

Period	Month	Week	Objective	Theme	Code
	9	4	General Revision	General Revision	General Revision
1st Grade of Devre-i Mutevasita	1	1	Religious duties	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Religious Consciousness
	1	2	Health and cleanliness	Environmental and Health Awareness	Health
	1	3	Simple dressing	Environmental and Health Awareness	Personal Care
	1	3	Healthy eating	Environmental and Health Awareness	Health
	1	4	Simplicity	Environmental and Health Awareness	Personal Care

1	4	Training	Environmental and Health Awareness	Health
2	1	Saving – not to borrow	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness
2	2	Jealousy	Moral Values	Jealousy
2	2	Greed	Moral Values	Not being Greedy
2	3	Diligence	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
2	3	Sincerity	Moral Values	Human Relations
2	4	Truth	Moral Values	Honesty
3	1	Fix flaws	Moral Values	Self-Criticism
3	1	Pride	Moral Values	Humility
3	2	Be brave and calm	Moral Values	Self-Confidence
3	3	Anger and patience	Moral Values	Tolerance
3	4	Revision	Revision	Revision
4	1	Entrepreneurship	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness
4	2	Confidence	Moral Values	Self-Confidence
4	2	Living regularly	Environmental and Health Awareness	Personal Care
4	3	Do one's duty properly	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
4	3	Health	Environmental and Health Awareness	Health
4	4	Freedom	Rights and Responsibilities	Freedom
5	1	Family happiness	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Family
5	2	The love of the elders for the little ones - respect of the younger for the elders	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Family
5	3	Consider the family's interests	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Family
5	4	Love the country	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism
6	1	To tax	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness

6	2	Sanctity of the military	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty	
6	3	Farmer, blacksmith, sailor, etc. respect and love for the arts	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Respect for the Connoisseur of the Arts	
6	4	Revision	Revision	Revision	
7	1	People's responsibilities	Rights and Responsibilities	Respect for Human Rights	
7	1	Aid and solidarity	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Respect for Human Rights	
7	2	Respect for people's property, life, honor, freedom and religion	Rights and Responsibilities	Respect for Human Rights	
7	3	Insult, slander, humiliation, mocking and stealing are bad	Moral Values	Honesty	
7	4	Being faithful to contracts and promises	Moral Values	Honesty	
8	1	Compassion and help towards people	Moral Values	Benevolence	
8	1	Be merciful to the poor, the needy, the sick, and the survivors	Moral Values	Compassion	
8	2	Sacrifice	Moral Values	Devotion	
8	2	Abide by etiquette	Moral Values	Human Relations	
8	3	Be kind to animals	Environmental and Health Awareness	Love of Animals	
8	4	Loving and protecting livestock	Environmental and Health Awareness	Love of Animals	
9	4	General Revision	General Revision	General Revision	
2nd Grade of Devre-i Mutevasita	1	1	Information about homeland and civilization	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism
	1	2	Government services: courts, gendarmes, soldiers, schools, roads, municipalities	Rights and Responsibilities	Awareness of Citizenship Rights
	1	3	Government expenses – Taxes	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness
	1	4	Taxes are debt – someone who does not pay their taxes is like someone who understates their debt	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness

2	1	Roads are everyone's property. Roads should not be damaged	Rights and Responsibilities	Awareness of Citizenship Rights
2	2	Not harming the forests	Environmental and Health Awareness	Nature Conservation
2	3	Not to disturb roads, streams, fountains	Environmental and Health Awareness	Nature Conservation
2	4	Respect for common areas	Rights and Responsibilities	Respect for Property
3	1	Laws	Government and State Bodies	Laws
3	2	Law makers	Government and State Bodies	Laws
3	3	Deputies and notables	Government and State Bodies	Election
3	4	Election, participation in the election is a duty	Government and State Bodies	Election
4	1	Revision	Revision	Revision
4	2	Types of government	Government and State Bodies	Government
4	3	View of government	Government and State Bodies	Government
4	4	Benefit of constitutionalism	Government and State Bodies	Form of Government
5	1	Obedience to the law	Government and State Bodies	Laws
5	2	Obedience to the police, gendarmerie, village guards and all officers	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Loyalty to the State
5	3	Witnessing is a duty	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
5	4	Not helping thieves, murderers and murderers	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Loyalty to the State
6	1	How does the government deliver justice?	Government and State Bodies	Laws

6	2	How to make a complaint?	Government and State Bodies	Laws
6	3	Magistrates' courts, Civil and criminal courts	Government and State Bodies	Courts
6	4	Revision	Revision	Revision
7	1	Imprisonment and fine	Government and State Bodies	Laws
7	2	Courts of first instance, appeal and appeal	Government and State Bodies	Courts
7	3	Municipalities – obedience to the rules of municipalities	Government and State Bodies	Belediye
7	4	Cleaning with the municipality	Moral Values	Benevolence
8	1	Use of parks and gardens	Environmental and Health Awareness	Doğayı Koruma
8	2	Military service and honor	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
8	3	Ottoman country - service to the country - respect for the flag	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism
8	4	Devotion to the country	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism

As can be seen in Table 2, *Devre-i Mutevasita* (the second two-year period of primary school) of the program in the form of 2+2+2 years is for the 9-10 age group. In addition, it is seen that the program is planned over nine months and what topics will be covered weekly are specified. It is seen in the program that the hours of the relevant course are planned as one hour per week.

Table 3. Objectives, Themes and Values of *Devre-i Aliye* 1st and 2nd Grades in the 1913 Curriculum of *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* [Conversations on Morality] Course

Period	Month	Week	Objective	Theme	Code
	9	4	General Revision	General Revision	General Revision
1st Grade of Devre-i Aliye	1	1	A clear conscience- remorse	Moral Values	Conscientious Responsibility
	1	2	Task - job description	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty

1	3	Duties to family, self, civilization, religion, humanity	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
1	4	Our duties to ourselves	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
1	4	Health	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
2	1	Good manners	Moral Values	Self-Regulation
2	2	Learn science	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
2	3	Patience and common sense	Moral Values	Patience
2	4	Bravery	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism
3	1	Take care of your own body	Environmental and Health Awareness	Personal Care
3	2	Humility and dignity	Moral Values	Humbleness
3	3	Arrogance and pride	Moral Values	Humbleness
3	4	Revision	Revision	Revision
4	1	Diligence	Rights and Responsibilities	Diligence
4	2	Savings - economics	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness
4	3	Generosity - Avoiding debt	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness
4	4	Entrepreneurship	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness
5	1	Working not to be a burden to the country	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness
5	2	Children's duties to the family - the family's duties to the children	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Family
5	3	Duties of family members towards each other	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Family
5	4	The importance of marriage	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Family
6	1	Duties to civilization and homeland - obedience to the law	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
6	2	Military - Police	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
6	2	Honor the flag	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism

	6	3	Devotion to the country	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism
	6	3	Right to vote	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
	6	4	Revision	Revision	Revision
	7	1	Duties to humanity	Rights and Responsibilities	Respect for Human Rights
	7	2	Belittlement, humiliation, disparagement	Moral Values	Honesty
	7	3	Respect for another's religion and sect	Rights and Responsibilities	Respect for Human Rights
	7	4	Not to interfere with another's property	Rights and Responsibilities	Respect for Property
	8	1	Obedience to words and contracts	Moral Values	Honesty
	8	2	Be kind to people	Moral Values	Compassion
	8	2	Helpfulness	Moral Values	Benevolence
	8	3	Kindness towards Muslims and non-Muslims	Rights and Responsibilities	Respect for Human Rights
	8	4.	Our religious duties	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Religious Consciousness
	9	4	General Revision	General Revision	General Revision
2nd Grade of Devre-i Aliye					
	1	1	Government and the need for government	Government and State Bodies	Government
	1	2	Government and the need for government	Government and State Bodies	Government
	1	3	Government tasks: Security and justice, defense	Government and State Bodies	Form of Government
	1	4	Functioning of government	Government and State Bodies	Form of Government
	2	1	Constitutionalism	Government and State Bodies	Form of Government
	2	2	Benefits of Constitutionalism	Government and State Bodies	Form of Government
	2	3	Defenders of Constitutionalism	Government and State Bodies	Form of Government

2	4	Civil rights - Freedom - Freedom to write	Rights and Responsibilities	Awareness of Citizenship Rights
3	1	Civil rights - Social rights - Right to work	Rights and Responsibilities	Awareness of Citizenship Rights
3	2	Civic duties; aid and solidarity	Rights and Responsibilities	Solidarity
3	3	Love the homeland - respect the flag	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Patriotism
3	4	Revision	Revision	Revision
4	1	Respect for religious and national institutions	National and Spiritual Consciousness	Commitment to National and Cultural Values
4	2	Respect for headquarters, school and military service	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
4	3	Tax	Rights and Responsibilities	Economic Consciousness
4	4	Kanun-i Esasi (the first Ottoman constitution)	Government and State Bodies	Laws
5	1	Legislature, Executive and Judiciary	Government and State Bodies	Laws
5	2	knowledge of the legislature, executive and judiciary	Government and State Bodies	Laws
5	3	Country resistance - election - parliamentary election	Government and State Bodies	Election
5	3	How laws are made	Government and State Bodies	Laws
5	4	Parliament of the people and Ayan (privileged person)	Government and State Bodies	Council
6	1	Government organization; Village, Town, County, Province	Government and State Bodies	Local Governments
6	2	Government offices	Government and State Bodies	Local Governments
6	3	Municipality - duties of the Municipality	Government and State Bodies	Municipality

6	3	Municipality election	Government and State Bodies	Election
6	4	Duties of the people towards the municipality	Government and State Bodies	Municipality
7	1	Revision	Revision	Revision
7	2	Courts	Government and State Bodies	Courts
7	3	Complaints and inquiries	Government and State Bodies	Courts
7	4	Types of Courts	Government and State Bodies	Courts
8	1.	Law Courts	Government and State Bodies	Courts
8	2	Obligation to go to court	Government and State Bodies	Courts
8	3	Police, Gendarmes, Village guards, the importance of duty	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
8	4	Headmen, Imams, Teachers, the importance of duty	Rights and Responsibilities	Sense of Duty
9	4	General Revision	General Revision	General Revision

As can be seen in Table 3, *Devre-i Aliye* (the last two-year period) of the program in the form of 2+2+2 years is for the 11-12 age group. In addition, it is seen that the program is planned over nine months and what topics will be covered weekly are specified. It is seen in the program that the hours of the relevant course are planned as one hour per week.

When Tables 1, 2 and 3 are examined, it is seen that unit revisions and general revisions are also included at certain intervals in the program. Accordingly, for *Devre-i Ülâ* first and second grades, and *Devre-i Mutavassıta* and *Devre-i Aliye* first grades, unit revisions were set in the fourth week of the third month, the last week of the sixth month, and the ninth month. The first week of the fourth month and the last week of the sixth month in the second year of the *Devre-i Mutavassıta* level; the fourth week of the third month, the first week of the seventh month, and the ninth month are reserved for general revision in the second class of the *Devre-i Aliye* level. Although the teaching of values through inculcation is dominant in the program in general, especially in the first year of *Devre-i Ülâ*, it was enriched with fables such as "Ant and Cicada", "Two Travelers", "Spider and Silkworm", "Rabbit and Sparrow", "Goat and Fox", "Lamb and Wolf", "Fox and Stork", "Frog and Firefly", "Crow and Fox", "Two Goats", and "Rabbit and

Tortoise”. The spread of these fables over a two-month period shows that this method is considered important in the education of children of this age.

Table 4. Themes and codes in the 1913 Curriculum of *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye* [Conversations on Morality and Civics]

Themes	<i>f</i>
Government and State Bodies	37
Moral Values	49
Environmental and Health Awareness	25
Rights and Responsibilities	78
National and Spiritual Consciousness	42
Total	231

Table 4 displays that rights and responsibilities in the citizenship education course are discussed intensively with 78 times. The theme of moral values was the second most discussed topic with 49 times. The theme of national and spiritual consciousness was discussed 42 times, and the theme of government and state bodies 37 times. The least mentioned theme in the course was the theme of environmental and health awareness with 25 sub-codes.

Some of the values that are aimed to be taught to students in the *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* [Conversations on Morality] curriculum are the theme of “government and state bodies” and are shown in Table 5 with their codes.

Table 5. Codes and Statistics of Government and State Bodies Theme

Codes	<i>f</i>
Municipality	3
Government	4
Laws	10
Courts	7
Council	1
Election	4
Local Governments	2
Form of Government	6
Total	37

When Table 5 is examined, it is seen that the theme of laws is the most coded subject with 10 times. The other topics covered most in the program were courts 7 times, form of government 6 times, and election 4 times. In addition, the municipality included in the program 3 times, the council 1, and local governments 2 times. The reason why the concepts of law, government, court and election were intensively covered in the 1913 curriculum stems from the desire to establish a new order and citizenship bond; because, in this period, both Meşrutiyet was accepted and the *Kanun-i Esasi* was put into effect. Therefore, it is important to teach these

new and foreign concepts. Again, by trying to eliminate injustices with the regulations in the courts, it is aimed to keep the society together in peace and tranquility, and to keep Muslim and non-Muslim subjects together. Since the Ottoman Empire wished to create a law-abiding citizen community from an early age, this subject was heavily covered in the program. The enactment of the *Kanun-i Esasi* and the securing of the rights of the people with this *Kanun-i Esasi* revealed the importance of obedience to the law. The reason why administration and state organs are included in the program is undoubtedly due to the transition to a new regime, the Constitutional Monarchy. In this framework, the program included subjects such as the sultan and the duties and powers of new institutions such as the *Meclis-i Ayan* [Senate] and the *Meclis-i Mebusan* [Assembly of Representatives], how the elections would be held, various courts, administrative structures and officials.

Some of the values that are aimed to be taught to students in the *Musahabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* curriculum are shown in Table 6 with the theme of “environmental and health awareness”.

Table 6. Codes and Statistics of Environmental and Health Awareness Theme

Codes	<i>f</i>
Nature Conservation	6
Love of Animals	5
Personal Care	4
Health	10
Total	25

As can be seen in Table 6, the subject of health is mostly covered with 10 times in the theme of Environmental and Health Awareness. Since the Ottomans planned to raise a model citizen in this period, issues related to environmental and health awareness were also included in the program. Personal care is also included in the health theme; and the other issues included in this context were those such as not gluttony, that is, healthy eating, good and clean clothing, attention to body and house cleanliness, not drinking water when sweaty, avoiding harmful habits such as alcohol and cigarettes, breathing fresh air. Although individual and public health and environmental cleanliness and order are among the issues that should be given importance for every nation, the conditions of the current period should probably have an effect on including them in the program. As a matter of fact, the food and shelter problems experienced with the large masses of immigrants from the places lost in the Balkan Wars increased epidemics such as cholera, malaria, typhoid and plague, and caused the issue of health and the environment to gain even more importance. On the other hand, it is known that laws and regulations were made in parallel with the program in many health-related issues such as cholera epidemics caused by the bursting sewers due to the lack of infrastructure, the smell of barns intertwined with living spaces, and rabies caused by stray dogs, the dirt of horse carriages

and donkey trains scattered on the roads, the cleaning of the streets, the garbage and rubble thrown around, the unhealthy and open food sold on the streets.

One of the issues that Ottoman administrators focused on was the protection of the environment and surrounding structures. In particular, the importance of protecting roads, bridges and fountains was tried to be taught to children. It is seen that the love of animals is also covered 5 times in the program. It could be thought that the state tried to teach to protect and love animals from an early age, due to the fact that the main livelihoods of the Ottoman society were agriculture and animal husbandry, and with the influence of beliefs and values that can be expressed as “love the creature because of the creator” and “who does not show mercy to animals, he shall not show mercy to people”. At the same time, the use of some animals in transportation and field works and the behaviors towards them were discussed in detail in the program, and these issues were included in the program under the headings of refraining from cruelty to farm animals and other animals. In fact, it is also known that a legal regulation has been made in order not to torture the riding animals by loading more than they can carry. In the program, environmental issues such as keeping the parks and gardens clean, not plucking the flowers, not damaging the trees and forests were also emphasized. These issues aim not only to protect the environment, but also to teach respect for the rights of others, as these places are open to public use. To sum up, it is aimed to create an awareness of health and the environment in children and to make these issues a habit from an early age.

Some of the values that are aimed to be taught to students in the *Musahabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* [Conversations on Morality] curriculum are shown in Table 7 with the theme of “moral values”.

Table 7. Codes and Statistics of Moral Values Theme

Codes	f
Not being Greedy	2
Humility	2
To be Brave	1
Do not Gossip	1
Honesty	11
Devotion	1
Tolerance	3
Human Relations	5
Beneficence	1
Jealousy	2
Compassion	4
Self-regulation	1
Self-confidence	2
Self-criticism	1
Patience	1
Humbleness	2
Conscientious Responsibility	2
Benevolence	7
Total	49

According to Table 7, the most discussed subject with 11 times was the concept of honesty. The Ottoman state was an Islamic state. Therefore, the concept of truth, which is one of the important requirements of the religion of Islam, has been given a high priority. In addition, since concepts such as truthfulness, honesty and not lying have an important place in Turkish customs, they have been emphasized in the program. The fact that these concepts are among the main features sought in human relations made it necessary to focus on them. Some other concepts covered in the program are benevolence 7 times, compassion 4 times and tolerance 3 times. The main reason why the topics of benevolence and compassion are included in the program is again based on beliefs and traditions, but in recent times, many people have been lost in wars, their children have been left orphaned and the society has taken care of them. It is also possible to evaluate the establishment of orphanages established for the shelter of orphans and some other charitable institutions within the framework of this goal. On the other hand, the concepts of tolerance and respect for different religions were also included in the program in order to ensure the coexistence of different ethnic and religious identities and to keep the Ottoman state together. Although a policy of tolerance towards non-Muslim people has been implemented since the establishment of the Ottoman state, the aim in the following periods was to strengthen the sense of citizenship and to prevent nationalist rebellions, as mentioned above. This aim is also reflected in the program under the title of tolerance.

Some of the values that are aimed to be taught to students in the *Musahabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* [Conversations on Morality] curriculum are shown in Table 8 with the theme of “national and spiritual consciousness”.

Table 8. Codes and Statistics of National and Spiritual Consciousness Theme

Codes	<i>f</i>
Family	11
Respect for Elders	1
Solidarity	4
Loyalty to the State	2
Religious Consciousness	3
Commitment to National and Cultural Values	4
National Heroes	1
Obedience to the Sultan, Obedience to the Elders	2
Respect for the Connoisseur of the Arts	1
Patriotism	13
Total	42

As can be seen in Table 8, patriotism is the most discussed topic in the program with 13 times. In other words, it was aimed to keep the subjects together by creating unity and solidarity within the framework of the concept of homeland in order to eliminate the negative effects of the intense land losses experienced before the 1913 curriculum on the society and to prevent the separatist ideas brought by the French Revolution. Another important topic covered in the program is the concept of family with 11 times. Since the Ottomans had a traditional family structure, in addition to the nuclear family members such as mother, father, sister, grandfather, grandmother, individuals such as *Lala* [educator and trainer of a child], nanny and maid were counted as family and the behavior of children towards them was discussed in the program. Other topics covered most under this theme were solidarity, commitment to national and cultural values, 4 times each. The feelings of solidarity and benevolence were added to the program in order to strengthen national unity and solidarity and to prevent the collapse of the state. The development of Turkish identity and Turkism thought, which began to be prominently featured towards the end of the Balkan wars, is in parallel with these concepts in the program. It is seen that the sadness of the recently lost lands and the hope of getting them back were also reflected in the textbooks of the period.

The values that are aimed to be taught to students in the *Musâhahabât-ı Ahlakiye* [Conversations on Morality] curriculum are shown in Table 9 with the theme of “rights and responsibilities” and their codes.

Table 9. Codes and Statistics of Rights and Responsibilities Theme

Codes	<i>f</i>
Diligence	15
Economic Consciousness	14
Sense of Duty	18
Legal Consciousness	15
Respect for Human Rights	6
Respect for Property	5
Freedom	1
Awareness of Citizenship Rights	4
Total	78

As can be seen in Table 9, “rights and responsibilities” is the most frequently used theme in the program with 78 codes. The most discussed topic in the program was the sense of duty with 18 times; because, the state wished to raise individuals with a high sense of responsibility from an early age. Other topics that are covered intensively in the program are diligence 15 times and economic consciousness 14 times.

Undoubtedly, the loss of land, the deterioration of the *Timar* [land allocation] system, the migration from the village to the city as a result of the *Celali* revolts [economic and social

revolts in the Ottomans], the capitulations turning the Ottoman country into an open market, developments such as the declaration of the bankruptcy of the state with the *Muharrem* Decree in 1881 and the establishment of the *Düyûn-ı Umûmiyye* [General Debts], caused the state to lose its economic independence over time, and such developments put heavy burdens on the people. Therefore, the development of economic awareness and the promotion of work became a vital issue for the state. The concept of property had been one of the problematic issues in the Ottoman Empire. Since the state is the owner of most of the lands, it did not want anyone who could gain power by acquiring property other than itself. For this reason, it had implemented the confiscation procedure. However, Mahmud II, who wanted to increase the loyalty of foreign merchants who were trying to escape from the recent internal turmoil, abolished the confiscation procedure and allowed private property. On the other hand, since minorities besides Muslims were given the opportunity to acquire property, their rights and laws were always on the agenda in order to keep the subjects together and to increase the loyalty of foreigners to the state. The proclamation of the *Kanun-ı Esasi* also guaranteed these rights. Therefore, teaching these topics and concepts was one of the important priorities of the 1913 curriculum.

DISCUSSION

In the relevant literature, there is no study focused specifically on the civic education curriculum in Ottoman schools. Considering that it is the first regular and systematic citizenship education program in education planning from past to present, it has been determined that there is a gap in the literature related to this civics education of *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* [Conversations on Morality]. It is thought that this study would fill an important gap in the literature by shedding some light on the history of citizenship education in Turkey. In this study, the 1913 *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* course, which emerged in the process of the Turkish society evolving from being a subject to a citizen, was investigated with the method of content analysis.

One of the studies conducted on this topic was done by Budak and Budak (2014) on programs from the Ottoman Empire to the Republic. In this research, the weekly course schedules of the programs from the Ottoman Empire to the Republic were given, but the content of the programs was not mentioned. Yet, in the current study, the content of the 1913 curriculum was discussed in detail with the content analysis method. One of the studies on the 1913 curriculum is the research conducted by Benzer (2004) on mother tongue education programs in Turkey. Benzer researched the place of mother tongue in the 1913 curriculum, included mother tongue features, comparisons and criticisms, but did not make any determinations regarding citizenship education. In the present study, the citizenship education program was examined with the content analysis method.

Keskin's (2010) research on Curriculum from the Second *Meşrutiyet* [the 2nd Constitutional Monarchy, 1908] to the present is one of the important studies. Keskin stated that the aim of the 1913 curriculum, which was published during the Second *Meşrutiyet* period, was to make children comprehend the ideology of the Committee of Union and Progress. In this

study, the weekly course schedule of the 1913 curriculum was given and the topics in the program were dealt with in a superficial way. In the current study, the entire content of *the Musâhabât-ı Ahlakîyye* course in the 1913 curriculum was investigated with the content analysis method. One of the studies in the field of citizenship education is *Citizenship in the Second Meşrutiyet Period*, which belongs to a study by Yaşar (2018). In his study, Yaşar examined a different dimension such as the content of the textbooks in the Second *Meşrutiyet* period, their association with the programs of the period in which they were published, and their references, instead of the perception of citizenship in the textbooks or the reflections of the citizenship perception in the official ideology. In the present study, the 1913 citizenship educational program was discussed as a whole, not the textbooks.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Citizenship education, which has an important place in the Turkish education system, was taught in History and Geography courses until the 1913 curriculum. In the 1913 curriculum, these courses were combined under the names of *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* [Conversations on Morality] and *Malumât-ı Vataniyye* [Civics], and a citizen was tried to be educated within the framework of the Ottoman upper identity in line with the ideology of the period. The course *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiyye* means conversations about ethics, religion, history and civilization in today's Turkish. In this period, the Ottoman Empire tried to create a common citizen identity by focusing on values education in order to avoid the collapse process it was in. In this respect, the aforementioned course and its content are extremely crucial. With the *Malumât-ı Vataniyyes*, the Ottoman Empire aimed to raise both loyal citizens and citizens who were equipped with some national and universal moral values, who were aware of the structure of the state, economy, health and environment.

Citizenship education, which was included in the program under the name of *Musâhabât-ı Ahlakîyye* in 1913-1914, appeared as a course for the first time in the Ottoman country with the *Tedrisât-ı İbtidâiyye Kanûn-ı Muvakkati* [Primary Education Temporary Law]. In 1913, the citizenship education program was written as a single text without including its aims. The aims of the program were given implicitly only in the content part. Although there was no section stating the philosophy of the program, a didactic style seems to be dominant throughout the program. Both the introduction and the content of the program did not mention what methods the course would be taught with. Values and skills in the program were discussed in the content part of the program. It is understood that the program was written with the aim of explaining, giving information, enlightening and learning a moral lesson with its intense text content. In addition, in the program, the units were supported with stories, poems and fables and the topics were tried to be made more concrete. For example, while the topic of work and diligence is being told, the story of the Ant and the Grasshopper has been tried to make the topic more concrete and memorable. In this respect, it is considered positive to include such stories in the program in terms of increasing the memorability of what has been learned.

In the 1913 Ottoman Primary School Curriculum, it was stated which topics at which grade level would be covered by the *Musahhabât-ı Ahlakîyye* course. The topics covered in the first stage of *Devre-i Üla* are composed of basic subjects such as respect for elders, love, honesty, what the family is and its importance, being helpful, love of nature, love of homeland and flag. With these subjects and concepts, it is aimed that the child learns about his family, environment and some national moral values. Fables are given wide coverage. In the second stage of *Devre-i Üla*, it is seen that the topics and concepts that are intended to be taught are handled in a slightly wider framework. It can be deduced that the expanding environmental approach model has been adopted in line with the understanding of the near-far, from the known to the unknown. While in the first grade, nuclear family members such as mother and father were mentioned, in the second grade, these concepts were expanded a little more and other household members such as *Lala* [educator and trainer of a child], nanny and maid were included in the family. In addition to citizen responsibilities such as military service and paying taxes, topics related to the foreign state have been added to the program of the second stage of *Devre-i Üla*.

While the concepts and subjects such as religious knowledge, health, dressing and entrepreneurship were discussed in the first grade level of *Devre-i Mutavassıta*, concepts and topics such as the Ottoman homeland, courts, security forces, government, laws and local administrations were added to the program at the second grade level. In addition, the duties and authorities of the mentioned institutions and organizations, who had the authority to make laws and what the duties of the government were explained. It is noteworthy that the concept of election and, accordingly, the right of the citizen to vote was added to the program in the first grade level of *Devre-i Âliye*. In the second grade level, it is seen that the forms of government (Republic, Constitutional Monarchy and Sultanate) were also included in the program. Other important topics included in the program are freedom of expression, citizenship rights, the *Kanun-ı Esasi*, legislative, executive, judiciary, etc. The reason why these topics were added to the curriculum in this period was the enactment of the *Kanun-ı Esasi* for the second time after a long interruption and the declaration of the Constitutional Monarchy. In other words, this situation is considered as an innovation brought by the Constitutional Monarchy regime.

In the 1913 curriculum, it was seen that citizenship education is value-oriented. In the program, the concept of family was given a high priority and the importance of the family, respect and obedience to the elders, the position of the woman and the duties and responsibilities of all individuals in the family were stated. Especially since the Ottoman Empire has an extended family structure, parental love is one of the values that are desired to be instilled in children at a young age.

At the same time, when it is accepted that the family is the smallest building block of the society and a small prototype of the state, it has been considered important for the sustainability of the society that the values and feelings instilled in the family, such as belonging, solidarity, love and respect, are reflected to the homeland, creating a strong civic loyalty and acting with the awareness of their rights and responsibilities towards both the state and each

other. By stating at the very beginning of the program that “*we must obey our sultan and our elders*”, it was emphasized that there was almost a similarity between the family and the state.

An important value added to the program during this period and wanted to be taught to children as a sacred duty is patriotism. The main purpose of this program, which came into effect especially at a time when the Ottoman state was on the verge of disintegration, is to create a new unity around the Ottoman identity. One of the key values in the program is the concept of obedience. Teaching this concept, especially starting from the family, was seen as a critical stage for obedience to the sultan and statesmen in the following years. As a result, in this period when the transition from subject to citizen was experienced, it was aimed to raise an Ottoman citizen in all aspects with the *Musahhabât-ı Ahlakîyye*. The program aimed to raise individuals who love their homeland and nation, appreciate their ancestors and the works left by them, are respectful, helpful, honest, have environmental and economic awareness, love nature and animals, and respect human rights.

Consequently, it was noticed that the field of citizenship education was neglected from the *Tanzimat* to the Republic era. Considering that citizenship education programs are an area where Social Studies educators need to do more research, it is thus recommended to increase studies in this area. One of the reasons why the study of citizenship education programs in the Ottoman period was neglected is that very few of the Social Studies educators knew Ottoman Turkish. The lack of knowledge of the Ottoman written language, which allows us to recognize our cultural heritage, hinders the work to be done in this field. Therefore, it is recommended that Ottoman Turkish courses be included in the programs at the undergraduate or graduate level in Social Studies education, and it is recommended to be offered as an elective course. Considering the Ottoman period citizenship education program and the Republican period programs in a comparative way should be encouraged as it will shed light on the historical development of Social Studies education. What kind of changes are experienced periodically in citizenship education programs and their reasons can be examined. The 1913 curriculum is extremely important as it is the first general program in the history of Turkish education. Other courses in these programs can also be studied at the graduate level or scientific publications can be made about them.

REFERENCES

- Akşin, S. (1980). *100 Soruda Jön Türkler ve İttihat ve Terakki*. İstanbul: Gerçek Yayınevi.
- Aktel, M. (1998). Tanzimat fermanının toplumsal yapısı. *Süleyman Demirel Üniversitesi, İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi*, 3(3), 177-184.
- Akyılmaz, S. G. (2008). Osmanlı Devleti'nde yönetici sınıf açısından müsadere uygulaması. *Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli Üniversitesi Hukuk Fakültesi Dergisi*, 12(1), 389-420.
- Akyüz, Y. (2011). *Türk eğitim tarihi*. Ankara Üniversitesi. Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi
- Anık, M. (2012). Çokkültürcülük ve Osmanlı Devleti. *Selçuk Üniversitesi Edebiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 4(27), 117-130.

- Balcı, A. (2006). *Sosyal bilimlerde araştırma yöntem, teknik ve ilkeler*. Ankara: Pegem Akademi
- Benzer, A. (2004). *Türkiye’de ana dili eğitimi müfredat programları 1913-1981*. (Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Marmara University).
- Berkes, N. (1979). *Türkiye’de çağdaşlaşma*. Ankara: Yapı Kredi Yayınları.
- Birecikli, İ. B. (2008). Yüzüncü yılında II. Meşrutiyet’in ilanı üzerine bir inceleme. *Gazi Akademik Bakış*, 3(5), 211-226.
- Budak, L., ve Budak, Ç. (2014). Osmanlı İmparatorluğu’ndan Türkiye Cumhuriyeti’ne ilköğretim programları (1870-1936). *Uluslararası Türkçe Edebiyat Kültür Eğitim Dergisi*, 3(1), 377-393.
- Büyükköztürk, Ş., Çakmak, E. K., Akgün, Ö. E., Karadeniz, Ş., ve Demirel, F. (2017). *Bilimsel araştırma yöntemleri*. Ankara: Pegem Yayıncılık.
- Chuang, N. C. & Ting, Y. K. (2021). School-Based Professional Learning Communities as a Means for Curriculum Development: A Case Study from Taiwan. *International Journal of Research in Education and Science (IJRES)*, 7(4), 1184-1210. <https://doi.org/10.46328/ijres.2408>
- Evans, R. & Kilinc, E. (2013). Creating 21st Century Learners: Edmodo in the Social Studies Classroom. In R. McBride & M. Searson (Eds.), *Proceedings of SITE 2013--Society for Information Technology & Teacher Education International Conference* (pp. 4965-4970). New Orleans, Louisiana, United States: Association for the Advancement of Computing in Education (AACE). Retrieved from <https://www.learntechlib.org/primary/p/48916/>.
- Gümüş, M. (2008). Anayasal Meşrûti Yönetime Medhal: 1856 Islahat Fermanı’nın Tam Metin İncelemesi. *Türk Dünyası Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 47(8), 215-240.
- Hayta, N., & Ünal, U. (2003). *Osmanlı Devleti’nde yenileşme hareketleri. XVII Yüzyıl Başlarından Yıkılışa*, Gazi Kitapevi, Ankara.
- Hazar, E., Akkutay, U., & Keser, H. (2021). Information, Media and Technology Skills in terms of Curricula, Process and Product in Middle and High Schools. *International Journal of Technology in Education and Science (IJTES)*, 5(3), 288-310. <https://doi.org/10.46328/ijtes.252>
- Hirshfield, L.J., & Chachra, D. (2019). Comparing the Impact of Project Experiences Across the Engineering Curriculum. *International Journal of Research in Education and Science (IJRES)*, 5(2), 468-487.
- Kaptan, S. (1991). *Bilimsel Araştırma ve İstatistik Teknikleri*, Ankara: Tekişik Web Ofset Tesisleri.
- Kaya, M. M. (2020). *II. Meşrutiyetten Cumhuriyete (1908-1961) Vatandaşlık Dersi Öğretim Programlarının Değişimi ve Ders Kitaplarına Yansımaları* (Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Dumlupınar University)
- Keskin, Y. (2002). *Türkiye’de II. Meşrutiyet’ten günümüze kadar uygulanmış olan sosyal bilgiler öğretim programlarının analizi ve karşılaştırılması*. (Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Marmara University).
- Kilinc, E. (2015). Elementary school and social studies teachers’ opinions about the concept of good citizenship. *Route Educational and Social Science Journal Volume 2(3)*, 194-206.
- Maarif Vekâleti, (1913). *İlk mekteplerin müfredat programı*. İstanbul: Maarif Vekâleti Yayınları

- Mentiş Taş, A., (2004). Sosyal bilgiler öğretmenliği eğitimi program standartlarının belirlenmesi. *Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi Dergisi* 37(1), 28-54.
- Paek, S., Leong, P., Johnson, P., & Moore, C. (2021). Is GPA Enough? A Platform for Promoting Computer Science Undergraduates' Pursuit of Career Related Extracurricular Activities. *International Journal of Technology in Education and Science (IJTES)*, 5(1), 1-16. <https://doi.org/10.46328/ijtes.146>
- Pamuk, Ş. (2005). *Osmanlı-Türkiye iktisadi tarihi*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Paul, M. W. (2021). Mobile Technology Pedagogy: Improved Student Engagement for Improved Self-Assessment. *International Journal of Technology in Education (IJTE)*, 4(4), 695-707. <https://doi.org/10.46328/ijte.171>
- Ring-Whalen. E., Dare, E., Roehrig, G., Titu P., Crotty, E. (2018). From Conception to Curricula: The Role of Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics in Integrated STEM Units. *International Journal of Education in Mathematics, Science and Technology (IJEMST)*, 6(4), 343-362. DOI: 10.18404/ijemst.440338
- Şahin, Ç., & Kartal, O. Y. (2013). Sınıf öğretmeni adaylarının sınıf öğretmeni yetiştirme programı hakkındaki görüşleri. *Uşak Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 6(1), 164-179.
- Sakaoğlu, N. (1985). *Eğitim tartışmaları. Tanzimattan Cumhuriyete Türkiye Ansiklopedisi, Cilt 2*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Satvinder Singh, R. K., Cheong, C. Y. M., & Rahman, N. A. A. (2021). Spoken and Written Communication Needs of Aviation Management Trainees. *International Journal on Social and Education Sciences (IJonSES)*, 3(3), 535-547. <https://doi.org/10.46328/ijonSES.235>
- Serbestoğlu, İ. (2011). Zorunlu bir modernleşme örneği olarak Osmanlı Tabiiyet Kanunu. *OTAM*, 2(29) 12-24
- Şişman, M. (2011). *Eğitim bilimine giriş*. Ankara: Pegem Yayıncılık.
- Temizer, A. (2013). Karadağ'da Öteki Sorunu: Müslümanlar (1878-1913) *History Studies*, 5(3), 223-240.
- Thurlings, M., Koopman, M., den Brok, P. & Pepin, B. (2019). Portraying Primary Fraction Teaching: A Variety of Mathematical Richness, Pedagogic Strategies, and Use of Curriculum Materials. *International Journal of Education in Mathematics, Science and Technology (IJEMST)*, 7(2), 170-185.
- Türkkan, H. (2018). Osmanlı Devleti'nde Demokratikleşme ve Kanun-ı Esasi'nin Demokratik Hüviyeti. *Vakanüvis-Uluslararası Tarih Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 3(Spec. issue), 364-379.
- Uçar, F. (2018). Türk Düşüncesinde Osmanlılık Fikrinin Ortaya Çıkışı ve Türk Siyasal Hayatına Etkileri. *Karadeniz Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 10(18), 81-108.
- Üstel, F. (2016). *Makbul Vatandaş'ın Peşinde: II. Meşrutiyet'ten Bugüne Vatandaşlık Eğitimi*. Ankara: İletişim Yayınları.
- Uyanık, E. (2006). *Modernleşme döneminde Türk aydınının eğitime bakışı* (Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Dokuz Eylül University).

-
- Yaşar, F. T. (2018). II. Meşrutiyet döneminde yurttaşlık, ahlak ve medenilik eğitimi: Malumat-ı medeniye ders kitapları. *Osmanlı Araştırmaları*, 52(52), 311-342.
- Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2016). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri*. Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.