ISSN (Print): 1979-8903; ISSN (Online): 2503-040X

Website: http://journalregister.iainsalatiga.ac.id/index.php/register/index

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.18326/rgt.v11i1.59-78

Photovoice: A Tool of Reflective Learning to Enhance Students' Speaking Ability

Amirah Husnun Sebelas Maret University amirahhusnun2@gmail.com

Aprilia Wulandari Sebelas Maret University apriliawe1997@gmail.com

Atika Munawwaroh Sebelas Maret University atika.muna.15@gmail.com

Nur Arifah Drajati Sebelas Maret University nurarifah_drajati@staff.uns.ac.id

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.18326/rgt.v11i1.59-78

Submission

Track:

Received:

25-03-018

Final

Revision:

28-05--2018

Available online:

01-06-2018

Corresponding Author:

ABSTRACT

Speaking considers as an important skill since it requires students to speak up their idea or opinion. However, Students tend to do the same mistakes when performing an oral speaking test. Due to the lack of students' skill in performing speaking, it triggers the researchers to raise this issue so the problem of students in performing speaking could be solved by using reflective learning based on reflective learning strengths. This research used narrative inquiry to

Nur Arifah Drajati nurarifah_drajati@staff.uns.ac.id

elaborate the photovoice method in which more practical is needed by collaborating with SHOWeD analysisin order to find and analyze the data. The participants of this study are 15 students who join speaking class of English Education Department consisting of 13 females and 2 males with the average age of around 19-20 years old. This article provides the findings of the use of reflective learning in the classroom to gain students' speaking ability for college students and also it uses audio recording. video of the student's performance and document as the main data for the study. In conclusion, the use of reflective learning from lectures to enhance students' speaking ability could be achieved through a certain treatment during the learning and teaching process in the classroom.

Keywords: Reflective Learning, Speaking Ability, Narrative Inquiry, Photovoice.

INTRODUCTION

C.S.Koong (2014) described reflective learning as a process of combining experiences, theories, and actions to gain new values. Reflective learning is a combination of thinking and action process. More studies stated that reflective learning gives positive impact to academic achievement level of learning (C.Hursen and F.G.Fasli, 2017). Moreover, reflective learning allows the students to enhance their learning experiences by using their previous skills. Reflective learning can be as the appropriate technique for developing lifelong learning skills of the students. Even though there are some arguments between the experts, but facts indicate that reflective

Vol. 11, No. 1, 2018, pp.59-78 ISSN (Print): 1979-8903; ISSN (Online): 2503-040X

Website: http://journalregister.iainsalatiga.ac.id/index.php/register/index

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.18326/rgt.v11i1.59-78

learning provides the students with deeper understanding and improves their skills as well. Reflective learning also helps the teacher in giving instruction for the students according to the students' need by providing a significant learning-teaching process (S.Galea, 2012). For helping the students to develop their speaking skill the researchers use reflective learning to conduct this study. The research intends to answer the question of how reflective learning impact in students' speaking performance.

Reflective learning approach provides the learning-teaching process with an important viewpoint, offers teachers the opportunity of improving their instructional implementations in the direction of students' needs(S.Galea, 2012). The reflective learning includeas an essential element both for change in students' behavior and cooperation among teachers (Fatemipour H., 2013). Through reflection learning, students can correct their misinterpretation by revising their beliefs and challenging the nature of their knowledge. In brief, it is a practice, which helps the students to become active learners.

As cited in M. Liu and J.Jackson (2009), based on the previous study found that many the students were passive learners, in a classroom the example of a negative action is students' silence. A study conducted by J.K.Wong (2004) used interviews with non-native students (E.Sawir, 2005). His study found that a lot of non-native English students became passive learners because they had been set up to focus on academic purposes and only listen to the teacher (teacher-centered) in the classroom with less chance to have active classroom conversation. Additionally, this study found that the students' cultural obstacle and lack of English language competence in the classroom were the main causes of students' passiveness. They only read the textbook, then teacher give the instruction, did the exam, in the end, they

forgot what they had learned. Since they became passive learners, they had lack of practice in speaking, such as they did not engage in conversation with classmates and teachers, students did not ask questions and figured out the answers, and eventually, they did not engage with students. Such problems made their speaking skills far from the target of learning plans. Students often made some mistakes since they never learned how to fix those mistakes. In addition, because of the students' passiveness, they tended to escape from their mistakes without any fixes. To cover the problems that students faced in speaking class, the researcher uses reflective learning strategy in order to improve their speaking performance.

According to **C.L.Anandari** (2015), foreign language made anxiety appeared among the students and that self-reflection activity helped the students to realize the strength, weaknesses, and helped them to solve the problems. Students could improve their own ability in speaking since they did the reflection; the reflection is one of the effective ways and it was practical to be done. According to **Suwartono** (2014), the reflective learning method using video involves oral communication activities has enhanced student learning process of English supra-segmental phonemes.

Reflection creates a "bridge between theory and practice (A.Power, C. Thomson, B.Mason and B.L. Bartleet, 2016). It is a vital part of students' critically reflective development within experiential-learning contexts. According to E.A.Insuasty, L.C.Z. Castillo (2010), reflection should become the fundamental part of teacher development because teachers have the responsibility to be able to assess and rearrange their teaching skill in order to optimize the teaching-learning process. Further, Zeichner.K.M & D.P.Liston (1996) stated that reflective learning concept means to advance teacher's professional competence (Radulescu C., 2013). It is because reflective learning concept consists of some steps, which generally aim to rise

ISSN (Print): 1979-8903; ISSN (Online): 2503-040X Website: http://journalregister.iainsalatiga.ac.id/index.php/register/index

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.18326/rgt.v11i1.59-78

exploration attitude and investigation in order to encourage teacher student's awareness and become the factor, which affects student teacher's learning process.

With regard to English foreign language learners, according to Akkakoson S., 2016) speaking considers as the most significant language skill, the students have to learn it. It is because English is important as an instrument for international communication ((Crystal, D, 2003)) and yet it is assumed the most stressful among the four language skills (M. Liu and J.Jackson, 2009).

According to Y. Rahmawati & Ertin (2014), there are some aspects that a person should consider when assessing students' speaking ability. (1) Grammar Test takers focus on the way they use grammar appropriately and accurately, construct the sentences and to avoid grammatical errors in speaking. (2) Using vocabulary features in a conversation used by test takers indicate the level of how proficient they are. (3) Comprehension is vital in order to understand the situation of the conversation and capable to give appropriate answer according to the question. (4) Fluency signs that the production of speech in a conversation is well delivered. In delivering the speech and being able to respond specific topics without many pauses in choosing words, confidence is necessary.(5) The criteria of the assessment in pronunciation deals with the frequent errors in pronunciation happen and the way pronunciation factor delays the communication. (6) A task is about finishing the instruction given during the speaking test.

As cited in Y. Rahmawati & Ertin (2014) speaking scores must be trustworthy, fair, and used for the intended purposes (Louma, 2004). In addition, trustworthy can be reached in speaking assessment as long as there should be some reasons (Y. Rahmawati & Ertin, 2014). The first is practicality. Test designer must consider how practical the test is, by considering the time limitation of running and interpreting the scoring of the test, budget limitation, and facilities. The second is validity. Excluding all irrelevant variables to measure the test. Test designer should decide the kind of speaking types that is suitable, as it will affect the design of assessment. The third is reliability. A reliable test is very significant since it needs the consistent scoring. In addition, clear rubric and scoring criteria is also a must. Without a good scoring system, it is hardly possible to have a reliable result of the test. The items on the scoring system should represent all aspects of what is to be assessed from the students. The amount of the score must be printed clearly on the form to make sure each student's ability is well presented. During the test, the standard scoring system will useful to record students' work. The last is authenticity. It is about contextual language or language in use. Test takers are instructed to represent something related to their values. In that case, the language produced is authentic.

Returning to reflective learning, Blumberg P. (2014) states that critical reflection is essential for all continued professional development. Therefore, instructors can use it as an effective tool as they transition to learn-centered teaching. Critical reflection is composed of three integrated part, namely personal reflection, critical review that is more data-driven, and documentation to support and record the insights gained in reflection. In addition, the development of reflective practice is certainly important for formative learning, tutors and students would benefit from an open discussion of a meta-cognitive dimension of learning and the theories of underpinning the process of reflection to facilitate their reflective competence.

According to **Bard R.** (2014), reflective learning is the act of thinking about something while seeking a deeper level of understanding; it needs

Vol. 11, No. 1, 2018, pp.59-78 ISSN (Print): 1979-8903; ISSN (Online): 2503-040X

Website: http://journalregister.iainsalatiga.ac.id/index.php/register/index

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.18326/rgt.v11i1.59-78

systematically thoughts by making questions, collecting data and analyzing data in order. Bard also shares that reflective learning is not isolated evidence (or data) about their work and then make a decision (instruction and otherwise) based on this information. **Farrel T. (2012)** states that reflective learning is a compass that allows us to stop for a moment or two and consider how we can create more learning opportunities for students. According to **S. Thomas & D. S. Packer (2013)**,reflective practicing makes teachers monitoring the students' progress and analyzing progress, monitoring data, making a reflection on every student's progress and fixing teaching practices based on each student's response to the instruction. In brief, reflective learning is an activity that involves high order thinking to acquire the information by passing some scientific process.

By taking the advantages of reflective learning, students can enhance their ability in performing speaking. According to NCAA (2015) reflective learning can be significant since it creates students' awareness of knowledge and skills that students have developed before. Every student has different knowledge background, in class students will be encouraged by using reflective learning. Besides, by using reflective learning students can categorize strengths and areas for development. Students in the class will be evaluated by their friends using written feedback during the learning process and friends' evaluation make the students know their weaknesses that they will do better in the next performance.

Reflective learning can develop an action plan for future learning; it is quite similar as the previous benefit. Students that have been evaluated by their friends they understand on which part that they usually make a mistake; therefore in the next chance they will not do the same fault. Afterwards, reflective learning is really important because it gains a greater understanding

of students and how students learn. It is very crucial that reflective learning can be a parameter of students' ability so that it helps the teacher to know how far students learn the knowledge. Lastly, reflective learning takes more responsibility for student process. Because in the reflective learning, students whom their friends assess will get the feedback about the performance, it is useful since it makes them improve their ability and revise their mistake in order to be better in the next performance.

RESEARCH METHODS

In this study, photovoice is used as the tool to analyze the data of reflective learning impact in students' speaking ability. Photovoice can be defined as a participatory action research strategy based on educational theories and health principles to contribute in social issues and community change, cited in (C.Wang & M.A. Burris, 1997) Photovoice allows people to use the camera to take photographs of every moment that happens in the community or social life. Photovoice helps the teacher to understand what is really happening in the teaching-learning activities through photographs.

This research employed narrative inquiry as the methodology to collect and constructs the data. Through inquiry into narratives, the participants have the chance to reflect on what they have experienced in their lives (Chan E., 2017). The participants of this research were 15 students who join speaking class of English Education Department in one of universities in Indonesia. This class consists of 13 females and 2 males with the average age of around 19-20 years old. This research was conducted in around 8 weeks. Researchers used questionnaire and written document to collect the data. After the students watched and gave feedback on the videos of their friends, the researchers give the questionnaire. The researchers, then, analyzed the results of the questionnaire by using SHOWeD analysis.

ISSN (Print): 1979-8903; ISSN (Online): 2503-040X Website: http://journalregister.iainsalatiga.ac.id/index.php/register/index

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.18326/rgt.v11i1.59-78

The purpose of our photovoice project was to understand what happens in the class. In photovoice project, we use SHOWeD analysis. SHOWeD is theacronyms of several questions in the questionnaire that the participants should answer while analyzing pictures.

- S What do you SEE here?
- H What is really HAPPENING here?
- O How does this relates to OUR lives? (or your life personally)
- W Why does the situation, concern or strength exist?
- e How could this image EDUCATE the community? (class)
- D What can we DO about it?

The documents in form of written reflection from the students themselves were used to assess and know which part needs to be revised. The written documents consist of some parts of their mistakes during selfrecording, e.g. intonation, grammar, pronunciation and fluency. In addition, what they have learned from their mistakes.

RESULTS & DISCUSSION

The implementation of reflective learning for college students, which focused on students' speaking ability, reports great improvement. At the beginning of the speaking class, the teacher explained the objectives that should students achieved in one period of learning activity. The students would learn about how to deal with speaking for IELTS test. In order to enhance students' speaking ability, the teacher asked the students to make a recording or video of himself or herself practicing their speaking skills. There were 10 topics, which usually appeared in speaking IELTS test and the students could choose one of them for their recording or video. The purpose of using recording or video in speaking lesson was to make the students

practice their speaking ability. The students do the reflection of their performance. There were three instruments used in a reflective learning activity in the classroom, namely recording instrument, video about students' performance and the other friends assess it, self-reflection documents. The researchers use those instruments to monitor the students' learning progress in reflective learning method.

Figure 1. Recording Instrument

S – What do you SEE here?

Answer: We are recording ourselves.

H – What is really HAPPENING here?

Answer: The lecturer asks us to make two recordings about introducing themselves. The first recording is without any preparation and the second one the students have a chance to prepare it before records it. After that, we are asked to compare the recording and analyze.

O – How does this relates to OUR lives? (or your life personally)

Answer: From this exercise, we the can know that if we want to get a better result we have to prepare it before.

W – Why does the situation, concern or strength exist?



Answer: Because of the lecturer and we need to know about how far students' ability in speaking IELTS, so they can predict what should they do next.

e – How could this image EDUCATE the community? (class)

Answer: By looking at the image, we can learn about the importance of reflecting ourselves to know our weaknesses and to know how to solve it.

D – What can we DO about it?

Answer: We can fix our problem by doing reflection so that we can perform better.

ISSN (Print): 1979-8903; ISSN (Online): 2503-040X Website: http://journalregister.iainsalatiga.ac.id/index.php/register/index

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.18326/rgt.v11i1.59-78

One of the ways to know the student's performance in speaking is through a voice recording. The recording is the good method to improve the students' speaking skills and one of the appropriate exercises because it allows the students to review their own performance. Through the recording, the students know their mistakes after listening to their own recording. Therefore, they know what they should do in the next better performance.

Figure 1. Shows that based on SHOWeD analysis of the picture, one of the participants shows a good response towards reflective learning implementation in speaking class. The students made a self-recording in speaking test without any preparation. The first recording was without any preparation and the second one the students had a chance to prepare it before recordedit. After that, the students compared the recordings and analyzed it. From the recording, we can know that if we want to get a better result we have to prepare it before.

According to Bard R. (2014), reflective learning is the act of thinking about something while seeking a deeper level of understanding; it needs systematic thoughts by making questions, collecting data and analyzing data in order. The research found that the students of speaking class could develop their skill in critical thinking and had better performance in speaking by using reflective learning. When listening to the first recording, the students, who joined speaking class using reflective learning method, realized that there were some errors in pronunciation, intonation, and pause. From knowing the students' own mistakes, they know their own speaking ability, so they can predict what they should do next to have better performance in speaking test. The students can learn about the importance of reflecting themselves to know our weaknesses and to know how to solve it.

Figure 2. Video about Students' Performance Assed by the Other Friends



This video captured by one of the student in speaking class. She records her video of IELTS speaking test preparation. The video is about student' personal data description. The content of the video is the IELTS speaking test part 1. This student introduces what her name is, how her friendsusually call her, where she lives, and what her hobbyis. In addition, the student talks about the special things in her

hometown. The video is recorded in about 2 minutes.

The students has watched the video in figure 2 in the class and then students take a note to assess and give feedback to the friend' performance. Most of the feedback given for each student focuses on grammar, pronunciation, fluency. Students have various mistakes and their friends comment on written feedback. Feedback is useful for students since it helps students to realize their actual competence; they not only realize their ability but also revise and try to improve their ability in order to perform better in the next recording. One student said that feedback is an evaluation for them. Reflective learning could be one of an effective way since it involves all the members of the class to assess one performance.

Consequently, those phenomena above relate to the study conducted by NCCA (2015) indicating that reflective learning can categorize strengths and areas for development. Students in the class evaluate their friends using written feedback during the learning process. The peer assessments make the evaluated students know their weaknesses so that they can perform better in the next performance.

Vol. 11, No. 1, 2018, pp.59-78

ISSN (Print): 1979-8903; ISSN (Online): 2503-040X

Website: http://journalregister.iainsalatiga.ac.id/index.php/register/index

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.18326/rgt.v11i1.59-78

In addition, reflective learning is flexible. It is not only applicable inside classrooms but also outside the class. It is limitless as long as students have the video to assess. Students agree that reflective learning involves critical thinking. In reflective learning students who assess others should think critically in what aspect should be corrected, e.g. they have to give detail comment of their friends' videos. Moreover, critical thinking is useful to gain the great result. There are some changes from students after joining the reflective learning process; they are well improved. Students become more critical in speaking aspect, in this case, they not only say what they want to say but also pay attention to some aspects, such as their pronunciation, grammar and also expression.

Therefore, **Blumberg P.** (2014) states that critical reflection is essential for all continued professional development. Therefore, instructors can use it as an effective tool as they are in transition to learn-centred teaching. Critical reflection consists of three integrated parts, namely personal reflection, critical review that is more data-driven, and documentation to support and record the insights gained in reflection. In addition, the development of reflective practice is certainly important for formative learning, tutors and students. The students gain benefit from the open discussion of a metacognitive dimension of learning and the theories underpinning the process of reflection to facilitate their reflective competence.



Figure 3. Self-Reflection Document

IELTS, how the test going on, what time we have to prepare our
speaking and the available time to speak. Also, we know that there are
three parts in IELTS speaking test, the topic that has high possibilities
to be come out as a test material. In my own recording, I have learned
that two minutes can be so short and also long, depends on how we can
share what we have known about any kind of topics. Besides, we have
to automatically concern on using appropriate intonation, fluency,
accuracy, and grammar when speaking.
I got a lot of new information, especially in IELTS. What things that
l

In today's classroom, I have learned and gained about speaking on

Student B

Student A

I got a lot of new information, especially in IELTS. What things that we have to say when we are in IELTS test, how to introduce ourselves in two minutes with the appropriate topic. And then, there are three points that we have to know about IELTS.

By listening to my own recording, it makes me realize how awkward was my voice is. So, I want to practice a lot in speak English to get the better voice.

Student C

From today's classroom, I learn so many things especially, to introduce myself in two minutes because before this I think that two minutes is a little time but when I practice it, two minutes are enough. Not only knowing my own introduction but also knowing my friend's introduction. I also learn about recording my voice when I have the introduction, so I know that my pronunciation is good or bad. The things that I learn from the recording is I can fix my pronunciation

Vol. 11, No. 1, 2018, pp.59-78
ISSN (Print): 1979-8903; ISSN (Online): 2503-040X
Website: http://journalregister.iainsalatiga.ac.id/index.php/register/index
DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.18326/rgt.v11i1.59-78

	when I heard and record it.
	The things that I have learned:
Student D	1. Three parts of speaking on IELTS (Introduction and Interview,
	Individual Long Turn, Discussion).
	2. Duration in speaking on IELTS (15 minutes).
	3. One minute's preparation and two minutes speak in part 1
	(Introduction myself).
	4. Fluency is very important in speaking on IELTS.
	5. There is a feedback from examiner on part 2.
	6. The score of speaking is 25% of total marks.
	7. One candidate one examiner.
	8. We speak familiar topic on the part one.
	9. A lot of things that we can introduce in introduction and interview
	section.
	10. Practice introduce myself by record it (before we have the
	knowledge and after we get it).
	What topic we should introduce, preparing for speak, listen to my own
	recording and we can know my duration, my mistakes, and my fluency.
	I have got new experiences such as trying to introduce myself to
	academic speaking.
	In the first time, I try to prepare what will I say on the recording.
Student E	Because I confuse what will I say. But, the lectures help me with give
	some "clue" to speak. Finally, I can say what will do. (introduction to
	IELTS):
	1. Trying to score the fluency.
	2. Trying to exercise (speaking) with my friends.

Student F	I learn how to arrange my points to talk about my minute's introduction.
	I learn about the 3 parts of speaking in IELTS.
	I should be calmer when I speak or introduce myself.
	I should my pronunciation so what.
	I've said an be well-heard to everyone.
	I should speak beautifully so my voice will not feel weird.
Student G	The thing that we can learn from today's classroom is about the parts of
	introduction IELTS speaking ability, especially in the introduction
	parts.
	I learned some question in the introduction. I learned some things
	especially about the way I speak.
	I learned about fluency, pronunciation, and the way I choose the
	vocabularies.
	I will learn to answer all the questions because in my recording I only
	can answer some questions.

The students' reflection documents of speaking IELTS talk about the rule in Speaking IELTS test. The students have a chance to speak in 2 minutes with the chosen topic. One of the students feel that the time is sufficient, and some say that 2 minutes is not enough, it proves that each pupil has the different problems on diction.

From the result of their own recording, the students able to know their own performance. The students also know what they experience in doing reflective learning during speaking class. That activity helps them to make introspection of themselves so that they learn from their mistakes and try to fix it.

Every student has different background knowledge, in the class students will have encouragement by using reflective learning. The finding of this study prove the statement of NCCA on section 1that the students are more aware of their knowledge. The reflective learning process demands the

ISSN (Print): 1979-8903; ISSN (Online): 2503-040X Website: http://journalregister.iainsalatiga.ac.id/index.php/register/index

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.18326/rgt.v11i1.59-78

students to revise their works frequently. Moreover, by doing frequent revision they recognize their own ability and the point to develop. The students also have better preparation, they anticipate some problems by having more practice, fix their pronunciation, recheck the grammar, set the intonation, as well as the fluency. Therefore, they minimize the same mistake in the next performance. By using reflective learning, the effectiveness can be reached since it involves all the students in the class. Reflective learning really makes the students realize to make progress of their own ability, the students are aware that they have responsibility to revise their mistakes.

CONCLUSION

By looking on the students' result, researchers can conclude that the practice of reflective learning is effective. It is able to reflect the mistake made by the students and the reflection improves the students' skill, particularly speaking competence. The enhancement aspects include intonation, grammar, pronunciation and fluency. Besides, reflective learning encourages the students to learn from their mistakes in form of oral speech. By learning the mistakes, the students develop their ability to do better in performing speaking. This study contributes to help both teacher and students. For the teacher, it helps the teacher to develop new method for teaching-learning activities in classroom. Reflective learning include as the appropriate method for the teacher to monitor the student's learning progress. Meanwhile, reflective learning is very helpful for the students to do better performance in speaking by learning and evaluating their own mistakes.

The limitation of the research is that the researcher had limited time to conduct the study. It might influence the participant's responses to have complete answer.

With regard to further research, this study is investigating the use of reflective learning to develop the students' speaking skill. Although the study reveals that reflective learning shows a positive impact to improve students' speaking skill, it still depends on the students' honesty in doing the reflection activity. The researchers suggest for the next study to do more preparation to maximize the results and prevent non-valid result.

REFERENCES

Zeichner.K.M & D.P.Liston. (1996). *Reflective teaching: an introduction*. Mahwah. NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

- A.Power, C. Thomson, B.Mason and B.L. Bartleet. (2016). Reflection for learning, learning for reflection. *Journal of University Teaching & Learning Practice*, 13(2).
- Akkakoson, S. (2016). Speaking Anxiety In English Conversation

 Classrooms Among Thai Students . *Malaysian Journal of Learnng*and Instruction , (13):63-82.
- Bard, R. (2014). Focus on Learning: Reflective Learners and Feedback. TESL-J, 18(3).
- Blumberg. (2014). How Critical Reflection Benefits Fculty as They Implement Learner- Centerd Tecahing. *New Direction For Teaching and Learning*, 144.
- C.Hursen and F.G.Fasli. (2017). The Impact of Reflective Teaching Application Supported by Edmodo on Prospective Teachers' Self-Directed Learning Skills. *International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning*, 12(10).
- C.L.Anandari. (2015). Indonesiaan EFL students anxiety in speech production: possible causes and remedy. *TEFLIN Journal*, 26(1).

Vol. 11. No. 1. 2018, pp.59-78

ISSN (Print): 1979-8903; ISSN (Online): 2503-040X

Website: http://journalregister.iainsalatiga.ac.id/index.php/register/index

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.18326/rgt.v11i1.59-78

- C.S.Koong. (2014). An Investigation into Effectiveness of Different Reflective Learning Strategies for Learning Operational Software. *Computer and Education Elsevier*, 72, 167-186.
- C.Wang & M.A. Burris. (1997). Photovoice: Concept, Methodology, and Use for Participatory Needs. *SAGE Journal*, 24(3), 369-387.
- Chan, E. (2017). Narrative inquiry: a dynamic relationship between culture, language and. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 42(6), 22-34.
- Crystal, D. (2003). *English as global language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- E.A.Insuasty, L.C.Z. Castillo. (2010). Exploring refflective teaching through informed journal keeping and blog group. *National University of Columbia*, 12(2), 87-105.
- Farrel, T. (2012). Reflecting on Reflective Practice: (Re)visiting Dewery and Schon. *TESOL Journal*, *3*(1).
- Fatemipour, H. (2013). The Efficiency of the Tools Used for Reflective Teaching in ESL Contexts. *Elsevier*, *93*, 1398-1403.
- J.K.Wong. (2004). Are the learning styles of Asian internationals culturally or contextually based? *International Education System*, 4(4), 154-156.
- Louma, S. (2004). Assessing speaking. Cambridge: University of Cambridge.
- M. Liu and J.Jackson. (2009). Retience in Chineese EFL Students at Varied Proficiency Levels. TESL CANADA JOURNAL, 26(2), 67.
- NCAA. (2015). Focus on Learning: Students Reflecting on Their Learning. Dublin: NCAA.
- Radulescu, C. (2013). Reinventing reflective learning methods in teacher education. *Science Direct*, 78(-), 11-15.

- S. Thomas & D. S. Packer. (2013). A Reflective Teaching Road Map for Pre-service and Novice Early Childhood Educators. *International Journal of Early Childhood Special Education*, 5(1).
- S.Galea. (2012). Reflecting Reflective Practice. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 44(3).
- Sawir, E. (2005). Language difficulties of international students in Australia: The effect of prior learning experience. *International Education Journal*, 6(5).
- Suwartono. (2014). Enhancing the pronunciation of English suprasegmental features through reflective learning. *TEFLIN Journal*, 25(1).
- Y. Rahmawati & Ertin. (2014). Developing assessment for speaking. *IJEE*, I(2), 1-12.