



Making Foreign Aid Work: Issues of Cost Effectiveness of Educational Aid in Pakistan

¹Asif Khan, ²Tasawar Baig, ³Saadia Beg, ⁴Hafiz Ghufuran Ali Khan

¹ Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Development, Karakoram International University, Gilgit, Pakistan

² Assistant Professor and Head, Department of International Relations, Karakoram International University, Gilgit, Pakistan, tasawar.baig@kiu.edu.pk

³ Assistant Professor, Department of International Relations, Karakoram International University, Gilgit, Pakistan

⁴ Assistant Professor, Faculty of Management Sciences, International Islamic University, Islamabad. Pakistan

ARTICLE DETAILS	ABSTRACT
<p>History Revised format: May 2019 Available Online: June 2019</p> <hr/> <p>Keywords <i>Foreign Aid, Aid Effectiveness, Poor Governance, Institutional Accountability</i></p> <hr/> <p>JEL Classification: A20, D24, F35</p>	<p>The quality of inclusive and accountable institutions in a donor-recipient country determines the effectiveness of foreign aid. This study examined whether the role of donor agency or the implementing agency was more helpful in the successes of two foreign-funded educational interventions in Northern Pakistan. The two interventions, each focusing on teachers' development program and the capacity development of principals, were funded by two different international donors. The study also provided a comparison of the two international donors working styles and their strategies applied for the execution of their respective projects. The findings of the study, which were generated through qualitative methods, noted wide variations not only in the working strategies of the two donors, but also the role of the executing agency. It was noted that multiple factors determined the productivity of the two projects; one of the elements that contributed the success or failure of the two project was their design or road map. Based on the findings of this study, it was maintained that a proactive role of both the entities is crucial for the success of such interventions.</p>

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author's email address: tasawar.baig@kiu.edu.pk

Recommended citation: Khan, A., Baig, T., Beg, S. and Khan, H. G. A., (2019). Making Foreign Aid Work: Issues of Cost Effectiveness of Educational Aid in Pakistan, *Review of Economics and Development Studies*, 5 (2), 281-290

DOI: 10.26710/reads.v5i2.591

1. Introduction

The effectiveness of foreign aid relies on the capacity of the recipient country to utilize external assistance through inclusive and accountable institutions. These inclusive institutions facilitate developing not only friendly domestic policies to attract overseas assistance, but also strive to create transparent procedures to achieve foreign aid objectives. During the period from 1960 to 1990, foreign aid was directed to address such issues as security concerns of the Cold War, promotion of democracy and human rights, and promotion of export markets in developing countries (Graham, 2002). However, a paradigm shift in foreign aid occurred in 2000 when a new menace - global terrorism - threatened world peace and security. In the United States, the events of 9/11/2001 convinced the global community, especially the influential northerners, that as long as issues such as rampant

poverty, illiteracy, social injustices and political instabilities of the developing countries are not properly addressed, the world will remain vulnerable to terrorist attacks, and as a result, world peace will be in jeopardy. Such a conviction led to the massive flow of foreign assistance to those countries which were supposed to be the sanctuaries or the breeding grounds of terrorism.

For the last two decades, Pakistan has remained a major recipient of foreign aid and grants from bilateral and multilateral agencies in North America, Europe, and Asia. Besides fortifying security establishments, a good chunk of the foreign aid is allocated to strengthen the social sector including health, education, agriculture, and energy sectors. Although there has been a significant reduction in the economic assistance provided to Pakistan, it is still significantly large, from an annual US \$2.3 billion till 2013 to US \$1.6 billion 2014 onwards (Rana, 2017). Very limited information is, however, available regarding the contribution of this foreign aid towards the development of various economic sectors in Pakistan. In the context of developing countries, researchers have also shown their concerns about the productivity and utilizations of foreign assistance (Riddell, 2012).

Therefore, this study was conducted to examine the execution and some of the accomplishments of two foreign-funded educational projects in Pakistan. This study examined the comparative effectiveness of the donor agency and the implementing agency in making the two interventions productive and meaningful. There is a dire need for such a study since the scaling down of aid commitments from donor agencies, due to their limited contributions in developing countries, is a serious issue (Wane, 2004).

2. Context of the Study

The study conducted in Northern Pakistan particularly examined two foreign-funded educational projects. In order to maintain privacy, the actual names of the two donors are not used in this study; instead, Donor-I and Donor-II are used as pseudonyms. A multi-million dollar project, focusing on the training of elementary school headmasters, was initiated by Donor-I. The specific aim of this project was to develop the managerial skills of elementary headmasters in such a way that could help the schoolteachers to improve their teaching practices. Since the said project was also implemented in other parts of Pakistan, a government agency was responsible at the federal level to oversee the project. At the regional level where this study was conducted, the local director of education was responsible for the execution of this project. A four-member team, headed by a project director, appointed by the local department of education, was responsible for the execution of this project.

Another multi-million dollar project focusing on the teachers' preparation program was launched by Donor-II with the specific objective of replacing the traditional teacher's preparation programs (CT, PTC, B.Ed.) with an updated and innovative teachers' development program. This project was also launched simultaneously in other parts of the country. While executing this project, Donor-II ensured that whatever innovation they brought to the teachers development program would have to be supported by the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan (HEC) and the federal government through policy making. Donor-II established their offices across the country and the Pakistani staff executed the project with the support of the local department of education.

3. Methodology

The study used a qualitative approach to generate data through the application of such tools as interviews, document reviews, observations, and focus group discussions. The venues of both the projects were two government colleges of education, one each for male and female. The sample of the study in case of the Donor-I funded project, which focused on training the headmasters, was the project director and the three resource persons/trainers. Additionally, through an opportunity sampling strategy, six headmasters (two female and four male trainees) were selected to seek their perspectives about their training program. The duration of each recorded interview was 40 minutes. The interview sessions, document reviews, and observations covered such areas as the quality of the training, knowledge level of the resource persons, involvement of the donor agency, training manual, and the annual progress report of the project.

The sample of the study in case of the Donor-II funded project, which focused on a new teachers' development program, was ten instructors (five males and five females from two colleges of education), two principals each from the two colleges, and students who were enrolled in the new teacher development program. Specific themes, such as the quality of the program, availability of resources, and knowledge level of instructors, induction of prospective teachers, and the role of implementing agencies were discussed. Both the donors and local directorate of education

were the focus of interviews, document reviews, and observations. Focus group discussions were conducted to seek the perspectives of students. A thematic approach was used to analyze the data.

4. Conceptualizing Foreign Aid – Literature Review

Foreign aid has remained one of the most widely discussed and debated concepts over the past six decades or so. There is a polarized understanding of the impact of foreign aid among academics, political-economists and development practitioners. During the post-World War-II period, world politics witnessed the emergence of new nation-states due to the decolonization processes across the world. By and large, these newly independent states had fragile political-economic conditions, and foreign aid was believed to be a significant factor to stabilize the weak domestic conditions of these poor societies. Moreover, the rationale behind foreign aid is designed on development models of western or advanced societies. To replicate these western-oriented development models, the donor countries appropriated foreign aid to “fill the gaps in resources, encouraging domestic investment and industrial development under the belief that foreign aid could help developing countries to accelerate the takeoff into self-sustained growth by generating new domestic investment” (Khan & Ahmed, 2007, p.216).

At the same time, the post-war era developed a bipolar structure of world politics, where the utilization of foreign aid was carried out for political objectives rather than to emphasize “raising the quality of life throughout the Third World” (Miles, 2012.p.28). However, the commitments of foreign aid were designed to facilitate the stages of growth through investment and increase productivity vis-à-vis to transfer technology (Khan & Ahmed, 2007). This original construction of notions about foreign aid - to reduce the foreign exchange gap with provisions of access to the technology, enrich human capital and access to the global market, which actually yields different outcomes (Ali & Ahmed, 2013).

Most of the foreign aid resources are generated through international donor agencies residing in western countries, and statistics show that since 1960, more than US \$2.2 trillion dollar is pumped into developing societies under development assistance programs designed to accomplish social reform initiatives (Monkam, 2012). Subsequently, the developing countries gradually become highly dependent on foreign assistance, which has its own domestic economic, political and social repercussions. Ali and Ahmad (2013) acknowledge the benefits of foreign aid for the development of the recipient nation, but argue that ‘reliance on aid makes the pendency of the economy on external sources, increases ways to corruption and also affects economic administration badly.

For instance, as in case other Third World countries, Pakistan has remained one of highest recipients of foreign aid, and Pakistan received more than US 73 billion dollars as foreign aid from 1960 to 2002 (Khan & Ahmed, 2007). Sarwar, Hassan and Mahmood (2015) have vividly portrayed a chronological overview of foreign aid in Pakistan. Their overview suggests that since 1947, Pakistan is heavily dependent on foreign aid, however the flow of aid fluctuated due to geo-strategic reasons. The volume of aid assistance remained higher until the 1980s. In the 1960s, it was equal to 6.6 percent of GNP, in the 1970s 4.2 percent to 5.5 percent of GNP and in the 1980s it was equal to 4.6 percent of GNP. In the 1990s, Pakistan faced a huge financial crunch due to its nuclear tests in 1998, nevertheless, the flow of foreign aid resumed as a result of the incidents of 9/11. Pakistan once again become a frontline state and started to accrue foreign aid resources (Sarwar et al., 2015).

The fundamental issue with foreign aid was to critically evaluate the cost effectiveness of the overseas aid assistance as it pertains to the general development of Third World countries, which is still a controversial issue. It is controversial due to the bipolarity or dichotomy of aid works itself. To elaborate this dichotomy, Easterly (2008) quotes two instances from a single report produced by Department for International Development (DFID). On the one hand, the DFID report endorses the cost-effectiveness of aid work, which says that the aid assistance “help(ed) [to] reduce poverty by increasing economic growth, improving governance and increasing access to public services” and on the other hand, the same report suggests that “aid does work already and will work in the future, but aid is also not working’ which reflects the limitations and conditionalities of aid effectiveness” (Easterly, 2008, p.1). Easterly (2008) further argues that this dichotomy can be found in reports and projects of other major donor agencies like the World Bank (WB), International Monetary Fund (IMF) and so forth.

Sachs (2005) finds foreign aid useful and his work advocates for support for a massive increase foreign aid for the development of poor countries. In contrary, Easterly (2008) argued that it makes no sense to provide additional foreign aid to Third World countries, because the donors have no idea where the money is going and it is being wasted (Easterly, 2008). One possibility of the misuse of foreign aid is the “lacks the capacity to utilize outside

assistance effectively” (Diamond, 2006, p.34). In response, Sachs argued that one should not blame the novel idea of foreign aid and “believing aid money is completely squandered would not justify, if system is not in place’, therefore, it’s rather “corruption is the culprit” or “poor governance”, and in this condition foreign aid causes harm to the recipient nations, specifically because aid is distributed by local politicians and finances the creation of corrupt government systems in order to channel the overseas donor’s assistance for their own gain’. This creates frustration and Sachs believes that the aid assistance is a ‘money down the drain” (Sachs, 2005, p.310).

Despite the fact that Pakistan received a huge amount of foreign aid, over the decades the country has failed to improve its self-sustaining indicators of socio-economic development (Nasir, Rehman, & Orakazai, 2012). A fundamental reason for this failure is the diversion of “development expenditure to non-development expenditure” to benefit corrupt individuals for political gains, which negatively affected societal growth plans (Din & Awan, 2015). This vindicates the view that corruption is the culprit and bad governance mechanisms allowed foreign aid to serve “the vested interests of influential people”(Khan & Ahmed, 2007). Hence, much of the aid received in most of the poor countries ‘undermines government accountability to citizens because it goes into the pockets of corrupt bureaucrats and politicians. Foreign aid is used to import unsuitable technology, expand government bureaucracies and encourage a larger, unproductive and corrupt government in developing countries or it is just misused (Sarwar et al., 2015).

How to make the aid effective? There are variety of ways to make it cost effective, however, keeping in view the new millennium consensus was developed on set of values and principles known as “aid effectiveness paradigm” to be practiced in “post-aid world’, which actually requires the development effectiveness consigning [with] the aid effectiveness to the past” (Mawdsley, Savage, & Kim, 2014 p.27). The new effectiveness paradigm and future aid initiatives will be strung around three important areas: 1) the outcome-based measures will be gauged based on achievement of impact, 2) concept of development is expanded, which shall not focus only on income poverty alone, and 3) aid as a joint venture between governments and non-state actors in order to achieve the targets of MGDs and now SDGs together (Mawdsley, Savage, & Kim, 2014).

Other significant aspects of aid effectiveness are linked with the domestic policy orientations of the recipient country. More friendly policies toward donor agencies, ensued by stronger accountability and transparent relationships between donor agencies, end users of aid, accountability within projects, and active participation of community, can yield positive outcomes (Winters, 2010). Constructing stronger relationship between domestic and external actors, as identified previously, help in institutionalizing the foreign aid process at an implementation scale, and also develop more inclusive processes with the participation of civil society (Mawdsley et al, 2014).

Lack of an institutionalized mechanism is a core impediment for the effectiveness of aid, while aid is more effective in countries with superior accountability institutions, because good institutions stands on a base of an effective norms and principles that regulate the appropriate behaviors and constraints for unnecessary actions (Winters, 2010). In short, institutions are humanly devised constraints that “reduce uncertainty by establishing a stable structure to human interactions” (North 2004, p.6). Henceforward, the effectiveness of foreign aid through an ‘aid effective paradigm’ certainly anticipates the provision of transparency, which is linked with participation of a civil society and local stakeholders in rule-making and implementation, and an accountable institutional structure to sanction misbehavior (Auer, 2007). Until recently, foreign aid has not been effective to the recipient countries, because aid is circulated and distributed through accountable procedures by local politicians, false finances mechanisms and corrupt governments. These complex situations can only be bridled through strong, inclusive institutions to temper the misbehaviors.

5. Major Findings

5.1 Donor-I Funded project

A review of the documents, such as annual progress report, showed that the project achieved its target in terms of the utilization of 92 percent of the budget and the provision of training to some 550 headmasters during the initial phase of its implementation. It was claimed by the project director and his staff that the project was one of most successful interventions in Northern Pakistan. The claims of the project staff were endorsed by the official reports which stated that the project has largely contributed to the knowledge of headmasters in terms of their understanding about supporting the teachers with their teaching practices. The project staff/trainers mentioned that they conducted the professional development sessions in a very systematic manner; for instance, they mentioned that they determined the training needs of the headmasters through a need assessment exercise. Additionally, they

explained that they use a tool to determine if the knowledge level of the headmasters was enhanced after attending the training.

During a review of the documents, it was noted that the need assessment tool, which was used to determine the training needs, comprised of only three questions: a) if they attended any training before b) what are their expectations from the training c) if they have any suggestions. A good number of trainees commented that they had not seen the need assessment tool before the training. Before the start of a new session, the trainers would administer a pre-test questionnaire to understand the previous knowledge of the trainees about the topic of that session. However, the headmasters expressed their concerns about the authenticity of the pre-test questionnaire by saying that they come from Urdu medium schools and backgrounds whereas the questionnaire, which contained at least 10-12 questions, was in English. A review of the said document confirmed the concerns of the trainee headmasters. For instance, in one of the questions of the said tool, the headmasters were asked to elaborate the steps of classroom observations. Some of the answers include: taking attendance; maintaining cleanliness, maintaining discipline, etc. When the opinions of project director and their staff about the aforementioned gaps were sought, they were adamant in saying that the said tools were very helpful in addressing the different activities of the training sessions. However, they admitted that before the inception of the program they were not provided with any training or orientations. Even the project director was appointed after the recruitment of the three trainers by the local department of education, which was the executing agency, according to the project staff.

There was consensus among the participants/trainees that the project would have been very productive and successful if it was organized in a very professional manner. They had the opinion that since the name of a well-reputed international donor agency was involved and a huge amount of financial resources were allocated, they had great expectations from the program which were not fulfilled. It was noted that the program was exclusively designed for the headmasters, but a good number of the participants were teachers. Some of the participants mentioned that they were verbally informed by the headmasters or the officials of the department of education that they were to attend the sessions a day before the training. One of the female headmistresses mentioned that she did not know that the training was exclusively designed for the head teachers and she only came to know this when she reached the training venue. It was noted that some of the participants even came three or four days after the start of the training sessions. During the observation of the training sessions, it was noted that late arrival of the trainees and their absence was a common practice. The project staff, including the project director, blamed the officials of the local department of education for the previously mentioned gaps. They mentioned that sometimes they sent multiple reminders to the officials to nominate the headmasters in a timely manner. They also added that since there is no mechanism for follow-up, participants do not take these sessions seriously and they only attend these sessions to secure the financial benefits (TA/DA). Despite the fact that absenteeism and late arrival was frequently noticed, the daily attendance register reported 100 percent participation. The project staff mentioned that a federal unit team made a single visit during the lifecycle of the project, whereas the role of the donor was only limited to ensure the proper utilization of the funds without any involvement. Occasional visits from the officials of department of education were also noticed, which was limited to only monitor the running of the project.

The knowledge level of the resource persons, content of the different sessions, and the classroom practices (training sessions) were not compatible with the objectives of this project, which was improving the classroom practices through the involvement of headmasters. The participants also reported the questionable skills of the resource persons and their content knowledge. The resource persons/trainers admitted that they had no prior experience around providing training to the headmasters or the adult learners. It was noticed on many occasions that the resource persons would start their sessions by informing the participants that they only came to know about the topic of the sessions this morning since the project director would decide the topics. In addition to permanent staff, guest speakers would come to deliver lectures. The trainees pointed out that since the guest speakers were invited on a very short notice, their lectures were limited to sharing their personal stories.

A training module addressing the objectives of the project was developed by a federal unit that was compatible with the objectives of the program, however, the resource person would not follow that module; the project director was not mindful of this situation. The training was designed to create awareness about the teaching and learning culture of the school; however, it was noticed that the resource persons were more focused on the administrative aspect of headship, which was noticed during the observation of training sessions. For instance, on one occasion the project director conducted a session on the responsibilities of the head teachers and he discussed 12 responsibilities; none of them addressed the teaching and learning practices. The trainees pointed out that the knowledge they were

getting from the resource persons was obsolete and outdated. It was noted that the training sessions were traditional devoid of interactions and discussions; lecture methods were the popular mode of these sessions. On one occasion, a resource person asked the trainees to comment on the content and methodologies of the trainers in the presence of the researchers; the trainees were candid in saying that they were dissatisfied.

5.2 Donor-II Funded project

With the support of Higher Education Commission and government of Pakistan, Donor-II launched the new teacher's preparation program in two government colleges of education in Northern Pakistan and other parts of the country. On one hand, the Donor- II ensured the provision of the new curricula, learning resources, training of instructors about the new program, and the availability of technology to the two colleges of education. On the other hand, it started developing policies with the help of HEC for the phasing out of old traditional teachers' preparation programs such as PTC, CT, and B.Ed. Both the students who were enrolled in the new teachers' preparation program called Advance Diploma in Education (ADA) and the instructors had very positive opinions about the new program. One of the instructors mentioned, 'Although for the last many years other sectors of economy was thriving except the education sector, however, the launching of a new ADE program is a great contribution to address the quality issues of education in Pakistan'. Instructors acknowledged that a new generation of teacher are being produced and they are equipped with new skills and are ready to bring changes to the classroom practices.

One of the strengths of the new program was its practice-oriented teaching approaches and reflective practices that enabled the students to understand the multiple approaches of teaching, rather than focusing on a teacher-centered approach. There was consensus among the students and instructors that both the content and curricula of the ADE program was developed according to the needs of the students and the society. As mentioned earlier, not only were the instructors provided training before the inception of the program, they were also provided opportunities to develop the curriculum of their own subjects. The researchers also participated in one of the curriculum development workshops where curriculum experts from a foreign country was invited to help the instructors with the curriculum development processes. Instructors were candid in admitting that trainings and curriculum development workshops helped them to understand the group work, student-centered approaches, and discussion methods. A glimpse of the said concepts noticed during the observation of some of the classes where the instructors were applying the said approaches.

Students pointed out that their instructors are still wrestling with the challenges of the new program, a point which was endorsed by some of the instructors. Two of the issues associated with the new program were the integration of information technology and the literature, which was in English. Students mentioned that a very modern program has been given to a very traditional teaching force which lacks computer and internet skills; they also mentioned that a limited grasp of English sometimes makes their teaching practices questionable. The program was designed to connect the instructors with the internet for accessing updated literature/knowledge and illuminating their teaching practices. There were mixed opinions about the integration of modern technology in the program. For some instructors, technology was a great source, helping them to enrich their curriculum and improve their teaching, and for others, it was a hurdle since they had limited understanding about the application of modern technology. It is pertinent to mention here that the instructors were offered training on computer usage and the internet before the inception of the new program. However, the instructors agreed that the lack of power and internet connectivity in the whole region neutralized their efforts to become more acquainted with the technology. Some of the instructors also admitted that although they were well versed in methodologies, due to their weaker grasps of English, they had a limited influence on their students.

Besides the phasing out of a traditional teachers' development program, at the policy level it was also decided that the minimum criteria for becoming school teachers would be two years of teacher education with an Advance Diploma in Education (ADE). As a result, more than 70 government colleges of education across the country, including Northern Pakistan, stopped enrolling students in traditional CT and PTC program. However, both the students and the instructors reported that a good number of teacher education colleges in Pakistan are still offering traditional degrees such as PTC and CT; students can take these exams as private candidates as well. One of the instructors commented that since education is considered as a professional degree just like medicine and engineering, students should not be allowed to take private exams to become a teacher; he added that if this situation continues, it would make the success of the new program questionable.

Although they were enthusiastic, it was noticed that a sense of uncertainty prevailed among the students about their own future with an ADE degree. They mentioned that at the time of the launch of the new ADE program, it was promised by the government that not only would the teachers with ADE degrees be given enhanced pay scale /grades, but they also will be preferred at the time of employment, due to the rigorous nature of their program. However, they said that none of these promises were fulfilled by the government. It was noted that although the local government had phased out the PTC and CT program from Northern Pakistan, they had neither changed the service rules, nor made the service rules friendly to the ADE graduates. While commenting and comparing the quality of traditional CT/PTC and ADE programs, one of the instructors mentioned that

As compared to ADE, students score good grades in traditional programs due to the rigorous nature of new program... the good grades helps the students (with PTC, CT) to secure jobs since the government is still accepting application of students who have PTC and CT degrees ...additionally, the recruitment policies are grade-oriented not the competency oriented and this situation discouraged the students to pursue ADE.

One of the implications of this situation was that when students failed to secure employments with an ADE degree, they started pursuing M.Ed. degrees with the apprehension that ADE is not enough to get employment. In this regard, a review of the advertisement published in the local dailies endorsed the concerns of students about the recruitment policies regarding ADE program; nowhere in the advertisement was it mentioned that ADE graduates would be preferred or that they would be given better pay scales.

Since the donor's staff was stationed in the region, they had developed and maintained a very robust liaison with the local department of education, two colleges of education, and with the other stakeholders who were involved in the execution of the project. From the provision of instructional material to the availability of modern technology, the staff would monitor the timely delivery of the said resources. It was noticed on multiple occasions that through the involvement of a third party, the donor monitored the overall progress of different components of this project. For instance, during a workshop, the researchers were interviewed by a representative of a western agency famous for monitoring and evaluations of the foreign- funded projects. The interview covered such areas as content of the training, knowledge level of the resource person, general opinions about the project, logistics, etc.

6. Analysis and Discussion

A broader generalization cannot be made based solely on the findings of this study, because context and geographical locations may have an impact on the overall productivity of these kinds of interventions. However, many important lessons can be drawn that could help the international donors, recipient countries, and implementing agencies to review their policies and capacities for making themselves better prepared if such kinds of opportunities emerge in the future. Furthermore, the research can contribute to the body of knowledge in two ways; firstly, the study provided a comparison of working styles of two international donors and their strategies applied for the execution of projects in a particular geographical location; secondly, the study critically analyzed whose role, international donors or the implementing agencies of the aid-receiving countries, is more important for the success of any foreign funded intervention.

There is no doubt that for the implementations of any project, the foreign donors remain dependent on the host countries and their affiliated institutions, as the present study noted, where a local directorate of education was either an executing agency or a partner of two different foreign funded projects. The role of the director of education was central in the implementation of the Donor-I funded project, which focused on the capacity development of elementary school principals. Through its regional office, Donor-II executed a new teachers' development project while maintaining a close liaison with the local department of education; in other words, the department was an equal partner of the implementation of the said project. It has been largely recognized that the effectiveness and quality of any foreign intervention depends upon its design or road map (Wane, 2004). A clear variation between the implementation processes of the two projects speaks loudly about the way it was designed.

As the study noted, Donor-II designed the project in such way that the success of their intervention was contingent upon the active participation of governmental entities such as HEC, the ministry of education, and the regional department of education. Not only did Donor-II lead these governmental entities to develop policies regarding the phasing out of traditional teachers' development programs, but Donor-II also engaged these entities in such a way that they acted as equal partners, which is evident from a meaningful relationship between the donor agency and the local director of education. However, such linkages and connections were not explicit in the Donor-I funded

projects, in which a multimillion project was executed by a group of people who enjoyed a substantial level of freedom without an explicit involvement of either the donor agency or the local director of education. It seems that the said project was launched in haste without developing a clear road map of execution and defining clear policies. The anomalies in the hiring of the project staff, such as hiring the trainers before the recruitment of the project director, lack of proper orientation for the project staff, and limited competencies of the trainers are just some of the examples of the questionable designing of the Donor-II funded project. It has also been suggested that a large flow of financial assistance may not be workable in the countries where they lack clear policies; therefore it is necessary to be more focused on policy-making because clear policy-making is a primary determinant of success of any intervention, as the study noted in the Donor-II funded project (Graham, 2002).

Pakistan has remained a major recipient of foreign aid, as a result of different geo-political circumstances in contemporary history, whether it was the Russian invasion of Afghanistan or Pakistan's involvement in the global war on terror. However, there is a particular mismatch between the level of investment made on the development of education and the money that comes from different donors. Researchers have attributed the limited capacities of provincial and district level officials to the limited success of foreign interventions in Pakistan. One can contest the opinion of researchers regarding the limited capacities of district-level competencies; their preoccupation with their official responsibilities could be another reason for their limited contribution towards the success of these foreign interventions. Therefore, one of the important lessons drawn from this study is that only making the district officials responsible for the implementation of any intervention may not be a successful model; instead, working together as equal partners might ensure the success of foreign interventions, as this study noted. Unlike Donor-I, which was totally dependent on local administration for the implementation of its project, Donor-II entertained the local directorate of education as an equal partner, thereby maintaining a close liaison for the execution of the new teachers' development program. One can assume that this model can serve two purposes; on one hand, it can empower the local institutions, and on the other hand, working together can provide opportunities to local institutions to enhance their capacities and skills.

Proper monitoring and follow up mechanisms greatly determine the success and productivity of any foreign intervention. It has been reported that limited capacities of implementing agencies, as well as an absence of a proper monitoring system, creates opportunities for corrupt practices (Chapman, 2002). As the study noted in the Donor-I funded project, both the trainers and the trainees were less serious and less committed regarding their responsibilities. Irregularities in the maintenance of proper records of the trainees' daily attendance, and the project director's indifferent behavior regarding some of the processes of training are some of the implications regarding the absence of a proper monitoring and evaluation mechanism. Therefore, the aforementioned circumstances neutralized the productivity of the project. Although proper monitoring of their projects remained a challenging task for the donors in conflicting zones like Pakistan, there still are donors who ensured the productivity of their interventions through the involvement of a third party in the monitoring processes (Harmer, Stoddard, & Didomenico, 2011). The same pattern was also noticed in this study where monitoring and evolution through the involvement of a third party was an integral component of the Donor-II funded project. The monitoring processes cover such areas as timely provision of instructional resources, training workshops, observations of teaching practices by instructors as well as prospective teachers, reviews of portfolios developed by students, etc.

One can argue that the said project was not a complete success, keeping in view the problems faced by the students regarding employment opportunities with an ADE degree. There is no doubt that Donor-II fulfilled their responsibilities, by successfully laying the foundation of a new teachers' development program through the provision of all the required resources, and led the HEC and government of Pakistan to endorse the new program. The onus is now on government of Pakistan to address the issues of employment of ADE graduates and develop uniform policies regarding the entry requirements for the teaching profession in Pakistan, not only at the provincial levels, but also the different educational systems of Pakistan that presently follow different hiring policies for teachers. As the instructors and principals of two colleges of education asserted, the success and the continuation of the new program is contingent upon the introduction of structural reforms.

For the success of any foreign intervention, the role of both the donor agency and the recipient country is equally crucial, as the study noted, the absence of any entity could neutralize the productivity of the projects. One of the advantages of working together is that it creates opportunities for both parties to learn from each other. Since the capacities of implementing agencies of developing countries are still an area of concern, it is essential to explore new models through the involvement of non-state actors and entities. Since developing countries like Pakistan

always need the support of foreign donors for the development of its various sectors, a separate cell equipped with the required skills can be established to oversee and execute the foreign funded projects.

Reference

- Ali, S., & Ahmad, N. (2013). A Time Series Analysis of Foreign Aid and Income Inequality in Pakistan,” *Global Journal of Management and Business Research Economics and Commerce*. 13(5). 11-20.
- Auer, M. (2007). More aid, better institutions, or both? *Sustain Sci*, 2, 179-187.
- Awan, A. G. & Din, M. (2015). The Impact of Foreign Aid on Pakistan's Economy. *Sci. Int.* 27(4), 3455-3459.
- Chapman, D. (2002). Education in developing countries: Management and efficiency in education; Goals and strategies. Asian Development Bank, Comparative Education Research Center, the University of Hong Kong.
- Diamond, J. (2006). *Collapse: How Societies Choose to Fail or Succeed*. London: Penguin Books.
- Easterly, W. (2008). *Reinventing Foreign Aid*. Massachusetts: The MIT Press.
- Graham, C. (2002). Can Foreign Aid Help Stop Terrorism? Washington DC : Brookings Institute. Retrieved from <https://www.brookings.edu/articles/can-foreign-aid-help-stop-terrorism/>
- Harmer, A., Stoddard, A & Didomenico, V. (2011). Aiding education in conflict: The role of international education providers operating in Afghanistan and Pakistan. *Prospectus*, 41. 205-221.
- Khan, M.A., & Ahmed, A. (2007). Foreign Aid—Blessing or Curse: Evidence from Pakistan . *The Pakistan Development Review*. 46(3). 215-240.
- Mawdsley, E., Savage, L; & Kim, S. (2014). A ‘post-aid world’? Paradigm shift in foreign aid and development cooperation at the 2011 Busan High Level Forum. *The Geographical Journal*, 180(1), 27-60.
- Miles, W. F. (2012). Deploying Development to Counter Terrorism: Post-9/11 Transformation of U.S. Foreign Aid to Africa. *African Studies Review*. 55(3). 27-60.
- Monkam, N. F. (2012). International donor agencies’ incentive structures and foreign aid effectiveness. *Journal of Institutional Economics*. 8(3). 399-427.
- Nasir, M, Rehman, F., & Orakzai, M. (2012). Exploring the nexus: Foreign aid, war on terror, and conflict in Pakistan. *Economic Modelling*. 1138-1145.
- North, D.C. (2004). *Institutions, Institutional Change and Economic Performance*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Rana, S. (2017, September 6). War on terror aid: Pakistan received \$33.4bn from US. *The Express Tribune*. Retrieved from <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1498815/war-terror-aid-pakistan-received-33-4bn-us/>
- Riddell, A. (2012). *The effectiveness of foreign aid to education: What can be learned?* Helsinki: United Nation University
- Sachs, J. (2005). *The End of Poverty: Economic Possibilities of Our Time*. New York: Penguin Books.
- Sarwar, A., Hassan M; & Mahmood, T. (2015). Foreign Aid and Governance in Pakistan. *Pakistan Economic and Social Review*, 23(2). 149-176.
- Wane, W. (2004). *The Quality of Foreign Aid: Country Selectivity or Donors Incentives?* Washington D.C : World Bank. Retrieved from <http://idei.fr/sites/default/files/medias/doc/conf/jjl/papers/59wane.pdf>
- Winters, M. S. (2010). Accountability, Participation and Foreign Aid Effectiveness. *International Studies Review*, 12, 218-243.