

The Effect of Organizational Commitment and Work Culture on Civil Servants Public Service Performance in Tomohon's District Office

Sisca Rumambi, Evi Elvira Masengi, Wilson Bogar

Manado State University, Tondano, North Sulawesi, Indonesia Email: siscarumambi@gmail.com, eviemasengi@unima.ac.id, wilsonbogar@unima.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

Date received : 02 February 2022 This study aims to explain the commitment to public service Revision date : 11 February 2022 organizations of sub-district civil servants in Tomohon then the influence Date received : 01 March 2022 of work culture on public service performance using quantitative methods. The authors analyze and explain the influence of the variables **Keywords:** Organization, employee in the research concept model. The study results indicate that the effect performance, public services of Organizational Commitment on Public Service Performance shows a positive and significant direction. Employees who have a high organizational commitment must be selectively prepared from the start (recruitment). It is hoped that with the recruitment of employees with a merit system, employees with a high organization can carry out their functions, duties, and roles. The performance of public services shows results that organizational commitment and work culture simultaneously have a significant effect on employee performance. Moreover, the contribution of organizational commitment and work culture simultaneously to the performance of public services is 53.50%, while the other variable determines the remaining 46.50%. The conclusion of this study provides an overview of organizational and cultural commitment to the performance of civil servants as a sub-district public service in Tomohon; thus, the employees have continuity and respective roles following the existing sub-districts and functions.

INTRODUCTION

Civil servants as human resources in the organization (sub-district office) are essential and strategic assets in achieving organizational goals that have been set. The human resource management (HRM) function can help to improve organizational change (Alqudah, Carballo-Penela, & Ruzo-Sanmartín, 2022). Experts in HRM agree that Human Resources (HR) is an essential and strategic asset for all organizations, be it organizations with large or small scale or scope and types, namely business, social, and the public.

The recognition of the importance and strategic of Human Resources (HR) compared to other resources in all organizations is caused by HR will make other resources such as machinery/equipment, funds/finances, and others function optimally and adequately in achieving defined organizational goals (Bogar, 2013). In other words, the failure of the organization to achieve organizational goals that have been set is a reflection of the failure of HR in managing or utilizing the resources available within the organization effectively and efficiently, and vice versa. Therefore, for example, the central point of policy in efforts to develop government organizations (public), or known as "bureaucratic reform" in order to achieve and improve its overall performance, thus HR can contribute effectively and efficiently. Bureaucratic reform as an effort to realize a clean, accountable, effective, efficient government and provide guality services also aims to build public trust in the government (Vigoda-Gadot & Mizrahi, 2014).

How To Cite:	Rumambi, S., Masengi, E. E., & Bogar, W. (2022). The Effect of Organizational Commitment and Work Culture on
	Civil Servants Public Service Performance in Tomohon's District Office. <i>Journal of Social Science, 3</i> (2).
	https://doi.org/10.46799/jss.v3i2.320
E-Issn:	2721-5202
Published By:	Ridwan Institut

Based on Mizrahi's opinion, it was revealed that improving the performance of public services in the form of quality services is an effort and goal of bureaucratic reform at all levels of government organizations, such as at the sub-district level. The sub-district office as a service unit must provide quality services to the community as a form of service performance realized by the apparatus, in this case. These civil servants are available at the sub-district office itself. The quality of public services for the District Office Civil Servants received by the community will be responded to/assessed by the community in the form of the level of satisfaction with the services they receive (Giroth, Mandagi, & Bogar, 2022). The more in line with expectations with the reality received in the service, the more satisfied the community is with the services provided, and vice versa. Furthermore, the more satisfied the public with public services, the higher the performance of the civil servants' public services.

The opinion above indirectly confirms that the employee's performance achieved is not enough only with the individuals' knowledge and skills, but also because of an emotional bond with the organization that arises with trust, willingness to achieve a goal, and the desire to maintain membership as part of the organization. This will make employees remain in an organization both in pleasant conditions or not, encourage employess to maintain the jobs, show the results they should and good quality, more totality in work show (organizational commitment). Commitment has an essential role in an employee's performance (Robbins & Judge, 2013). Since the commitment becomes a reference and encouragement that makes them more responsible for their obligations. High organizational commitment would also increase high performance (Nurjanah & Sumarno, 2010). Work commitment had a significant positive effect on performance (Amar, 2014).

In addition, employee performance can also be influenced by work culture (Siew & Kelvin, 2004). implementation Work culture is the and actualization of one's personality that can affect the performance and goals of the organization. Culture plays a role in encouraging individuals to be creative in increasing the effectiveness of achieving goals (O'Reilly & Rez-Abreu, 1991). A practical, efficient, and accountable government organization can be realized if there is a supportive work culture to achieve goals. Good work culture is primarily aimed at improving the work ethic of all employees and officials of an organization. Building a good work ultimately building a culture and superior

organizational culture seeks to change, there are: (1) Attitude, way of feeling, way of understanding; and (2) Mindset, perspective, or way of thinking; so that it can lead to changes in behavior and actions towards improvement. Changing this mindset is believed to be more successful in making significant changes or even giant leaps than encouraging attitude changes whose results may be gradually changing and breaking bad habits or getting used to good things that are seen as more productive, more effective or perhaps more efficient.

Within the framework of bureaucratic reform, Annas (2017) explains that culture has an essential role in encouraging the realization of transparent, accountable, and quality government. Culture gives leaders and members the same belief (shared vision, values, and belief) in seeing how the organization's vision (the country) will be in the future. Culture influences the behavior, workings and motivation of leaders and government bureaucracies to achieve organizational performance, which is one of the goals of bureaucratic reform.

Based on some of the views that has been stated, it turns out that work culture affects employee performance. For this reason, it is so essential that work culture is grown and developed and internalized to all members of the organization, in this case, Civil Servant in the District Office, to achieve good values, correct beliefs guide behavior, work methods and motivate in carrying out work to achieve public service optimal performance for Civil Servants at the District Office.

However, implementing a quality work culture is still weak. There is an assumption that the work culture of the state civil apparatus, including civil servants, does not understand a positive work culture. It be seen from the assumption that civil servants' work is still routine. Even in some civil servants, work may be considered a burden and coercion, indolent people (Frinaldi, 2016). Based on the background of the problem, the authors researched the context of writing a thesis with the title The Effect of Organizational Commitment and Work Culture on the Performance of Public Service Civil Servants at District Offices in Tomohon. Does organizational commitment affect the public service performance of sub-district office civil servants in Tomohon?

Every people joins the organization or becomes a member of the organization because there is a need that wants to be fulfilled. However, that need cannot be fulfilled if it is done alone, or it is better if it is done together in an organization. The more an employee feels the organization can meet the needs or expectations, the higher his involvement in the organization or maintaining membership. This is what can be said (simply) organizational commitment. Organizational commitment is the identification and involvement of a relatively strong person in the organization, the desire of organizational members to maintain membership in the organization, and the willingness to strive to achieve organizational goals. Based on the ways to build organizational commitment that has been put forward, it turns out that leaders play a crucial role in building and maintaining, and even increasing organizational commitment from all organizational stakeholders.

Work culture is beliefs, expectations, values, and norms embodied in work attitudes and behavior to achieve optimal work results. Work culture refers to how individuals perceive their jobs and, ideally, how they might thrive in them (Nicholas, 2022). In other words, work culture is a way of looking at work. Of course, every individual or employee has their perspective in giving meaning to work. Widiyanti and Anoraga, (2003) say it is challenging to formulate clearly, precisely and concisely what is meant by the term "work". In the most modern view of work, that (1) Work is the most basic/essential part of the needs of human life. As the most fundamental part, he will give the status of the community in the environment. It can also bind other individuals whether working or not. Thus work will give the content and meaning of the human life concerned, (2) Both men and women like work. Even if the person does not like the job, this is usually due to the psychological and social conditions of the job, (3) The moral of the worker has no direct relationship with the material conditions associated with the job, and (4) Incentives from work take many forms and do not always depend on money. These incentives are things that encourage the workforce to work harder.

Public Service Performance

The concept of performance is interpreted differently by experts according to several respective points of view employee performance is a very complex multidimensional construct with many differences in the sense that it depends on who is evaluating, how it is evaluated, and what aspects are being evaluated (Supratikno, 2006).

Therefore, in Law No. 25 of 2009 concerning Public Services, the implementation of public services is not said to be the government, but only says the implementation of public services. It is emphasized in Law No. 25 of 2009 that public services are activities or series of activities in the context of fulfilling service needs by the laws and regulations for every citizen and resident of goods, services, and administrative services provided by public service providers.

METHOD

This type of research is quantitative research, using an explanatory research design (Sugiyono, 2019). Explanatory research, which analyzes and explains the influence of the variables in the research concept model. Based on the research concept model, this study analyzes and explains the effect of the variable organizational commitment and work culture on the performance of public services. The research method uses an explanatory survey.

Data was collected through a questionnaire technique, namely a closed questionnaire given to respondents who were selected as sample members (Arikunto, 2010). The questionnaire instrument or questionnaire includes three research variables, namely (1) the organizational commitment variable instrument; (2) work culture variable instrument; and the variable instrument of public service performance.

The research instrument arranged for each variable uses a measurement scale, namely the Likert scale. Each statement/statement submitted for each item is prepared with four possible answers which are expected to be chosen by the respondent according to the conditions felt and perceived by each respondent.

The instrument was tested to determine its validity and reliability before being used to collect data. Testing the validity of using correlation analysis between item scores with the total score of the instrument. The statistic used is Pearson's Product Moment correlation.

The data analysis technique used is inferential statistical analysis technique. Inferential statistical analysis using multiple regression analysis is used to test the hypothesis that has been formulated with = 0.05. Before the hypothesis were testing, the analysis requirements were tested, namely the normality and linearity tests of the data.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Overview of Research Sites

Administratively, Tomohon has 44 villages spread over five Districts with an area of 147.2178 km² or 14,721.78 ha. The boundaries of the Tomohon Government are: a) North side: is the area of North Tomohon Sub-district which borders Pineleng District and Tombulu District, Minahasa Regency; b) East side: is the area of East Tomohon District which borders Tombulu District and North Tondano District, Minahasa Regency; c) South side: is the area of South Tomohon Subdistrict which is bordered by Sonder District and Remboken District, Minahasa Regency; and d) West side: is the area of West Tomohon District which borders Tombariri District and Mandolang District, Minahasa Regency.

Based on Law Number 32 of 2004 concerning Regional Government and as implementing regional autonomy, and in accordance with the mandate of Government Regulation Number 41 of Regional 2007 concerning Apparatus Organizations that the Formation of Regional Organizations is determined Apparatus bv Regional Regulation. The District in Tomohon was established by Tomohon Regional Regulation Number 9 of 2018 concerning Amendments to Regional Regulation Number 6 of 2016 concerning Formation and Structure of Tomohon Regional Apparatus.

The organizational structure and working procedures of the District is stipulated in the Tomohon Mayor Regulation Number 47 of 2016 concerning the Elaboration of the Main Duties and Functions of the Sub-District Organizational Structure which consists of: one *Camat* (District Head), one Secretary, one Head of Sub-district General and Personnel Division, one Head of Finance and Equipment Sub-Section, one Head of Government Section, one Head of Peace & Order Section, one Head of Social Welfare Section, one Head of Public Service Section.

B. Test Requirements analysis

Normality test is a test to assess the distribution of data in a group of data or variables, whether the distribution of the data is normally distributed or not. Normality test is useful for determining the data that has been collected is normally distributed or taken from a normal population. Normality test using Kolmogorov Smirnov test. The test criteria is if the significance is above 0.05, it means that the data is normal.

C. Multicollinearity test

Multicollinearity test is a test to ascertain whether in a regression model there is intercorrelation or collinearity between independent variables. If there is multicollinearity, then a variable that is strongly correlated with other variables in the model, the predictive power is not reliable and unstable. Multicollinearity detection with VIF value, ie if the VIF value is less than 10, it can be concluded that there is no multicollinearity.

D. The Effect of Organizational Commitment on Public Service Performance

The results of study indicate the effect of Organizational Commitment on Public Service Performance shows a positive and significant direction. The influence of Organizational Commitment on Public Service Performance has a positive direction, meaning that the higher the organizational commitment of employees will contribute to improving the performance of public services. While the effect of organizational commitment on public service performance is significant, it means that the organizational commitment of employees is a factor/variable that cannot be ignored in order to improve service performance.

This can be understood by refers to several indicators of public service performance, such as (1) Reliability, the ability to provide correctly and correctly, the types of services that have been consumers/customers; promised to (2) Responsiveness, awareness or desire to help consumers and provide prompt service; (3) Assurance, knowledge or insight, courtesy, courtesy, confidence from service providers, and respect for consumers; and (4) Empathy, the willingness of service providers to approach, provide protection, and try to find out the desires and needs of consumers, it can be ascertained that the responsibility for realizing the performance of public services like this is mostly carried out by high organizational commitment employees.

The Merit System in the implementation of the management of the State Civil Apparatus is a policy and apparatus resources management based on gualifications, competence, and performance in a fair and reasonable manner without distinction of political background, race, skin color, religion, origin, gender, marital status, age, or a disability condition. This system is implemented to ensure the management of apparatus resources from recruitment based on of transparency, expected principles the accountability and equality, thus qualified, competent, integrity, and non-discriminatory employees are obtained which ultimately contribute to improving the quality of public service performance.

It is hoped that with the recruitment of employees with a merit system, employees who have a high organizational commitment to carry out their functions, duties and roles, are as (1) implementers of public policies; (1) public service; and (3) glue and unify the nation (article 10), and has the task of (1) implementing public policies made by the Civil Service Supervisory Officer in accordance with the provisions of the legislation; (2) provide professional and quality public services; and (3) strengthen the unity and integrity of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia (article 11), and play a role as a planner, implementer, and supervisor of the implementation of general government tasks and development national through the implementation of policies and public services that are professional, free from political intervention, and free from practices of corruption, collusion, and nepotism. In other words, employees who have a high commitment who are obtained (recruited) with a merit system are expected to realize excellent public service performance.

The results of this study are in line with the research of Taurisa and Intan (2012) that organizational commitment has a positive and significant effect on employee performance. Likewise, the research of Akbar, Al Musadieq, and Mukzam (2017) that simultaneously affective commitment, continuity commitment and normative commitment together (simultaneously) have a positive and significant effect on employee performance.

E. The Influence of Work Culture on Public Service Performance

The results showed that the influence of work culture on the performance of public services showed a positive and significant direction. The influence of work culture on public service performance has a positive direction, meaning the stronger the employee work culture will contribute to improving the performance of public services. While the influence of work culture on public service performance is significant, it means that employee work culture is a factor/variable that cannot be ignored in order to improve public service performance.

This can be understood since work culture is related to attitudes towards work and behavior towards work (Ndraha, 2003). Employees who view or perceive work as pleasure, enjoyment, prestige, self-actualization, and obligations will carry out the job to achieve optimal work results. Likewise behavior at work, such as diligent, dedicated, responsible, careful, thorough, careful, strong will to learn the duties and obligations, likes to help fellow employees to achieve optimal work results. For this reason, work culture must be grown and developed for all members of the organization (employees), so that it becomes a motivation for employees' values, standards, behavior and actions. Therefore, one of the goals of bureaucratic reform is to create a work culture of bureaucratic apparatus to improve the quality of public services for each element or unit of public service such as sub-district offices. According to Prasojo and Kurniawan (2008) that bureaucratic reform is not just a change in the structure and repositioning of the bureaucracy.

Moreover, bureaucratic reform must include changes in the political and legal system as a whole, changes in the attitude, mentality and culture of bureaucrats, as well as changes in the mindset and commitment of the government and political parties. Meanwhile, Hamka (2014) emphasized that bureaucratic culture is often used as the reason and cause of the low performance of the government bureaucracy. Bureaucratic culture that tends to be formalistic and insensitive to public demands, and is paternalistically oriented causes the public to be often ignored.

In autonomy region, where public service is the initial concept and reason for implementing regional autonomy, it requires a significant change in organizational culture. The expected changes are create a conducive climate to improve the performance of local government bureaucracies. All forms of changes that occur should lead to improving the quality of local government services to the public (general public, social organizations, and the business world). Therefore, the reorganization by local governments is not intended to merely meet the needs of laws or government regulations. The reorganization by the regional government regardless of its form or method should be as much as possible directed at achieving high organizational performance.

Moreover Hamka (2014) emphasized the of future development the government bureaucracy includes several alternatives: (1) The need for a mega change that is increasingly oriented to the premise of the constitution; (2) Increased conscientiousness in responding to local problems within a decentralized framework with a strong interpretation of the constitution; (3) Increasing ethics governing in implementing the government's role; (4) Alignment of the cultural character and behavior of the public policy process in a government area (policy space) by reducing command and control methods; (5) Careful inducement and dissemination of government information; (6) engineering Social that complements aovernment actions (interventions); (7)Fostering organizational culture in the context of TOC; (8) Total human resource development for the apparatus by introducing the internalization of the concept of "quality through participation". The performance of the bureaucracy, either directly or indirectly, is used as an indicator of the success of the government.

Based on the description, it can be said that the work culture that is the target of bureaucratic reform aiming to improve the performance of bureaucratic services and their apparatus.

The results of this study are in line with the research of Sari, Jonathan, and Latif (2016) who revealed that work culture has a positive and significant influence on employee performance at Kesbang Pol Kab. East Kutai. Likewise, Ichwan (2014) analyzed several indicators of organizational culture (work culture), revealed that (1) there is a significant influence between the relationship between organizations on the performance of Civil Servants, (2) there is a significant influence between supporting and appreciating the efforts of employees on the performance of Civil Servants, (3) there is a significant influence on social life in the workplace on the performance of Civil Servants.

F. The Influence of Organizational Commitment and Work Culture Simultaneously on The Public Services Performance

The results of the study indicate that organizational commitment and work culture simultaneously have a significant effect on the performance of public services for Civil Servants at the District Office in Tomohon. Moreover, the contribution or contribution of organizational commitment and work culture simultaneously to the performance of public services is 53.50%, while the rest (46.50%) is determined by other variables.

Referring to the results of the partial analysis, it can be said that the higher the organizational commitment and the stronger the work culture will improve the performance of public services. The results of this study also confirm that the variables/factors of organizational commitment and work culture only contribute to the improvement of public service performance by 53.50%. There are still other variables/factors that must be considered in an effort to improve the performance of public services. This is also in line with the goal of bureaucratic reform that has been carried out on an ongoing basis to improve the performance of public services, which not only concerns the professionalism of employees, including organizational commitment and work culture, but also concerns the structural aspects of institutions.

Adiperdana and Ak (2017) asserts that the motivation of serving will not turn into a culture of service if it is not supported by changes in the institutional structure as an example of integrated services. In the context of government, changes in the institutional structure should be directed to get the right organizational structure (rightsizing). The government must dare to take less popular actions to combine several organizations that have the same/overlapping function and if necessary remove organizations that do not provide added value to the community/government. In addition, changes in the institutional structure also include changes in the tools in it, including mechanisms/SOPs for public services that are increasingly focused on the community, changes in the performance appraisal system for bureaucratic apparatus that encourage optimal performance achievement. For example, changes in the performance of be public services should related to remuneration, meaning that when public services cannot be provided optimally, the consequence of reducing remuneration is in the context of increasing the responsibility of government bureaucratic officials. Thus, the change in the institutional structure as described above is able to encourage mental changes in the bureaucratic apparatus into a mental spirit to serve the community.

CONCLUSION

Organizational commitment has a significant effect on the public service performance of the District Office Civil Servant in Tomohon. Thus the first research hypothesis is accepted.

Work culture has a significant effect on the performance of public services for Civil Servant at the District Office in Tomohon. Thus the second research hypothesis is accepted.

Organizational commitment and work culture simultaneously have a significant effect on the performance of public services for PNS at the District Office in Tomohon. The magnitude of the contribution of organizational commitment and work culture simultaneously to the public service performance of the District Office Civil Servant in Tomohon is 53.50%, while the rest (46.50%) is contributed or determined by variables outside this research model. Thus the third research hypothesis is accepted.

Suggestion

To increase organizational commitment, the official head should disseminate the vision and mission of the organization to all employees intensively, since a clear understanding of the vision and mission of the organization will create loyalty and pride in the organization as a form of organizational commitment.

Values and norms that have been mutually agreed upon that have governed attitudes and behavior in working and interacting in the work environment, should be implemented consistently, to make it grow into a strong organizational culture and work culture.

REFERENCES

- Adiperdana, A., & Ak, M. B. A. (2017). Implementasi Reformasi Birokrasi Melalui Revolusi Mental Birokrasi Sebagai Upaya Membentuk Pemerintahan Berkelas Dunia. *Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara*, 18. Google Scholar
- Akbar, A., Al Musadieq, M., & Mukzam, M. D. (2017). *Pengaruh komitmen organisasional terhadap kinerja (Studi pada karyawan PT Pelindo Surabaya)*. Brawijaya University. Google Scholar
- Alqudah, I. H. A., Carballo-Penela, A., & Ruzo-Sanmartín, E. (2022). High-performance human resource management practices and readiness for change: An integrative model including affective commitment, employees' performance, and the moderating role of hierarchy culture. *European Research on Management and Business Economics, 28*(1), 100177. Scopus
- Amar, S. (2014). Komitmen kerja terhadap kinerja pegawai pada dinas kopperindag dan umkm kabupaten dharmasraya. *Jurnal Riset Manajemen Bisnis Dan Publik, 2*(1). Google Scholar
- Annas, A. (2017). *Interaksi pengambilan keputusan dan evaluasi kebijakan* (Vol. 1). Celebes Media

Perkasa. Google Scholar

- Arikunto, S. (2010). Metode peneltian. *Jakarta: Rineka Cipta*. Google Scholar
- Bogar, W. (2013). The Ability of Human Resources in Supporting Regional Autonomy (A Study at Employees in SITARO Regency). *IOSR Journal of Business and Management (IOSR-JBM)*, 37-44. Google Scholar
- Frinaldi, A. (2016). The Influence of Driver Work Culture and Service Quality on Citizen Satisfaction with Mass Transportation. *International Conference on Ethics in Governance (ICONEG 2016)*, 450–453. Atlantis Press. Google Scholar
- Giroth, N. K., Mandagi, M., & Bogar, W. (2022). Public Service Performance of Civil Servants (PNS) at South Tondano District Office in Minahasa Regency. *Journal of Social Science*, *3*(1), 157–170. Google Scholar
- Hamka, H. (2014). *Ketidaknetralan Birokrasi Indonesia*. Elex Media Komputindo. Google Scholar
- Ichwan, M. (2014). *Pengaruh Budaya Organisasi Terhadap Kinerja Pegawai Negeri Sipil Di Sekretariat Daerah Provinsi Kepulauan Riau*. Universitas Terbuka. Google Scholar
- Melina Taurisa, C., & Intan, R. (2012). Analisis pengaruh budaya organisasi dan kepuasan kerja terhadap komitmen organisasional dalam meningkatkan kinerja karyawan (Studi pada PT. Sido Muncul Kaligawe Semarang). *Jurnal Bisnis Dan Ekonomi*, *19*(2). Google Scholar
- Ndraha, T. (2003). Budaya organisasi. *Jakarta: Rineka Cipta*. Google Scholar
- Nicholas, R. (2022). Discovering your work culture— It is personal. *Safety and Health at Work, 13*, S104–S105. Scopus
- Nurjanah, Y., & Sumarno, J. (2010). Pengaruh Budaya Perusahaan dan Komitmen Perusahaan terhadap Intensitas Peran Akuntansi Manajemen. *Media Riset Akuntansi, Auditing & Informasi, 10*(1), 46–72. Google Scholar

Prasojo, E., & Kurniawan, T. (2008). Reformasi

Birokrasi dan Good Governance: Kasus Best Practices dari Sejumlah Daerah di Indonesia. *The 5 Th International Symposium of Jurnal Antropologi Indonesia*, 1–15. Google Scholar

- R, R., O'Reilly: esup, F., & Rez-Abreu, P. (1991). Goodness of fit for the Poisson distribution based on the probability generating function. *Communications in Statistics-Theory and Methods*, 20(10), 3093–3110. Google Scholar
- Robbins, S. P., & Judge, T. A. (2013). Organizational Behavior, 15th. *Shahrivar*, *13*, 1393. Google Scholar
- Sari, D. R., Jonathan, L. C. A. R., & Latif, I. N. (2016). Pengaruh Budaya Kerja terhadap Kinerja Pegawai pada Badan Kesatuan Bangsa dan Politik Kabupaten Kutai Timur. *Ekonomia*, 5(1), 450–455. Google Scholar
- Siew, K. J., & Kelvin, Y. (2004). Firm culture and firm performance. *Journal of Managerial Psychology*, *19*, 340–359. Google Scholar

- Sugiyono. (2019). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta. Google Scholar
- Supratikno, H. (2006). Performance Management To Create Competitive Advantage. *Yogyakarta: Graha Science*. Google Scholar
- Vigoda-Gadot, E., & Mizrahi, S. (2014). The Bureaucracy-Democracy Paradox Revisited: A Challenge to Democracy in Turbulent Times. *Managing Democracies in Turbulent Times*, 83–120. Google Scholar
- Widiyanti, N., & Anoraga, P. (2003). *Dinamika koperasi*. Google Scholar

Copyright holder:

Sisca Rumambi, Sisca Rumambi, Evi Elvira Masengi, Wilson Bogar (2022)

First publication right: Journal of Social Science

This article is licensed under:

