A Case Study on the Path to Resource Discovery

ABSTRACT

A meeting in April 2015 explored the potential withdrawal of valuable collections of microfilm held by the University of Maryland, College Park Libraries. This resulted in a project to identify OCLC record numbers (OCN) for addition to OCLC's Chadwyck-Healey Early English Books Online (EEBO) KBART file.¹ Initially, the project was an attempt to adapt cataloging workflows to a new environment in which the copy cataloging of e-resources takes place within discovery system tools rather than traditional cataloging utilities and MARC record set or individual record downloads into online catalogs. In the course of the project, it was discovered that the microfilm and e-version bibliographic records contained metadata which had not been utilized by OCLC to improve its link resolution and discovery services for digitized versions of the microfilm resources. This metadata may be advantageous to OCLC and to others in their work to transition from MARC to linked data on the Semantic Web. With MARC record field indexing and linked data implementations, this collection and others could better support scholarly research.

Collections, Discovery Tools, and Metadata Services

The University of Maryland, College Park Libraries' (the Libraries; UM Libraries) collections include 3.45 million print books and 1.2 million eBooks, 17,000 electronic journals, and 352 electronic databases.² In late 2011, the Libraries implemented WorldCat Local, OCLC's single-search-box interface to the WorldCat database of cataloged resources and a central index of metadata provided by publishers, Abstracting and Indexing Services, institutional repositories, and so on. With WorldCat Local, and later, WorldCat Discovery, OCLC utilizes a *knowledge base* in managing e-resources discovery and access.³ Knowledge bases are "associated with link resolvers and electronic resource management systems" and "contain title-level metadata, linking syntax rules, publication ranges and other data."⁴ KBART files are so named to represent files compliant with the NISO recommended practice, "Knowledge Bases and Related Tools (KBART)."⁵ KBART files, created and supplied by content providers, are used to transmit this title level metadata to knowledge base vendors and discovery service providers.⁶ Since OCLC enhances these files with OCLC numbers (OCN) in order to provide automated holdings maintenance on WorldCat bibliographic records, the Libraries' Metadata Services Department (MSD) adopted a policy in 2012 to provide access to e-resources only via WorldCat when such files are available.

Beth Guay (<u>baguay@umd.edu</u>) is Continuing Resources Librarian, University of Maryland Libraries, University of Maryland, College Park.

Space Planning

Early on, the Libraries' collection policies targeted duplicate copies of print monographs and print journals held electronically in trusted repositories, e.g., JSTOR, for deselection. By March 2014, the Libraries' Collection Development Council discussed moving microfilm collections to the yet to be opened Severn Library, slated to "house lesser used materials ... in order to free up much needed space for users and the development of new collaborative learning spaces." ^{7 8} A year later, in April 2015, a meeting was called by the Assistant Head, Collection Development, to investigate microfilm collection retention decisions. This time the Libraries were considering the withdrawal of microfilm resources for which equivalent versions were held online. A caveat placed on the withdrawal of the microfilm by the collection managers was that prior to their withdrawal and subsequent deletion of the Libraries' holdings on the WorldCat bibliographic records, the equivalent e-version resources should be made discoverable in <u>WorldCat UMD</u> (the Libraries' WorldCat Discovery implementation) by the addition of the Libraries' holdings on e-version bibliographic records corresponding to the microfilm version records.

Following the meeting, the Librarian for English, Latin American, & Latina/o Studies and Second Language Acquisition provided the Continuing and Electronic Resources Cataloger (C-ER Cataloger) with a list of eight valuable microfilm collections of resources and for each, the name of the comparable online collection (or e-collection) subscribed to. It was agreed that the C-ER Cataloger would investigate to determine if any of those microfilm collections could be withdrawn in compliance with the collection managers' caveat. In other words, the C-ER Cataloger's mission was to ensure a one-to-one correspondence of electronic and microfilm version bibliographic records for the equivalent versions of the resources.

One of the e-collections added to the WorldCat Knowledge Base (WCKB) by the Libraries was Gale's, The Making of the Modern World, 1450-1850: Part I collection (MOMW). This collection is comprised of digitized versions of Gale's microfilm resources in the series, *The Goldsmiths'-Kress library of economic literature*.⁹ A KBART file was derived from the Libraries' MOMW MARC record set and uploaded to the WCKB sandbox where it supports the Libraries' access to the e-version resources. The MOMW MARC record set had been reviewed and vetted by the Libraries prior to its purchase, and upon its purchase, Gale had set the Libraries' holdings on the WorldCat bibliographic records representing the resources. With this information in mind, the C-ER Cataloger determined that the MOMW e-resource bibliographic records were comparable to those representative of the Libraries' corresponding *Goldsmiths'-Kress library of economic literature* microfilm collection, thus meeting the collection managers' criteria for deselection. The 3380 reels that could be withdrawn comprised a small but not insignificant allotment of physical space in the library.

Provision of discoverability of equivalent e-versions of resources held in other collections proved difficult. For example, the corresponding microfilm collections represented in the WCKB's British Periodicals Collections I and II were held in the series, *Early British periodicals* and *English literary*

periodicals.¹⁰ The Libraries had cataloged 186 individual serial titles in the microfilm series, *Early British periodicals* in 2002, but none in the series, *English literary periodicals*. Thus the objective would have been to ensure discoverability for the equivalent electronic versions of the Libraries' 186 cataloged microfilm versions in the Early British periodicals series. At the time of this investigation, there were 580 British Periodicals I and II KBART file title entries; 390 of which had OCN. Whereas the OCN of The Making of the Modern World, 1450-1850: Part I WCKB collection were known entities, the OCN of the remaining e-collections had yet to be vetted. Thus the British Periodicals Collections I and II records were spot checked for evaluation. The quality of the 390 OCLC records ranged from excellent, e.g., OCLC record #297425799, to poor, e.g. #818401694 (see Figure 1, 2, 3, and 4). MARC record images in Figures 1-4 are sourced from OCLC's Connexion cataloging client interface to the WorldCat bibliographic database. Figures 1 and 2 represent a microfilm version record and a comparable "excellent" quality record given for the resource in the WorldCat Knowledge Base, while Figures 3 and 4 represent a microfilm version and comparable "poor" quality record given for the resource in the WCKB. Note that the C-ER Cataloger's definition of an excellent quality e-version record was one which provided metadata comparable to those of its equivalent microfilm version record; likewise, a poor quality record lacked comparable metadata. In other words, an excellent quality record was viewed as a guarantor of a discoverable resource, while a poor quality record was viewed as an obstacle to discovery. For this WCKB collection, the C-ER Cataloger determined that staff expertise with serial bibliographic records was required, and due to MSD staffing limitations, moved ahead to examine the other collections.

OCLC	7	182931 No holdings in UMC - 80 other holdings
Save File	2	14 No UMC holdings in GLIMIR cluster; 82 other holdings in GLIMIR cluster of 2
		Expires in 14 days
Cont	inuir	In the second s
Type	а	ELVI Srce c GPub Ctrl Lang eng
<u>BLvi</u>	s	<u>Form</u> a <u>Conf</u> 0 <u>Freq</u> m <u>MRec</u> <u>Ctry</u> enk
<u>S/L</u>	0	<u>Orig</u> <u>EntW</u> <u>Regl</u> r <u>Alph</u> a
Desc	а	<u>SrTp</u> p <u>Cont</u> <u>DtSt</u> d <u>Dates</u> 1817 , 1826
	_	
007		h +b d +d a +e f +f b +g b +h a +i c +j a
010		sf 98092863
040		UMI +b eng +c UMI +d OCL +d DLC +d OCLCQ +d WAU +d CLU +d OCLCQ +d OCLCF +d FHL +d OCLCO +d OCL
012		‡i 9804
019		27824439
037		CL0038000002 +b University Microfilms International
037		+b University Microfilms International, 300 N. Zeeb Rd., Ann Arbor, MI 48106
042		pcc
043		e-uk
050	0 0	Microfilm 01105 reel 68-72
050	1 4	AD4E
090		+b
049		UMCP
245	0 4	The Edinburgh magazine and literary miscellany +h [microform].
260		Edinburgh : +b Printed for Archibald Constable, +c 1817-1826.
300		18 v. ; +c 21 cm.
310		Monthly
362	0	Vol. 80 (Aug. 1817)-v. 97 (June 1826) = new ser., v. 1-18.
533		Microfilm. +b Ann Arbor, Mich. : +c University Microfilms International, +d 1951. +e 5 microfilm reels ; 35 mm. +f (English literary periodicals ; reels 68-72). +n Reel no. varies with microfilm publication: 4E.
650	0	English literature +v 19th century +x History and criticism +v Periodicals
651	0	Great Britain +x Politics and government +v 1800-1837 +v Periodicals.
650		
650		Politics and government #2 fast #0 (OCol C)tst01919741
651		Great Britain +2 fast +0 (OCol C)/st01204623
651		/ Scotland +x History +x Periodicals +2 fssh
651		Great Britain +x History +x Periodicals +2 fissh
648	-	/ 1800-1899 #2 fast
655	-	/ Criticism interpretation etc +2 fast +0 (OCol C)fst01411635
655	-	Periodicals +2 fast +0 (OCol C)(st01411641
780	0 0) #t Scots manazine and Edinburgh literary miscellany #w (DLC)sf 98093126 #w (OCoLC)7182881
830	-) English literary periodicals : ±v 68-72
830	0	English literary periodicals : +v 4E.
850		DLC
029	1	AU@ #b 000013902095
029	1	FHL #b (UtSIES)359773

Figure 1. Microfilm version record

<u>OCLC</u>		297	425799	Held	by UN	1C - 2	0 oth	er holdir	ıgs;	1 other IR				
Save File		8		1 UN	IC hok	ding ir	n GLII	MIR clus	ster;	112 other hold	ings in	GLIMIR	clu	uster of 4
Con	tinu	uina F	Resource	es 🔻	Rec	stat	с	Enter	ed	20090107		Replace	ed	20150522224025.6
Type	а	1	ELVI K		Srce	d		GPub	7	Ctrl		Lan	- - e	eng
<u>BLvl</u>	s		Form o		Conf	0		Freq	m	MRec		Ctry	s	stk
<u>S/L</u>	0		Orig		<u>EntW</u>			Regl	r	Alph				
Desc	a		<u>SrTp</u> p	, i	Cont			DtSt	d	Dates	1817	, 18	26	
	-	_	_											
007	1	4	c‡br‡	ŧd u ‡e	n ‡fu:	‡g	‡h u :	‡iu‡ja	‡k u	‡la				
040			OCLC	E ‡b en	g ‡c C	CLC	E ‡d C	DCLCQ	‡d C	OCLCF #d OCL	.CO ‡0	1 OCL ‡c	100	CLCO
043			e-uk	-										
050	1	4	AP3 #b	.E35										
090	1		‡b											
049	1		UMCP											
245	0	04	The Ec	dinburg	h maga	azine	and lit	terary m	isce	llany ‡h [electr	onic re	source]		
260	1		Edinbu	irgh : #b	o Printe	ed for	Archi	ibald Co	nsta	ble and Co., ‡o	: [1817	-1826]		
310	1		Monthl	У										
362	0	0	Vol. 1 ((Aug. 1	817)-v	. 18 (June	1826).						
515			Vols. a	lso nun	nbered	l v. 80)-97 ir	n contin	uatio	n of the numbe	ring of	The Sco	ots r	magazine and Edinburgh literary miscellany, and include added t.p. for this title.
588			Descri	ption ba	ased o	n prir	t vers	sion rec	ord.					
651		0	Great	Britain 4	tx <u>Poli</u>	tics a	nd qo	vernmei	<u>nt</u> ‡y	19th century \$	v <u>Peri</u>	odicals.		
650		0	English	n literatı	<u>ure</u> ‡y	<u>19th</u>	centu	ry ‡x <u>Hi</u>	story	and criticism :	tv <u>Peri</u>	iodicals.		
650		7	English	n literatı	ure. ‡2	fast	ŧ0 (O	CoLC)fs	st009	911989				
650		7	Politics	and go	overnn	nent ‡	2 fast	t ‡0 (OC	oLC)fst01919741				
651		7	Great	Britain.	‡2 fas	t ‡0 ((OCoL	C)fst01	2046	23				
648		7	1800 -	1899 ‡	2 fast									
655		7	Criticis	m, inter	rpretat	ion, e	tc. ‡2	fast ‡0	(00	oLC)fst014116	35			
655		7	Periodi	icals. ‡2	2 fast 1	ŧ0 (O	CoLC)fst0141	164	1				
776	0	0 8	‡i Print	versio	n: #t E(dinbu	rgh m	agazine	and	literary miscell	any ‡v	v (DLC)s	in 9	99048558 ‡w (OCoLC)13409687
780	0	0 0	#t Scot	ts maga	zine a	nd Eo	linbur	gh litera	ry m	iscellany				

Figure 2. Excellent quality e-version record — OCN in the KB file

Continuing Department - Rec stat o Entered 10000222 Depleced 20160024405547.4	
Continuing Resources V Recisial C Linered 19000222 Replaced 20100921195517.1	
Type a ELvi Srce d GPub Ctrl Lang eng	
BLvI s Form a Conf 0 Freq m MRec Ctry enk	
<u>S/L 0 Oriq EntW Regi</u> r <u>Alph</u> a	
Desc a <u>SrTp</u> p <u>Cont</u> <u>DtSt</u> d <u>Dates</u> 1883 , 1889	
007 h ‡b d ‡d a ‡e f ‡f b ‡g b ‡h a ‡i c ‡j a	
010 sf 96091352	
040 ORY #b eng #c ORY #d DLC #d OCLCQ #d OCLCG #d CUS #d OCLCA #d OCLCF #d OCLCO #d OCLCQ	
012 ‡i 9607	
042 msc	
043 e-uk	
050 0 0 Microfilm 05419	
050 1 4 HX3 #b .T7	
090 #b	
049 UMCP	
130 0 To-day (London, England : 1883)	
245 1 0 To-day : to monthly magazine of scientific socialism.	
246 3 0 Today	
260 London : #b British Print. and Pub. Co., #c [1883-1889]	
300 volumes	
310 Monthly	
336 text #b bd #2 rdacontent	
337 microform #b h #2 rdamedia	
338 microfilm reel #b hd #2 rdacarrier	
362 0 Vol. 1 (Apr. 1883)-v. 2 (Dec. 1883); new ser., v. 1 (Jan. 1884)-v. 11 (June 1889) = No. 1-67.	
500 Editor: 1884- E.B. Bax, J.L. Joynes.	
500 Imprint varies.	
500 Subtitle varies.	
500 Title from caption.	
500 Film copy lacks: v. 2 (OctDec. 1883).	
533 Microfilm. #b Ann Arbor, Mich. : #c University Microfilms International. #e 1 microfilm reel ; 35 mm. #f (Early British periodic	als).
650 0 <u>Socialism</u> ‡v <u>Periodicals.</u>	
650 0 <u>Socialism</u> ‡z <u>Great Britain</u> ‡v <u>Periodicals.</u>	
650 7 Socialism. #2 fast #0 (OCoLC)fst01123637	
651 7 Great Britain. #2 fast #0 (OCoLC)fst01204623	
655 7 Periodicals. #2 fast #0 (OCoLC)fst01411641	
700 1 Bax, Ernest Belfort, #d 1854-1926.	
700 1 <u>Joynes, J. L.</u> ‡q <u>(James Leigh),</u> ‡d <u>-1893.</u>	
785 0 0 #t International review (London, England : 1889)	

Figure 3. Microfilm version record

<u>OCLC</u> Save File		81	840 [.]	694	He	ld by Ul	/IC - 3	7 oth	er holdi	ngs					
0010110	_														
Con	ntin	uing	Res	ource	s .	Rec	: stat	с	Enter	red	20120420	R	eplaced	201	21210223208.5
Туре	a	1	EL	<u>vi</u> N	4	Srce	d		<u>GPub</u>	u	Ctrl		Lang	eng	
<u>BLvl</u>	s	;	Fo	rm o		Conf	0		Freq	u	MRec		Ctry	xx	
<u>S/L</u>	0)	0	iq		<u>EntW</u>			Regl	u	Alph				
Desc	2		Sr	Тр		Cont			<u>DtSt</u>	u	Dates	uuuu	, 9999)	
	_	_	_												
006	6		n	I O	d∎										
007	7		c	≠br‡	ŧd m =	ŧen ‡fu									
040)		E	UX ‡o	EU)	K ‡d OC	LCQ								
022	2		\$	y 204	4-648	54									
090)		\$	b											
049	9		l	MCP											
130)	0	1	o-day	(On	line)									
248	5	1	0 1	o-day	/ ‡h [e	electron	ic res	ource].						
260)		\$	b Briti	sh Pr	int. and	Pub.	Co.							
506	6		A	cces	s may	/ be res	tricted	l to au	uthorize	d Ur	niversity of Edin	burgh us	ers.		
538	3		N	lode o	ofaco	cess: W	orld W	/ide V	/eb.						
776	6		4	t To-d	lav Þ	c 2044-6	454								

Figure 4. Poor quality e-version record — OCN in the KB file

In an investigation into OCLC's Chadwyck-Healey Early English Books Online (EEBO) KBART file, for which equivalent e-versions of microfilm resources in the series *Early English books, 1475-1640* and *Early English books, 1641-1700* are held, it was found that the availability of comparable e-version bibliographic records was optimal.¹¹ In consultation with the MSD department head, a project to ensure the discoverability of equivalent e-versions of the Libraries' 5,062 cataloged microfilm resources in the series, *Early English books, 1475-1640* was initiated. The C-ER Cataloger had hoped to follow with a similar effort for the Libraries' resources in the series *Early English books, 1641-1700* (represented by 41,306 records in the Libraries' Integrated Library System).

Background: EEBO, Related Resources and Bibliographic Records

Much has been written on EEBO's inception and continuing development as a collection of digital reproductions of microfilm reproductions of pre-1700 print resources, and on its scholarly value (Kitchuk, 2007; Martin, 2007; Gadd, 2009; Mak, 2013; Folger Shakespeare Library, 2015).¹²

Alfred Pollard and Gilbert Redgrave's *A short-title catalogue of books printed in England, Scotland,* & *Ireland and of English books printed abroad, 1475-1640* ("STC"), and the "companion" volume, Donald Wing's Short-title catalogue of books printed in England, Scotland, Ireland, Wales, and British America, and of English books printed in other countries, 1641-1700 ("Wing"), respectively, were used in selecting the print resources for filming.¹³ Gadd (2009, 683) pinpointed the STC as "a catalogue of editions (or more accurately, editions and issues) not copies although, of course, the

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY AND LIBRARIES | SEPTEMBER 2017



information about any edition is derived primarily from the surviving copies ... Each entry gives the location of known copies ..." $^{\rm 14}$

The "successor" to STC and Wing, the *English Short Title Catalog* (ESTC), "includes records for every item listed in STC, every item in Wing, every item in the *Eighteenth Century Short Title Catalogue* ... and newspapers and other serials which began publication before 1801" and is freely available online from the British Library.¹⁵ ¹⁶

Gadd (2009, 685-686) offered this critique concerning EEBO's bibliographic data and relationship to the ESTC:

EEBO's relationship with the original STC and Wing is straightforward and clear; EEBO's relationship with electronic ESTC, on the other hand, is less well-known. A series of agreements made between ESTC and University Microfilms/ProQuest between 1989 and 1997 allowed EEBO to draw directly on ESTC's existing bibliographical data ... EEBO heavily edited ESTC's data for its own purposes; certain categories of data were removed (e.g. collations, Stationer's Register entrances), some information was amended (e.g., subject headings), and some was added (e.g. microfilm specific details). Second, there is no formal mechanism for synchronizing the data between the two resources. Occasionally, snapshots of data are sent by EEBO to ESTC but there is no guarantee that a correction or revision made to an ESTC entry will be replicated in the corresponding EEBO or vice-versa: neither ESTC nor EEBO will necessarily know when the other made a correction.¹⁷

Gadd postured that "as both resources continue to amend and expand their bibliographical data for their own purposes, there is an increasing likelihood of significant discrepancy between the two resources."¹⁸ He did not further address the quality of the bibliographic records describing the EEBO versions of the resources; perhaps he was unaware of the sources of the EEBO bibliographic data.

Microfilm version bibliographic records serve as the basis of the metadata describing the EEBO version resources. According to ProQuest, "MARC records (from which EEBO Bibliographic records derive) are produced for the microfilm collection Early English Books (EEB) after they are filmed."¹⁹ OCLC's cataloging database has served as one source of microfilm version records for titles in the series since the 1980s. In 1984, the Association of Research Libraries (1984, p. J-3) reported that one library had "input an indeterminate amount [of bibliographic records] into OCLC" for *Early English books*, *1475-1640*, and that one had "input records for an indeterminate percentage of the set into OCLC" for resources in the series, *Early English books 1641-1700.*²⁰ The cataloging sources of these microfilm resources have varied over time, from cooperative projects to UMI/ProQuest staff to individual libraries, however, adherence to standards has characterized the totality of the efforts invested. Joachim (1993, p. 111) described the cooperative effort begun in 1984 by the Indiana University Libraries, University of California, Riverside, University of Delaware, and the University of Utah to catalog microfilm version resources cataloged by *Wing*:

In order to maintain standards and consistency among the five libraries, the project director prepared a "Wing STC Project manual." The manual includes general information, information on authority work, a bibliography, a discussion of special cataloging problems and procedures, sample records, and database input guidelines.²¹

OCLC's MARC records for the microfilm and EEBO version resources contain note fields identifying the locations of the print copies filmed and subsequently reproduced digitally by UMI/ProQuest. Gadd (2009, p. 686) emphasized the importance of this information to scholars in stating that "different copies from the same edition might vary, sometimes markedly."²²

As to Gadd's (2009) critique concerning the lack of a formal synchronization mechanism and increasing likelihood of discrepancies between EEBO and ESTC, further examination of EEBO and ESTC bibliographic record displays such as those shown in Figures 5 and 6 suggest that the British Library is working with ProQuest to align their data. It appears a focus of the British Library may be to inform the scholar of the availability of the microfilm and electronic versions of the print resources. In its ESTC overview, the British Library states that "the existence of selected … printed and digital surrogates within products such as Early English Books Online … is … noted" in its records and that its records "act as an index to several major research microform series … including *Early English Books*, 1475-1640 … [and] *Early English books*, 1641-1700."²³



Figure 5. EEBO bibliographic record for the resource cited by STC 2nd edition entry 9164 and reproduced from the copy held at the Society of Antiquaries, London.

Record 1 out of 1	← Previous record Next record →
ESTC System No.	006198647
ESTC Citation No.	S3614
Author - corporate	England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)
Title	By the King a proclamation for the apprehending and due punishing of the
	late mutiners at Wellington in the county of Somerset.
Variant title	• Proclamation for the apprehending and due punishing of the late mutiners at Wellington in the county of Somerset
Publisher/year	Imprinted at London : By Robert Barker, Printer to the Kings most Excellent
,	Majestie: And by the Assignes of John Bill, 1640.
Physical descr.	[2] leaves. 2º(2).
General note	Caption title.
	Imprint from colophon.
	Imperfect: faded, and with broken type, and loss of print.
	"Given at Our Court at Whitehall, the four and twentieth day of luly, in the
	sixteenth yeer of Our Reign."
	Format from STC.
Uncontrolled note	Verify Steele AG.
	Unedited record.
Citation/references	STC (2nd ed.), 9164
	Steele, I, 1824
Surrogates	Microfilm. Ann Arbor, Mich. : UMI, 1985. 1 microfilm reel ; 35 mm. (Early English books, 1475-1640 ; 1877:51)
Loc. of filmed copy	Lsa.
Subject	Mutiny England.
	•Wellington Mutiny, 1640.
Subject	Great Britain History Charles I, 1625-1649.
Added name	Charles I, King of England, 1600-1649.
Copies - Brit.Isles	 Canterbury Cathedral Library (Includes the Mendham Coll. Law Society
	books from London, & Canterbury Corporation Archives)
	Oxford University, Queen's College
	Privy Council Office
	 The John Rylands Library, The University of Manchester
	<u>The National Archives</u>
Copies - Europe	 Niedersachsische Staats- und Universitatsbibliothek
Copies - N.America	Private Collections
Electronic location	Early English Books Online (EEBO) ; { Reproduction of original in: Society of Antiquaries. }

Figure 6. ESTC catalog record for STC 2nd edition, entry 9164 (<u>http://estc.bl.uk/S3614</u>). The code, "Lsa" given as "Loc. Of filmed copy" is the British Libraries' MARC code for the Society of Antiquaries Library. ²⁴

Finally, to add to this mix of print, microfilm, and EEBO digitized images, XML/SGML versions of the resources are being created by the Text Creation Partnership (TCP), formed in 1999 by the university libraries of Michigan and Oxford, ProQuest, and the Council on Library and Information Resources, to provide full text search capability.²⁵ Catalog records describing TCP versions are available in WorldCat. According to the TCP, "the TCP does not have the resources to create new catalog records for each text we produce (though you are welcome to do so, and if you are willing to share them we would be very glad to know about it)."²⁶

The UM Libraries' EEBO Project

The OCLC EEBO KBART file, which contained 129,544 title entries when downloaded, 58,518 of which lacked OCN, was combined with a file extracted from the 5,062 MARC records that represented the microfilm resources. The merged file was to be used as a tool in identifying the OCN of the equivalent e-versions of the microfilm resources held. The plan was to add the e-version OCN to the EEBO KBART file via OCLC's OCN correction form.²⁷

Significant time was spent developing and documenting procedures by which staff could perform the work of identifying OCN for addition to the EEBO file. The basic procedures are as follows: (1) via the OCLC Connexion cataloging client, search and retrieve the e-version record using the microfilm version record data; (2) use titles and/or OCN of the microfilm version record to identify the comparable EEBO resource in the KBART file; (3) view the EEBO resource record using the URL in the file; and (4) record the OCN of the matching e-version record in the appropriate row/column of the file.²⁸

Subsequently, two MSD staff members were recruited to assist in the effort. In early November and mid-December, 2015, training sessions were held with both staff, followed by an individual session with each. Before the year's end, each staff member had successfully completed an assigned number of "titles" for review. Importantly, from the initial investigative work, a KBART file with 50 OCN was compiled and submitted to OCLC. Confirmation from OCLC Customer Support was given that the file would be loaded. Due to the ongoing developmental status of OCLC's services, the OCN were not loaded into the WCKB until June 2016. However, a second file sent in April 2016 was loaded in June as well. The number of OCN added to the WorldCat Knowledge Base from the project's inception through 2016 was small due to staffing issues. The average staff time to complete a microfilm/equivalent e-version title entry in the KBART file was 13 minutes.²⁹

As the project progressed, staff following the procedures confirmed that some OCN in the EEBO KBART file were incorrect. Most often, the "errors" stemmed from the attribution of TCP or German language of cataloging record OCN to the EEBO version resources. These TCP and German language of cataloging records correctly corresponded to matching EEBO version resources, however, TCP version records refer to XML/SGML encoded text editions; secondly, OCLC attempts to prefer English language of cataloging records over others in its knowledge base.³⁰

Other OCN errors seriously detract from the WCKB's EEBO file's value. For example, WorldCat record number 606541404 describes the "fourth edition very much enlarged" of "*A Most exact catalogue of the Lords spirituall and temporall, as peers of the realme, in the higher House of Parliament, according to their dignities, offices, and degrees: some other called thither for their assistance, & officers of their attendances …" yet this OCN in the WorldCat Knowledge Base's EEBO KBART file links to an EEBO record describing the "third edition much enlarged." See Figure 8 illustrating the WorldCat UMD record which links to an EEBO resource record describing the "third edition much enlarged." Note that the OCLC record (as seen in the Connexion client view of the record in Figure 9) is cited by STC (2nd ed.) 7746.3 while the EEBO version record linked to is cited by STC (2nd ed.) 7746.2. To make matters worse, the author determined that the corresponding image associated with the EEBO catalog record cited by STC 7746.2 and displayed at the site corresponded to neither resource cited as STC 7742.2 and STC 7746.3. These were both printed in 1628, but the image provided at the EEBO site was of a resource printed in 1640 (see Figure 10).*

 Construction of the partial construction of the contexport of the contexpor	A A A A				Eile Edit View History Bookmarks	Iools Help
Important product statute data and a product of the part for the part for the for the part for the for the part for the part for the part for the part for the	× 😽 University of Maryl	and Libr 🗙 👘 Search Res	ults (umarylandi × +		Full Record - EEEO.	
State I understand come I down down down down down down down down	8tqueryString=no%3A6065414048	tumdlib=	80% C Q Search	☆ 自 🗢 🖡 ♠ 🚍	(eebo.chadwyck.com/search/f	full_rec?SOURCE=config.cfg&AC 120% C Q Search 🏠 💼 😎 🦊 🍙 🚍
Description Description Description Provide URL • base of the provide served • conserved served • conserved served • conserved served • base of the provide served • conserved served • conserved served • conserved served • base of the provide served • conserved served • conserved served • conserved served • base of the provide served • conserved served • conserved served • conserved served • base of the provide served served • conserved served • conserved served • conserved served serve		auto Login 🛛 🎹 The Catalogi	ng Calcul 🔄 🕛 Authors I Digital Library 🎓 Request ISSN for Sepal	Collection Developme	Most Visited Submit an Aleph Re	equ Cataloger's Desktop 式 RDA Toolkit 📮 ClassWeb Auto Login 🏢 The Cataloging Calcul 🔹
Description Date: 1628 • Instructions • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Instructions • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Instructions • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Print record as: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Instructions • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Instructions • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Print called bitther for the counts • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Instructions • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Instructions • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Print called bitther • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: • Comp from: •		are cognine and the betalog.			Key: RECORD COCUMENT IMA	GE BILLUSTRATION
Autocci Secci View this document as: ■ ■ I Share A most exact catalogue of the Lords spiritual and temporal, as peers of the realme, in the higher House of Parliament, according to their dignities, onfices, and degrees: some other called thirther for their assistance, & officers of their attendances : And also the names of the for their assistance, & officers of their attendances and also the names of the horoughs, and barons for the ports for the House of Commons, for this Parliament, According to their attendances and also the names of the and king that of England made by King lames, and king Charles. A woot exact catalogue of the Lords spiritual and temporal, as person for the boroughs, and barons for the ports for the House of Commons, for this Parliament. Whereunto is added a catalogue of the nobility of Ireland: the kinghts baronets and king Charles. A woot exact catalogue of the couldes, citizens, burgesses for the boroughs, and baronets for the ports for the House of Commons, for this Parliament. Whereunto is added the names of the kinghts of the and king Charles. Imprint: London: Parliament, Where words add wides, Parliament, Charles, Litzens, burgesses for the boroughs, and baronets, made by King Iames, and King Charles. Author: Anton. Imprint: London: Parliament, Where words add wides, Parliament, Where words add wide add wides add wides add wides, Parliament, Where words add wi	36541404		Q	Library Links 👻 Staff Sign In		
 A most exact catalogue of the Lords spiritual and temporal, as peers of the realment, in the higher House of Parliament, according to their dighties, offices, and degrees: some other called thither for their assistance, & fices of their attendances : And also the names of the knights for the counties, citizens, burgesses for the boroughs, and barons for the ports for the House of Commons, for this Parliament. Whereunto is added a catalogue of the holity of Ireland: the knights baronets and Knights of the bath of England made by King Iames, and King Charles. • Weintrons • Weint			Advanced Search		View this document as:	(b) (b)
A most exact catalogue of the Lords spiritual and temporal, as peers of the realme, in the higher House of Parliament, according to their dignities, offices, and degrees; some other called thither for their assistance, 8, officers of their attendances : And also the names of the knights for the counties, citizens, burgesses for the boroughs, and barons for the ports for the House of Parliament. Whereauto is added a catalogue of the nobility of Ireland: the knights baronets and knights of the eaststance, 8, officers of their assistance, 8, officers of the house of the knights of the Baby officers, and Baby and baronets, and baronets, and baronets, made by King Iames, and King Charles. Author: London: Printed for Thomas Walkly, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Child as their Burden Burse,				* MyLia	Print record as:	Text (Short Record)
Image: Share - to interval and the contrast production andef productin and the contrast production and the con		a ment event est	leave of the Levile envirtual and		Add to your Maniford 15	-t
Image: Some other called thither for their assistance, & degrees: some other called thither for their assistance, & file: A Most exact catalogue of the Lords spiritual and temporali, as Peers of the realme, in the higher House of Parliament, according to their dignities, offices, and degrees, some other called thither for their assistance, & file: A Most exact catalogue of the Lords spiritual and temporali, as Peers of the realme, in the higher House of Parliament, according to their dignities, offices, and degrees, some other called thither for their assistance, & officers of their attendances: A didge of the nobility of Ireland: the knights baronets and knights of the bath of England made by King lames, and King Charles. • Methods: • Officers of their attendances: A didge de catalogue of the nobility of Ireland: the knights baronets and knights of the bath of England made by King lames, and King Charles. • Author: • Author: • Author: • Methods: • Control 1000 • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: Colem Park • Author: • Author: • Methods: • Control 1000 • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: • Control 1000 • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: • Condon: Parliament: • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: Colem Park • Methods: • Con	•¢ Share →	femporall, as pee	rs of the realme, in the higher House of	Close Rem Detail		
1 2 save degrees: some other called thither for their assistance, & form of the also the names of the knights for the counties, citizens, burgesses for the buse of form of their assistance, & form of the in advantances : And also the names of the knights for the counties, citizens, burgesses for the buse of Commons, for this Parliament. Whereunto is added a catalogue of the nobility of ireland: the knights baronets and knowns, for this Parliament. Whereunto is added a catalogue of the nobility of ireland: the knights baronets and knowns, for this Parliament. Whereunto is added a catalogue of the nobility of ireland: the knights baronets and knowns, for this Parliament. Whereunto is added the names of the knights of the baroughts, and barons for the ports for the House of Commons, for this and knights of the baroughts for the counties, citizens, burgesses for the boroughts, and barons for the ports for the House of Commons, for this and knights of the baroughts for the counties, citizens, burgesses for the boroughts, and barons for this Parliament. Whereunto is added a catalogue of the nobility of ireland: the knights baronets and ako the fragment and be to get the other state of the knights of the base of the knights. The burgesses is the knight is the base of the knights of the base of the knights of the base of the knights of the base of the knights. The burgesses is the knight is the the signet of the base of the knights for the countes, citizens, burgesses for the base of the knights for the countes, citizens, burgesses for the base of the knights of the base of the knights for the countes, citizens, burgesses for the base of the knights of the base of the knights the the signet of the knights of the base of		Parliament, accor	ding to their dignities, offices, and	🔩 Share 👻	Title:	A Most exact catalogue of the Lords spiritual and temporall, as
 Instruction officers of their attendances : And also the names of the contexp. Some other called thither for the countes, citizens, burgesses for the boroughs, and barrons for this partialment. Whereuruto is added a catalogue of the nobility of Ireland: the knights barronets and knights of the boroughs, and barronets, for this Parliament. Whereuruto is added the names of the knights of the countes, citizens, burgesses for the boroughs, and barronets, for this Parliament. Whereuruto is added the names of the knights of the boroughs, and barronets, for this Parliament. Whereuruto is added the names of the knights of the barrow of the knights of the boroughs, and barronets, made by King Iames, and King Charles. International the state of t	57 Save	degrees: some of	ther called thither for their assistance, &	66 Cite		Peers of the realme, in the higher House of Parliament, according to
 Wights for becompared by Nuclear Set for the Yours of Commons, for the ports for the House of Commons, for the ports for the House of Commons, for the ports for the House of Commons, for the port is added a catalogue of the noblify of Irelands. During the House of Commons, for the port is the knyths barnets and king that of the bath of England made by King lames, and barons for the ports for the House of Commons, for the port of the House of Commons, for the port of the house of Commons, for the port is the knyths barnets and king that of the bath of England made by King lames, and barons for the ports for the House of Commons, for the port of the knyths for the counties, ended with the ports for the House of Commons, for the port of the barnet is added the names of the knyths of the bath of England made by King lames, and King Charles. 		officers of their at	tendances : And also the names of the	☆ Save ≡		their dignities, offices, and degrees, some other called thither for
Borolging intentions many place interpolation for the source of the known for the ports for the boroughs, and baroness, for this Partiament. Where went is ada data a catalogue of the nobility of freiand: the knights baronets and knights of the boroughs, for this and baroness for the boroughs of the holity of the interpolation of the holity of the interpolation of the knights baronets and knights of the baronets, burgesses for the boroughs, for this and baroness for the holity of the interpolation of the knights baronets and knights of the baronets, made by King tames, and King Charles. Author: Anon. Imprint: London : Printed for Thomas Walky, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Child at Brittains Bursse, 1628. Description Description Description: London: Printed by Nicholas Chell of Thomas Walky, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Child at Brittains Bursse, 1628. Date: 1628 Bib name / number: STC (2nd ed.) / 7746.2 Physical description: [2], 10, [3] p. Notes: [Edition statement:] The third edition much enlarged. Signatures: A-BB C7. Reproduction of orginal in the Harvard University. Library. Copy from: Harvard University Library UMI Collection / STC / 1227:24		horoughs and ba	rons for the ports for the House of			their assistance, & officers of their attendances and also the names
eatalogue of the nobility of Ireland: the knights baronets and karons for the ports for the House of Commons, for this Parliament : whereunto is added the names of the knights of the Bath, and baronets, made by King Iames, and King Charles. Author: Anon. Imprint: London : Printed for Thomas Walkly, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Childe at Brittains Bursse, 1628. Date: 1628 Date: 1628 Date: 1628 Date: 1628 Date: If the add the names of the August Signatures: A-B8 C7. Reproduction of original in the Harvard University. Library. Eagle and Child at Brittame Burste, 1528 Physical Description: Tooline source (2), 10, (3) page) Tooline source (2), 10, (3) page Tooline		Commons, for thi	s Parliament. Whereunto is added a			of the knights for the counties, citizens, burgesses for the boroughs,
• Instructions and knights of the bath of England made by King lames, and King Charles. • Instructions by England Charles. • Instructions Condon : Printed [by Nichlas Charles for Thomas Wakkey, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Child at Bittianes Burster, fical. • Description London : Printed [by Nichlas Charles for Thomas Wakkey, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Child at Bittianes Burster, fical. • Description London : Print		catalogue of the r	obility of Ireland: the knights baronets			and barons for the ports for the House of Commons, for this
• Individual and King Charles. Bath, and baronets, made by King Iames, and King Charles. • Individual for Understand Wilks Putament. Bath, and baronets, made by King Iames, and King Charles. • Individual for Understand Wilks Putament. Bath, and baronets, made by King Iames, and King Charles. • Individual for Understand Wilks Putament. Bath, and baronets, made by King Iames, and King Charles. • Individual for Understand Wilks Putament. Bath, and baronets, made by King Iames, and King Charles. • Individual for Understand Wilks Putament. Bath, and baronets, made by King Iames, and King Charles. • Individual for Understand Wilks Putament. Bath, and baronets, made by King Iames, and King Charles. • Description O Description Condon : Printed for Thomas Walkly, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Child et Brittains Bursse, 1628. • Date: Eagle and Child et Brittains Bursse, 1628. Date: 1628 Bib name / number: STC (2nd ed.) / 7746.2 Physical description: [2], 10, [3] p. • Dublication: London : Printed [by Nichlas Chear Bursse, 1638. Signatures: A-B8 C7. Reproduction of original in the Harvard University. Library. • Copy from: Harvard University Library University Library UNIT Collection / STC / 1722/24 • Physical Description: 1 onthe reso		and knights of the	e bath of England made by King lames,			Parliament : whereunto is added the names of the knights of the
bedraftering - bedrafte		and King Charles.				Bath, and baronets, made by King Iames, and King Charles.
London : Printed for Thomas Walkly, and are to be sold at the signe or unbase London : Printed for Thomas Walkly, and are to be sold at the signe or the Eagle and Child at Brittains Bursse, 1628. Date: 1628 Bib name / number: STC (2nd ed.) / 7746.2 Physical description: London : Printed [by Nichlas Okas] for Thomas Walkly, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Child at Brittains Bursse, 1628. London : Printed [by Nichlas Okas] for Thomas Walkly, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Child at Brittains Bursse, 1628. London : Printed [by Nichlas Okas] for Thomas Walkly, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Child at Brittains Bursse, 1628. London : Printed [by Nichlas Okas] for Thomas Walkly, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Child at Brittains Bursse, 1628. Copy from: [Edition statement:] The third edition much enlarged. Signatures: A-BB C7. Reproduction of original in the Harvard University. Library. Copy from: Harvard University Library UMI Collection / STC / <u>1727:24</u>		by England and	Wales, Parliament.		Author:	Anon.
Construction C		Held by: Univers	sity of Maryland, College Park		Imprint:	London : Printed for Thomas Walkly, and are to be sold at the signe
		Z Access	s online		D _1	of the Eagle and Childe at Brittains Bursse, 1628.
Constrained O Description Publication: London: Printed [by Nicholas Okea] for Thomas Walkley, and are to be sold at the signed of t	Nederlands				Date: Bib pame / pumber:	1626 STC (2nd od) / 7746 2
O Description Lap & A (10-3) p. Publication: London: Printed [by Nichlas Okas] for Thomas Walkley, and are to be sold at the signe of the Expla on Child at Detrainer Burster, 1503. Edition: Edition statement:] The third edition much enlarged. Edition: The fourth edition way much enlarged. Signatures: A -88 C7. Reproduction of original in the Harvard University. Library. Physical Description: 1 online resource (2), 10, (35) pages) Copy from: Harvard University Library UMI Collection / STC / 1727:24 STC / 1727:24	กษาไหน				Physical description:	[2] 10 [33] p
Publication: London : Printed [by Nicholas Okies] for Thomas Walkley, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Child at Bettaners Bursse, 1628. Signatures: A - R6 SC 7. Edition: The fourth edition very much enlarged. Copy from: Harvard University. Library. Physical Description: 1 online resource (2), 10, (36) pages) STC / 1727:24		O Description			Notes:	[Edition statement:] The third edition much enlarged
Eagle and Child at Brittaines Bursse, 1628. Reporduction of original in the Harvard University. Library. Edition: The fourth addition very much enlarged. Copy from: Harvard University Library Physical Description: 1 online resource (2), 10, 160 pages) VML Collection / STC / 1727:24		Publication:	London : Printed [by Nicholas Okes] for Thomas Walkley, and	are to be sold at the signe of the		Signatures: A-B8 C7.
Edition: The fourth edition very much enlarged Copy from: Harvard University Library Physical Description: 1 online resource (2), 10, (36) pages) STC / <u>1727:24</u>			Eagle and Child at Brittaines Bursse, 1628.			Reproduction of original in the Harvard University. Library.
Physical Description: 1 online resource ([2], 10, [36] pages) UMI Collection / STC / <u>1727:24</u> reel number:		Edition:	The fourth edition very much enlarged.		Copy from:	Harvard University Library
reel number:		Physical Description:	1 online resource ([2], 10, [36] pages)		UMI Collection /	STC / <u>1727:24</u>
Language: English		Language:	English		reel number:	
Staff View: MARC Record Subject: England and Wales. Parliament Directories.		Staff View:	MARC Record		Subject:	England and Wales. Parliament Directories.
OCLC Number: 606541404 Nobility Great Britain.		OCLC Number:	606541404			Nobility Great Britain.

Figure 8. WorldCat UMD record OCN 606541404 linking to the wrong version of a resource in EEBO.

CLC	606	541404 Held by UMC - 119 other holdings
we File	106	8 1 UMC holding in GLIMIR cluster, 119 other holdings in GLIMIR cluster of 1
037	T	CL0036000033 #b ProQuest Information and Learning. 300 N. Zeeb Rd., Ann Arbor, MI 48106
043		e-uk-en ta e-uk-wi ta e-ie
050	4	Z2002 4b .U58
090		40
049		UMCP
110	1	England and Wales, +b Parliament,
240	1 0	Lists. 1628-03-17
245	12	A most exact catalogue of the Lords spiritual and temporal, as peers of the realme, in the higher House of Parliament, according to their dignities, offices, and degrees: some other called thither for their assistance, & officers of their attendances : to And also the names of the knights for the counties, otizens, burgesses for the boroughs, and barons for the ports for the House of Commons, for this Parliament. Whereunto is added a catalogue of the nobility of Ireland: the knights baronets and knights of the bath of England made by King lames, and King Charles.
246	3	Lists. 1628-03-17
250		The fourth edition very much enlarged.
260		London : #0 Printed [by Nicholas Okes] for Thomas Walkey, and are to be sold at the signe of the Eagle and Child at Brittaines Bursse, ‡c 1628.
300		1 online resource ([2], 10, [36] pages)
336		text #b bit #2 rdacontent
337		computer #b c #2 rdamedia
338		online resource #b cr +2 rdacarrier
510	4	STC (2nd ed.) ‡c 7746.3
588	0	Print version record.
610	1 0	England and Wales, #b Parliament #v Registers #v Early works to 1800.
650	0	Nobility #2 [reland #v Registers #v Early works to 1800.
650	0	Nobility #z England #v Registers #v Early works to 1800.
610	1 7	England and Wales. #b Parliament. #2 fast #0 (OCoLC)fst00595499
650	7	Nobility. #2 fast #0 (OCoLC)fst01038255
651	7	England. #2 fast #0 (OCoLC)fst01219920
651	7	Ireland. #2 fast #0 (OCoLC)fst01205427
655	7	Early works. #2 fast #0 (OCoLC)fst01411636
655	7	Registers (Lists) #2 fast #0 (OCoLC)fst01919964
856	4 0	43 Early English Books Online ‡u http://gateway.proguest.com/openut?cb:ver-Z39.88-2003&res_id=xri.eebo&rft_val_fmt=&rft_id=xri.eebo (http://gateway.proguest.com/openut?cb:ver-Z39.88-2003&res_id=xri.eebo&rft_val_fmt=&rft_id=xri.eebo
856	4 0	43 Early English Books Online ‡u http://oateway.proquest.com/openurl?ctx_ver=Z39.88-2003&res_id=xriceebo&rft_val_fmt=&rft_id=xriceebo.image:177800
029	1	NZ1 #b 15464505

Figure 9. Connexion client view of OCN 606541404



Figure 10. Digital image linked to from EEBO record describing the "third edition much enlarged" of a resource printed in 1628. <u>http://gateway.proquest.com/openurl?ctx ver=Z39.88-</u>2003&res_id=xri:eebo&rft_id=xri:eebo:image:23639

Further investigation identified errors of misappropriation of OCN in the KBART file to EEBO version records describing copies of editions filmed at locations other than those noted in the corresponding OCLC records. For example, the EEBO resource, "By the King. A proclamation for the adiournement of part of Trinitie terme," identified in the WCKB as associated with OCN 71492075, links the scholar to a resource described by the EEBO version record as the copy filmed at the British Library. OCLC record 71492075 however indicates that the copy it describes was the copy filmed at the Henry E. Huntington Library and Art Gallery. See Figures 11-13.

🤣 WorldShare'							Need Help? User support info	✓ Beth Guay	'
Metadata Analytics									
Record Manager	Collection: Early English Books Or	nline (EEBO)							
- Collection Manager	Save Contribute Changes to Glob	al Collection 👻 Deselect C	Collection						
Collection -	 Properties 								
EEBO 👔	► Linking								
Wy Selected Collections	 Holdings and MARC Records 								
Search Clear	▶ Sharing								
🗙 Close All Tabs								More Actions	•
Search Collections with "EEBO", My Selected C	Search within 71492075 Search	ch							
Collection: Early English Books Online (EEBO)	 My Selected Titles All Title Titles 	s Format		Journal Coverage	e				
Activity History	 Titles available individually Titles with current issues 	 E-book/Proceeding Audio 	Image Video	Full Text	Selected Full Text Abstracts	Reset			
Approve Changes to			C Other		Indexed	Results 1 - 1 of 1	Rows 25 👻	< < 1 >>	
Global Collections		Title			Content Availability	Identifiers	Select	tions	
View Recent Collections	By the King. A proclamation for the	adioumement of part of Trinitie t	eme		E-book/Proceeding E-book/Proceeding	OCN: 71492075	Held by my library Available only in Co	ollection	
Create a Collection Settings	Results 1 - 1 of 1						Rows 25 👻	< < 1 >>	

Figure 11. The WCKB associates OCN 71492075 with the EEBO resource, "By the King. A proclamation for the adiournement of part of Trinitie terme," described by the EEBO website as the copy filmed at the British Library.

E E B O early english books o N L I N E	СПЛОТУСКИТИТ
Full Record	HOME MARKED LIST SEARCH HISTORY HELP ?
SEARCH: <u>Basic</u> <u>Advanced</u> <u>Periodic</u>	als BROWSE: <u>Authors</u> <u>Thomason Tracts</u> <u>Periodicals</u>
Key: ERECORD COMENT IMAGE	RATION EFUL TEXT B THUMBNAIL
View this document as: 🛛 🗈 📾	
Print record as: Text	(Short Record) - Print
Add to your Marked List	Durable LIRI
Title:	By the King. A proclamation for the adiournement of part of Trinitie terms
Author:	England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)
Other authors:	Charles I, King of England, 1600-1649.
Imprint:	Printed at London : By Bonham Norton and Iohn Bill, printers
R .	to the Kings most excellent Maiestie, M.DC.XXV. [1625]
Date: Bib pame (pumber	1625 STC (Opd ed.) (9795
Bib hame / humber:	STC (2110 e0.)7 8785 Steele / 1434
	Early English books tract supplement interim guide /
	506.h.11[46]
Physical description:	2 sheets (versos blank).
Notes:	Caption title.
	Imprint from colophon.
	Dated at end: White-Hall the eighteenth day of Iune, in the
	first yeere of his Maiesties raigne
	Steele notation: greatly parts 2) or Pursuluants.
Copy from:	Reproduction of the original in the british Library. British Library
UMI Collection /	Tract Supplement / C2:2[46]
reel number:	······································
Subject:	<u> Plague Law and legislation England London Early</u>
_	works to 1800.
	Terms of court Law and legislation England Early
	<u>works to 1800.</u>
Send your suggestions, comments or queries End Session <u>Site map</u> <u>Accessibility</u>	to our <u>Webmaster</u> .
Data arrangement and software copyright @ 2	003-2017 ProQuest LLC.
All Rights Reserved.	~
Privacy policy	
AND AND THE AND	NO TRANSPORTANCE AND TRANSPORT

Figure 12. The EEBO resource record linked from OCN 71492075 by the OCLC EEBO KBART file indicates the copy filmed was held by the British Library.

OCLC Connexion - [Online WorldCat: By the King]	-	o >
File Cataloging Authorities Edit Action	Batch View Tools Window Help	- 8
Ø ா (이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이	え ψ 伊 伊 授 照 19 G □ 3 h 16 A 44 16 18 18 11 2 1 3 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	
OCLC 71492075 Held by UMC - 125 c	ther holdings	
1 UMC holding in GL	JMIR cluster 125 other holdings in GLIMIR cluster of 1	
Books Rec stat	c Entered 19950918 Replaced 20170419162706.9	
Type a ELvi M Srce	d <u>Audn Ctrl Lang</u> eng	
BLvi m Eorm o Conf	0 <u>Blog MRec City</u> enk	
Cont GPub	LIE 0 Indx 0	
Desc a Ills Fest	0 <u>D1S1</u> s <u>Dates</u> 1625 .	
006 m o.d		
007 h +b d +d b +e f +f v +a b +b a +	iaia	
007 c +b r +d b +e n +b a +i b +k b		
040 LIMW then to the part of LIMW to		
019 766407655		
037 Cl 2105000001 ±b ProQuest Info	mation and Learning 300 N Zeek Pd Ann Arbor Mild8106	
043 e-uk-en		
045 0 +b d1625		
050 / DA397 #b E53 1625		
000 +b		
040		
110 1 England and Wales th Sovereig	n (1675-1640 - Charles I)	
245 1 0 Py the King : this proclamation f		
246 2 Broolomation for the adjourneme		
260 London : th Printed at London ha	is of part or immer demine Schehm Norten and John Bill. Briefers to the Views mest Evrollent Malastie. An IDC XVV/16261	
300 1 online resource (2 unnumbered	Domain rotori and rom um, rimes to the Kinga nost Excelent maesue, K. m. DC. XV [1020]	
226 text +b txt +2 rdscentent	nurvaj	
207 computer this 42 reamadia		
220 online resource th cr t2 relacarrie	×	
500 Caption title	•	
500 Imprint from colonhon		
500 "Giuen at the Court at White-Hall	the eichleenth day of lune in the first veere of his Malesties Baine of Great Britaine France and reland "	
500 Reproduction of original in: Henn		
510 4 STC (2nd ed) ±c 8785	- Homonguon Lovany and Par Canady.	
588 0 Microfilm version record		
511 0 STC (2nd ad) to 9795		
511 0 510 (210 BU.), #C 6765.		
e Holdings- Export- Label- Produce	- Submt- Replace- Report Error- Update Holdings- Vhildate-	
	Workflow-In Process Inst-UMC INS 38.01	

Figure 13. OCN 71492075 indicates it describes a copy of the resource, "By the King : a proclamation for the adiournement of part of Trinitie terme," filmed at the Henry E. Huntington Library and Art Gallery.

Evaluation

The UM Libraries' EEBO project procedures revealed that match points of equivalent microfilm and e-version records were the names of the institutions holding the filmed copies and the STC citations to the resources.³¹ STC citations are carried in the MARC 510 fields of the bibliographic records in two subfields:

1. in subfield "a," the names of citing works, given in a brief form, e.g., "STC" to represent Pollard and Redgrave's *Short-title catalogue*; and

2. in subfield "c," the location (e.g., page number or volume) within the citing works, e.g. "8626."³²

Figure 14 displays a Connexion Client view of OCN 33150534, cited as STC 9170, and Figure 15 shows the same record in the WorldCat display view. Unfortunately, the MARC 510 fields are neither indexed by OCLC nor displayed in WorldCat.³³ OCLC could enable the identification and

collocation of records for equivalent print, microfilm and electronic versions by indexing the MARC 510 fields and subfields.³⁴

S OCLC Connexion - [Online WorldCat: By the King]	
	8.8
[\$?]" [5] (\$ 10 (\$ 10 11 11 (\$10 11 12 12 12 12 12 12 1	(PQ
* # 33150534 • 🔊 •	
Text Strings 👻 😓 User Tools 👻	
UCCC 33180834 Teld 09 UMC/LTR - 56 other holdings	
007 h #b d #d a #e f #f v #g b #h a #i c #j a	
007 h #b d #d b #e f #f v #g b #h a #ia #ja	
040 EBK #b eng #c EBK #d OCLCG #d OCLCQ #d OCLCQ	
037 CL0036000057 #b UMI, 300 N. Zeeb Rd., Ann Arbor, MI 48103-1553	
043 e-uk-en	
045 0 #b d1840	
050 4 BX5147.O3 #b E53 1640	
090 #b	
049 UMCP	
110 1 England and Wales, #b Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)	
245 1 0 By the King : #b a proclamation for a generall fast to be kept thorowout the realm of England.	
246 3 Proclamation for a general fast to be kept thorowout the realm of England	
260 Imprinted at London : #b By Robert Barker, Printer to the Kings most Excellent Majestie : #b And by the Assignes of John Bill, #c 1640.	
300 1 sheet ([1] pages)	
336 text #b bd #2 rdacontent	
337 microform #b h #2 rdamedia	
338 microfilm reel +b hd +2 rdacarrier	
500 Ams with "C R" at top.	
500 Imperfect: cropped, with loss of print.	
500 "Given at the Court at White-Hall the eleventh day of November, in the sixteenth yeer of His Maiestes Reign."	
SUU Reproduction of onginal in: Society of Antiquanes.	
533 microlim. 40 Jain Algor, microl. 40 Owil, 40 Isos. 44 Finiciolim feel, 35 min. 41 (catry English books, 1475-1640, 1677-52).	
650 General General to Church of Erectand	
650 0 <u>Lassa an Lassa</u> exclusion Linguin.	
851 G Great Rain by Higher V Data 125,1849	
655 7 Broadsides ±z London (Enoland) ±v 17th century ±2 rbaenr	
700 0 Charles #b I, #c King of England, #d 1600-1649.	
830 0 Early English books, 1475-1640 ; ‡v 1877:52.	
029 1 AU@ #b 000014448419	

Figure 14. Microfilm version record OCN 33150534, cited as STC 9170.

WorldCa	at°	Advanced Search Eind a Library
		Analika Skarti Tan a tanal
Add to list Add togo		Take Main Back Market Andrew Andrew
Aud to list		Net und steht HHHHH
	By the Ki	ng : a proclamation for a generall fast to be kept thorowout the realm of England.
	Author:	Charles, King of England; England and Wales, Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)
	Publisher:	Imprinted at London : By Robert Barker, Printer to the Kings most Excellent Majestie : And by the Assignes of John Bill, 1640.
	Series:	Early English books, 1475-1640, 1877:52.
	Edition/Format:	📔 Book 🔛 Microform : Microfilm : Master microform : English View all editions and formats
	Database:	WorldCat
	Rating:	<mark>ጵዮጵዮጵ</mark> (not yet rated) 🚹 <u>0 with reviews - Be the first</u>
	Subjects	Fasts and feasts Church of England,
		Fasts and feasts - Creat Britain.
	Moro like this	
Find a copy in the I	library	
Find a copy in the I Details	library	
Find a copy in the I Details Senre/Form:	library	Broadsides
Find a copy in the I Details Senre/Form: Document Type:	library	Broadsides Book
Find a copy in the I Details Jenre/Form: Jocument Type: VI Authors / Contributors	library s:	Broadsides Book Charles, King of England; England and Wales, Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)
Find a copy in the I Details Genre/Form: Juncoursent Type: Juncoursent Type:	library s:	Broadsides Book Charles, King of England; England and Wales, Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)
Find a copy in the I Details Jenre/Form: Jocument Type: NI Authors / Contributors DCLC Number:	library s:	Broadsides Book Charles, King of England; England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) Find more information about: Charles, King of England J Go 33150534
Find a copy in the I Details Senre/Form: Document Type: NI Authors / Contributors DCLC Number:	library s:	Broadsides Book Charles, King of England: England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) Find more information about: Charles, King of England 33160634 Arrow with "C B" of two
Find a copy in the I Details Senre/Form: Jocument Type: VI Authors / Contributors DCLC Number: Jotes:	library s:	Broadsides Book Charles, King of England; England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) Find more information about: Charles, King of England Go 33150534 Arms with "C R" at top. Imperfect: cropped, with loss of print.
Find a copy in the I Details Senre/Form: Jocument Type: JU Authors / Contributors VI Authors / Contributors DCLC Number: Koles:	library s:	Broadsides Book Charles, King of England; England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) Find more information about: Charles, King of England C S150534 Arms with "C R" at top. Imperfect: cropped, with loss of print. "Given at the Court at White-Hall the eleventh day of November, in the sixteenth yeer of His Maiesties Reign." Beconclusion of definition
Find a copy in the I Details Benre/Form: bocument Type: All Authors / Contributors VCLC Number: toles:	library s:	Broadsides Book Charles, King of England; England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) Find more information about: Charles, King of England Find more information about: Charles, King of England
Find a copy in the I Details Jenre/Form: Jocument Type: UI Authors / Contributors DCLC Number: totes: Reproduction Notes: Pescription:	library s:	Broadsides Book Charles, King of England; England and Wales, Sovereign (1625-1649 ; Charles I) Find more information about: Charles, King of England Find more information about: Charles, King of England Go 33150534 Arms with "C R" at top. Imperfect: cropped, with loss of print. "Given at the Court at White-Hall the eleventh day of November, in the sixteenth yeer of His Maiesties Reign." Reproduction of original in: Society of Antiquaries. Microfilm. Ann Arbor, Mich. : UMI, 1985. 1 microfilm reel ; 35 mm. (Early English books, 1475-1640 ; 1877;52). 1 sheet (11) bages)
Find a copy in the I Details 3enre/Form: Document Type: NI Authors / Contributors OCLC Number: Notes: Reproduction Notes: Description: Sories Title:	library s:	Broadsides Book Charles, King of England; England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)
Find a copy in the I Details 3enre/Form: Document Type: NI Authors / Contributors DCLC Number: Notes: Reproduction Notes: Description: Series Tille: Duer Tille:	library s:	Broadsides Book Charles, King of England; England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 ; Charles I) Find more information about; Charles, King of England Find more information about; Charles, King of England Salfo654 Arms with "C R" at top. Imperfect: cropped, with loss of print. Shown at the Court at White-Hall the eleventh day of November, in the sixteenth yeer of His Malesties Reign." Reproduction of original in: Society of Antiquaries. Microfilm. Ann Arbor, Mich. : UMI, 1985. 1 microfilm reel ; 35 mm. (Early English books, 1475-1640 ; 1877:52). 1 sheet ([1] pages) Early English books. 1475-1640, 1877:52. Production for a general fast to be kent thorowurd the realm of England

Figure 15. WorldCat.org view of OCN 33150534, STC 9170

(<u>http://www.worldcat.org/oclc/33150534</u>). The underlying MARC 510 field metadata is not displayed.

Investigation by the author revealed that TCP version records supply these metadata elements in duplicate in different MARC fields; one a free text note field, the other a number/code field, 024. The 024 field is defined to carry a "standard number or code published on an item which cannot be accommodated in another field (e.g., field 020 (International Standard Book Number)."³⁵ It should be noted that use of the 024 field to carry a number that is *not* published on the item is not in accordance with the field's definition. The TCP records use the 024 field with a first indicator value "8," conveying that the number is an unspecified type of standard number or code.³⁶

Subfield "a" of the 024 field, which carries the STC numbers in the TCP version records, *is* indexed by OCLC. In the TCP version records, however, these elements are ensconced within strings of text, e.g., "(stc) STC (2nd ed.) 9170."³⁷ A search on standard number, "9170," in WorldCat will therefore fail to retrieve the appropriate record. See Figure 16 for an example of a TCP version record of a resource cited as STC 9170.

In respect to the MARC field definitions, should there be a need to retrieve bibliographic records representing TCP versions of resources via STC citations, these numbers should be entered in "a" subfields, and the brief abbreviated names of the citing source, e.g., "STC (2nd ed.)," "Wing," etc. in the "2" subfield which is defined to carry the "Source of number or code."³⁸ Should OCLC choose to index the MARC 510 fields as described above, the Text Creation Partnership records would be missed.



Figure 16. Text Creation Partnership version OCN 832931179, STC 9170

Indexing of the MARC 510 fields/subfields by OCLC combined with use of other MARC field/subfield values, such as language of cataloging, to limit results to desired OCN could support elimination of EEBO KBART file OCN errors and identification of thousands of new OCN for addition to this and perhaps other similar files. ³⁹ As a point of reference, according to OCLC's "MARC Usage in WorldCat" webpages, as of January 1, 2016, there were 6,382,317 instances of MARC 510 "a" subfields and 4,082,280 instances of the "c" subfields.⁴⁰ It should be noted, however, there are five first indicator values available for use in MARC 510 fields and only one of them is used to convey the information that the location in the source data is given in the field. Also worth noting, 024 data at the "MARC Usage in WorldCat" webpages shows that there were 4,633,776 occurrences of subfield 2 of the 024 field, and 43,711,819 occurrences of subfield "a."⁴¹

510 field indexing to support identification of OCN for addition to the EEBO KBART file may require the participation of the content provider, ProQuest. The 510 field elements are indexed in

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY AND LIBRARIES | SEPTEMBER 2017

its Early English Books Online collection. ProQuest could add these data to its EEBO KBART file in support of OCN matching. The *KBART Recommended Practice* allows content providers "to include any extra data fields after the last KBART utilized position."⁴²

Finally, it should be noted that reconciliation of errors in the WCKB EEBO file pertaining to the locations of the filmed copies as noted in OCLC records but found to be different at the EEBO site would require more complex steps than 510 field matching. Furthermore, catalogers working on the EEBO project were **not** instructed to check the images at the EEBO website but only to confirm the STC citation match points in the EEBO version records. A closer examination of EEBO in light of the findings in this paper of an EEBO record linked to a resource printed 12 years later is an area calling for further study. In respect of the needs of scholars as eloquently described by Gadd (2009), the WorldCat Knowledge Base OCN must improve its accuracy in terms of access provision via WorldCat Discovery.

MARC 510 Elements: Opportunities for Linked Data Applications?

OCLC is actively engaged in research and collaboration with the greater library community to transition its metadata to linked data, however, MARC 510 metadata is lacking in its linked data record display views (see Figure 14 in a Connexion client view of a record and Figure 17 in the WorldCat linked data display view).^{43 44} On the other hand, in its work to transfer its English Short Title Catalog, a "MARC based ... vendor-supplied ILS" to "ESTC21" a "native linked data resource," it appears the British Library combines the MARC 510 subfield values, e.g., "Bristol, B7384" as a resource property value (Figures 18 and 19).^{45 46} "Bristol, B7384" represents entry number 7384 in Roger P. Bristol's Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography (see Figure 20, WorldCat OCLC record number 88701).⁴⁷ As presented in Figure 19 (Stahmer, 2014), "Bristol, B7384" may be comprehensible to a well-versed scholar, librarian or archivist, but not to a computer. Hillmann, Dunsire, and Phipps (2013) posited that "it would be useful if all managers of schemas and other standards were to develop element sets and value vocabulary representations that match the source semantics at the finest granularity and make them available along with maps of the internal ontologies."48 Could a Semantic Web implementation of MARC 510 metadata at the finest granularity, with resource identifiers representing citing works such as "Bristol" and with property values such as "7384" representing locations within citing works, offer benefits to scholarship? It has been demonstrated in this paper that the consistent match points across bibliographic records representing equivalent versions of these resources has been the metadata contained in MARC 510 fields. Ultimately, a linked data implementation of the MARC bibliographic 510 field should lead the scholar to every known print copy comprising every edition, according to Gadd's definition of an edition, above, and to the institutional holdings of equivalent microform, digitized images, or digitized full-text versions, giving the scholar the path to the resources of interest.⁴⁹ OCLC, the British Library, members of the TCP, and other stakeholders may want to consider further exploration of use case scenarios to determine or rule out additional benefits of transforming MARC 510 field metadata to linked data.

<pre>ktroneworkset by the strone work is the strone work is the strone work is the strone work is the strone is th</pre>
New y Edge Server and the server and the server and the server th
<pre>" electron transmission of the second s</pre>
<pre>Ency to The second second</pre>
<pre>tran j beck j beck</pre>
<pre>shows and of the sected and and and and and and and and and an</pre>
<pre>storms and of this interments and up in the end stard 2000 Bit Bit Biogenet Bit Bit Pice Bit Biogenet Bit Bit Biogenet Bit Bit Bit Biogenet Bit Bit Bit Bit Bit Bit Bit Bit Bit Bi</pre>
<pre>shows and with a function of the second and particulation of the second of the second and particulation of the second of the second and particulation of the second of the second</pre>
<pre>stores and the initial car and an initial car and an initial car and init</pre>
<pre>species.com/s</pre>
<pre>stome to the the second of the second o</pre>
<pre>scales.sequence.set.set.set.set.set.set.set.set.set.se</pre>
<pre>charactery Tripediation (0); ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ;</pre>
<pre>schema stands "wint "": schema stands "wint "": schema stands" ": schema stands" : schema stands" ": schema stands" : schema stands" ": schema stands" : schema stands" : schema</pre>
<pre>schema SetUP of the secture is unclear organized setUP of the sectu</pre>
<pre>content public de la publi</pre>
<pre>showspackalow offu_physecure(stations) is appendix of physecure(stations) is appe</pre>
<pre>screen spursely descriptions descriptions without a space of space of</pre>
with Michael Michael And Annu And Annu And Annu Annu Annu An
<pre>i devices finites beside finite</pre>
kakes Entemis high/second biological bi
<pre>standstandstandstandstandstandstandstand</pre>
<pre>schemings 'vic y the Assgnes of John Bill'; bigDadddit </pre>
<pre></pre>
<pre>btdp://programmet.workidu.org/with/workida/25520058114Pince/basing/with/workida/</pre>
<pre>Ag0/2001; softwaranew "Proceed Batter, Preter to the Kings most Excellent Najester"; </pre>
<pre>thtp://coopcime/cooking.c</pre>
<pre>http://sportment.worksta.torginat/workstata/2542003611F2ace/great_balasy # 0 reat Britany schema.name "Great Britany";</pre>
a schemanwer "Greise Bitham"; b
<pre>submitude: Use union ,</pre>
<pre>http://www.indicat.org/entity/work/data2542093081EPS/neeken/y engleh.hooks /#75.1640 # Enry Engleh.hooks, /#75.1640 # Engleh.hooks # E</pre>
Take defense and "imported at London";
<pre>schema.name*Imprinted at London*;</pre>
<pre></pre>
<pre>tmp://speciment.vordcat.org/setty/vord/statuces/setsystems/metastary english.Docks_14/s_1set/p = Early English.Docks_14/s-1set/;</pre>
<pre>schema.hasPart <htp: #="" 031160349;="" :="" a="" be="" by="" doi="" england.<br="" fast="" for="" general="" kept="" king="" of="" proclamation="" realm="" the="" throwout="" to="" www.woddsat.org=""></htp:></pre>
schemanname "Early English books, 14/5-1640,"; http://seperiment.usci/sca.uscientity/work/stata/2542093581ETopic/tasts and feasts church of england> # Fasts and feastsChurch of England a schema.htman/tast schema.hashart (http://dl.ko.gov/authorities/author/schembB60/7412>; schema.hashart (http://dl.ko.gov/authorities/author/schembB60/7412>; schema.hashart (http://dl.ko.gov/authorities/author/schembB60/7412>; schema.hashart (http://dl.ko.gov/authorities/author/schembB60/7412>; schema.hashart (http://dl.ko.gov/authorities/author/schembB60/7412>; schema.hashart (http://dl.ko.gov/authorities/author/schembB60/7412>; schema.hashart (http://dl.ko.gov/authorities/author/schembB60/7412>; schema.hashart (http://dl.ko.gov/authorities/author/schembB60/7412>; schema.hashart (http://dl.ko.gov/authorities/author/schembB60/7412>; schema.hashart (http://dl.ko.gov/authorities/author/schemB60/7412>; schema.hashart (http://dl.ko.gov/authorities/author/schembB60/7412>; schema.hashart (http://dl.ko.gov/authorities/autho
<pre> it it//storestends.cs.convention/workdata/2542093881#Topschass.and.feasts.church.of.england> # Fasts and feastsChurch of England a schema.naharan.it it//storestends.cs.convention/teles/subject/su</pre>
<pre>http://experiment.vor/scat.org/entit/vor/scatas/2542032611F0pc/fasts and feasts_oreal britain> #Fasts and feasts_Oreal Britain</pre>
a been stander factor schema name "Fasts and feastsGreat Bittain"@en ; - http://d.loc.gov/withortfies/classification/BXS117> a schema intrangible ; - - - tttp://d.loc.gov/vocabulary/countrise/ents> a schema intrangible ; - - - - - - - - - - - - -
schema.name "Fasts and feastsGreat Entlain"@en ; http://dl.dc.gov/authorities/classification/BX5147> a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Chartes I) a schema.name "England and Wates. S
<pre>schema.intangibie; a schema.intangibie; c detems:identifier 'enk'; c tittp://d.vor/cabutary/countries/enk> a schema.Place; detems:identifier 'enk'; c detems:identifier 'enk'; c detem:identifier 'enk'; c detem:</pre>
<pre>indu/iduciou/usid/induciou/usid/induciou/iduciou/</pre>
http://di.org/wickcibulary/countries/ent> <pre>statema.Place; schema.Place; http://di.org/schema.place; schema.name "Great Britain"; . http://di.org/schema.place; schema.name "Great Britain"; . http://di.org/schema.place; schema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en; . http://di.org/schema.place; schema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en; . http://di.org/schema.place; schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.place; } schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.place; } http://di.org/schema.place; } http://di.org/schema.place</pre>
a schema.2hece ; determsideruffer enk'; http://d.worldcat.org/fast//204623> # Great Entain a schema.name "Great Entain"; http://d.worldcat.org/fast//21741> # Fasts and feasts a schema.name "Ensist and feasts"@en ; http://wid.forg/stdf121097064> # England and Wales.Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name "England and Wales.Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name Tengland and Marles.Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name Tengland and Marles.Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name Tengland and Marles.Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name.name.name.name.name.name.name.n
buterinduction for the first , i buterinduction confast/220452> # Great Britain a schema.name "Great Britain"; buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts a schema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en; buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts a schema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en; buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts a schema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en; buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts a schema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en; buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts a schema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en; buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts a schema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en; buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts a schema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en; buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts"@en; buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts a schema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en; buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts a schema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en; buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts"@en; buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts and feasts buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts buterinduction confast/921741> # Fasts/921741> # Fast
http://d.worldcat.org/fast//2046/25 # Great Britain a schema.name "Great Britain";
a schema name "Great Britain" ; schema name "Great Britain" ; i schema name "Great Britain" ; schema name "Fasts and feasts" @en ; schema name "Fasts and feasts" @en ; schema name "Fasts and feasts" @en ; schema name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema name Schema Nerzon :
somema.name "Great Britain" : http://di.worldcat.corg/fast/921741> # Fasts and feasts a <u>somema.nithangube</u> : somema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en ; http://stat.org/stat121007064># England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a <u>somema.organization</u> ; somema.name "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a <u>somema.name</u> "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a <u>somema.name</u> "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a <u>somema.name</u> "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)" ; a <u>somema.name</u> "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)" ; a <u>somema.name</u> "England and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)" ; a <u>somema.name</u> Tengland and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)" ; a <u>somema.name</u> Tengland and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)" ; a <u>somema.name</u> Tengland and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)" ; a <u>somema.name</u> Tengland and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)" ; a <u>somema.name</u> Tengland and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)" ; a <u>somema.name</u> Tengland and Wates. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)" ; bit/witat.org/witatf2750328/2 # King of England Charles I a <u>somema.name</u> Tengland and Charles I
Impune vontoact orginasty // 41 > # Fasts and feasts a Schema.name "Fasts and feasts" @en ; · · http://wat.org/wat/121007064> # England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)
schema.name "Fasts and feasts"@en ; http://xitorg/staff121097064> # England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I);
In <u>Joint Jong Visit (121007064></u> # England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a <u>schema.Organization</u> ; schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)";
http://viaf.org/viaf/121007064> # England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I) a schema.Drganization ; schema.name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)
a Butterina Sutgementant / schema name "England and Wales. Sovereign (1625-1649 : Charles I)" ; . thtp://wat.org/biaf67750326> # King of England Charles I a schema Person :
the Archena Person
http://viaf.org/viaf67750326> # King of England Charles I a schema Person :
a schema:Person :
- chambing a standard
Schemadeathouse Tody ; schemadeathouse Tody ;
schemagnen Stind Endest:
summaname kny vi ciyanu vidites i ,
http://www.werkifeat.org/fille/-incle/33150534>
a genorit.informationResource_genont.ContentTypeGenericResource;
schema.about http://www.worldcat.org/ocdr/33160534 > ; # By the King : a proclamation for a generall fast to be kept thorowout the realm of England.
void:inDataset < <u>http://purl.oclc.org/dataset/WorldCat</u> >;
http://www.worldcat.org/title/./ocio/33150534#PublicationEvent/imprinted at london by robert barker printer to the kings most excellent majestie and by the assignes of john bill 1640>
a schema/bublicationEvent ; schema/schildream/bublicationEvent ;
schema organizer <htp: and="" coopuring="" gonu="" gonutive="" intel="" media="" memoranewacc="" opuring="" opuring<="" td="" up="" www.mem.tworkda.cr=""></htp:>
schematorganzer <htp: 2542033581#agent="" barker="" by-robert="" data="" entity="" excellent="" kings="" majestie="" most="" printer="" the="" to="" work="" zeperiment.worldcat.org=""> ; # By Robert Barker, Printer to the Kings most Excellent Majestie schematsata/2542033581#Agent/by-robert barker printer to the kings most excellent majestie> ; # By Robert Barker, Printer to the Kings most Excellent Majestie</htp:>
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Anten-responsable representations
Marke towarding / Son-LC (application/id+son)
DEFXML (application/rdf+xml)
JEZSMI, doplicationind1+xml) TRIPLES (text/plain) MILHDEF (not/min)

Figure 17. Linked data view of OCLC #33150534, http://www.worldcat.org/oclc/33150534

```
W35912
  881
 883
        CU-RivES
 885
        20060812152824.0
 888
        868286s1798 xxu||||
                                    00 | enq c
 809 806461785
 835 bb |a (Uk-ES)006461785
 848 bb |a MWA |c MWA |d CU-RivES |d CStRLIN
 100 0b |a Gentleman of the faculty.
 245 10 |a Concise observations on the nature of our common food, |b so far as it tends to
promote or injure health; with remarks on water, bread, meat, cheese, butter, milk, wine,
punch, beer, coffee, tea, sugar, &c. &c. To which are prefixed, general rules for a course of
diet. By a gentleman of the faculty. [One line in Latin from Cicero]
 250 bb |a The second edition.
 260 bb [a [New York] : [b --London: printed -- New-York: re-printed by T. and J. Swords,
for Berry and Rogers, Hanover-Square, [c M,DCC,XC. [1790]
 300 bb |a vi,[1],8-38p.; |c ?*.
 500 bb |a The first New York edition is tentatively attributed to Thomas Hayes by Evans.
 500 bb |a Advertisement for hardware, medicines, and other merchandise to be had of Berry
and Rogers, p. [ii].
 510 4b | a Bristol, | c B7384
 510 4b | a Shipton & Mooney, | c 45882
 510 4b |a Austin, R.B. Early Amer. medical imprints, |c 512
 510 4b |a Lovenstein, E. Amer. cookery (3rd ed.), |c 6
 533 bb |a Digital image available in the Readex/Newsbank Digital Evans series. In
Available via the World Wide Web. In Access limited by licensing agreements.
 648 b7 | a 1635-1800 | 2 local
 650 b0 a Nutrition.
 658 b0 |a Diet.
 655 b7 |a Advertisements. |2 rbgenr
 700 1b | a Hayes, Thomas, | d fl. 1783-1786. | 4 aut
 700 1b | a Hayes, Thomas, | d fl. 1783-1786.
 700 1b |a Swords, Thomas, |d 1764-1843, |e printer.
 700 1b |a Swords, James, |d 1765-1846, |e printer.
 700 1b | a Berry, John, | d d. 1795, | e bookseller.
 700 1b |a Rogers, John, |e bookseller.
 752 bb |a United States |b New York |d New York.
```

Figure 18. MARC 510 field data in ESTC

<rdafrbr:manifestation id="estc.bl.uk/MST/MARCToFRBR/295384"> <rdafrbr:equivalenceRelationshipsManifestation> <rdafrbr:work id="estc.bl.uk/MST/MARCToFRBR/6461785" /> </rdafrbr:equivalenceRelationshipsManifestation> <rdagr3:identifierForTheObject type="dcterms:LCC">PS504 .A48</rdagr3:identifierForTheObject> <estc:titleStatement> <rdavocab:titleOfTheManifestation> Concise observations on the nature of our common food, \n so far as it tends to promote or injure health; with remarks on water, bread, meat, cheese, butter, milk, wine, punch, beer, coffee, tea, sugar, &c. &c. To which are prefixed, general rules for a course of diet. By a gentleman of the faculty. [One line in Latin from Cicero] </rdayocab:titleOfTheManifestation> </estc:titleStatement> <estc:imprint> <rdarole:author>A Gentleman of the faculty</rdarole:author> </estc:imprint> <rdavocab:describedIn> Bristol, B7384 </rdavocab:describedIn> <rdavocab:describedIn> Shipton & Mooney, 45882 </rdavocab:describedIn> <rdavocab:describedIn> Austin, R.B. Early Amer. medical imprints, 512 </rdavocab:describedIn> <rdavocab:describedIn> Lowenstein, E. Amer. cookery (3rd ed.), 6 </rdavocab:describedIn> </rdafrbr:manifestation> </rdf:RDF>

Figure 19. MARC 510 metadata in structured data view in ESTC21

🄊 WorldCa	at°	Advanced Search Find a Library
Add to list 🧼 Add tag	<u>as 🛛 🔞 Write a rev</u>	<u>න්න</u> Rate this item: රාධාරාරා
	Suppleme	ant to Charles Evans' American hibliography
22	Author	an to Onaries Evans American Bullography. Dave Belgelic Charles Evans Publicerational Society of Marian Librarity of Viralah. Bibliographical Society
	Publisher	rouger - Disko, crients Lines, Lines de la construction de la construc
	Edition/Format:	Print hours for all editions and formats
	Database:	WorldCat
	Summary:	Chronolocial list 1646-1800 of books pamphlets and periodicals not listed in American bibliography / Charles Evans
	Rating:	
	Subjects	United States Imprints.
		Printing United States History.
		Printers United States
	Mara like this	
	MOLE INE THE	La Similar Items
Find a copy in the Buy it	library	
Find a copy in the Buy it	library	
Find a copy in the Buy it Details	library	
Find a copy in the Buy it Details Jenre/Form:	library	Bibliography
Find a copy in the Buy it Details ienre/Form:	library	Bibliography History Bibliographies
Find a copy in the Buy it Details kenre/Form:	library	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints
Find a copy in the Buy it Details Genre/Form:	library	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Opline version
Find a copy in the Buy it Details Jenre/Form: dditional Physical Fon	library	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Pattrell), 1903-1974.
Find a copy in the Buy it Details Benre/Form: ddflional Physical For	library	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P, (Roger Pattrell), 1903-1974, Supplement to Charles Evand' American bibliography. Supplement to Charles Evand' American bibliography.
Find a copy in the Buy it Details ienre/Form: dditional Physical For	library	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Pattrell), 1903-1974. Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Pattrell), 1903-1974. Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography. Charlottesville, Published for the Bibliographical Society of the University of Virginia (by) University Press of Virginia (1970) (Clock.Clog87982020
Find a copy in the Buy it Details ienre/Form: dditional Physical For	library mat:	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Pattrell), 1903-1974. Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography. Charlottesville, Published for the Bibliographical Society of the University of Virginia [ty] University Press of Virginia [1970] (OCoLC)693789209 Dook
Find a copy in the Buy it Details Jenre/Form: dditional Physical For cournent Type:	library mat:	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Pattrell), 1903-1974. Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography. Charlottesville, Published for the Bibliographical Society of America and the Bibliographical Society of the University of Virginia [by] University Press of Virginia [1970] (OCcLC)693789209 Book Book
Find a copy in the Buy it Details Jenre/Form: udditional Physical For bocument Type: NI Authors / Contributor	library mat:	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Patrell), 1903-1974. Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography. Charlottesville, Published for the Bibliographical Society of America and the Bibliographical Society of the University of Virginia [by] University Press of Virginia [1970] (OCoLC)933789209 Book Roger P. Bristol: Charles Evans: Bibliographical Society of America.; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society.
Find a copy in the Buy it Details lenre/Form: dditional Physical For occument Type: al Authors / Contributor	library mat:	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Patrell), 1903-1974. Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography. Charlottesville, Published for the Bibliographical Society of America and the Bibliographical Society of the University of Virginia [by] University Press of Virginia [1970] (OCoLC)933789209 Book Roger P. Bristol: Charles Evans: Bibliographical Society of America.; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society.
Find a copy in the Buy it Details lenre/Form: dditional Physical For occument Type: al Authors / Contributor SBN:	library mat:	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Patrell), 1903-1974. Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography. Charlottesville, Published for the Bibliographical Society of America and the Bibliographical Society of the University of Virginia [by] University Press of Virginia [1970] (OCoLC)933788209 Book Roger P. Bristol: Charles Evans: Bibliographical Society of America.; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. @ Ind more information about: Roger P Binstol @ @ 0813902878 9780813902876 0813903378 9780813903378
Find a copy in the Buy it Details Jenre/Form: dditional Physical For Additional Physical For Vocument Type: WI Authors / Contributor SBN: DCLC Number:	library mat:	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Patrell), 1903-1974. Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography. Charlottesville, Published for the Bibliographical Society of America and the Bibliographical Society of the University of Virginia [by] University Press of Virginia [1970] (OCoLC)693789209 Book Roger P. Bristol: Charles Evans: Bibliographical Society of America.; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. @ Bibliographical Society of America.; Bibliographical Society. @ Bibliographical Society of America.; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. Bibliographical Society of America.; Bibliographical Society. Bibliographical Socie
Find a copy in the Buy it Details Jenre/Form: Additional Physical For Document Type: VI Authors / Contributor SBN: DCLC Number: Hotes:	library mat:	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Patrell), 1903-1974. Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography. Charlottesville, Published for the Bibliographical Society of America and the Bibliographical Society of the University of Virginia [by] University Press of Virginia [1970] (OCOLC)693789209 Book Roger P. Bristol: Charles Evans: Bibliographical Society of America.: University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. € Find more information about: Roger P Bristol © © De 13902878 9780e13902876 0813903378 9780e13903378 88701 A chronological list, 1646-1800, of "not-in-Evans" items.
Find a copy in the Buy it Details Jenre/Form: dditional Physical For Additional Physical For Nocument Type: UI Authors / Contributor SBN: SCLC Number: totes: Nescription:	library mat:	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Patrell), 1903-1974. Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography. Charlottesville, Published for the Bibliographical Society of America and the Bibliographical Society of the University of Virginia [by] University Press of Virginia [1970] (OCoLC)693789209 Book Roger P. Bristol: Charles Evans: Bibliographical Society of America.: University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. € Find more information about: Roger P Bristol © @ De13902878 9780e13902876 0913903378 9780e13903378 88701 A chronological list, 1646-1800, of "not-in-Evans" items. xx, 636 pages 29 cm
Find a copy in the Buy it Details Jenre/Form: wdditional Physical For occument Type: All Authors / Contributor SBN: DCLC Number: totes: bescription: tesponsibility:	library mat:	Bibliography History Bibliographis Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Pattrell), 1903-1974. Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography. Charlottesville, Published for the Bibliographical Society of America and the Bibliographical Society of the University of Virginia [by] University Press of Virginia [1970] (CCuCL0983789209 Book Roger P. Bristol: Charles Evans; Bibliographical Society of America; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. Roger P. Bristol: Charles Evans; Bibliographical Society of America; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. Book Roger P. Bristol: Charles Evans; Bibliographical Society of America; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. Book Book Book Book Book Bistol. Bistol. Bibliographical Society of America; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. Bistol Charles Evans; Bibliographical Society of America; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. Bistol Charles Evans; Bibliographical Society of America; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. Bistol Charles Evans; Bibliographical Society of America; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. Bistol Charles Evans; Bibliographical Society of America; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society.
Find a copy in the Buy it Details Genre/Form: Additional Physical For Cocument Type: All Authors / Contributor SBN: CCLC Number: Alloes: Description: Responsibility: Westract:	library mat:	Bibliography History Bibliographies Imprints Online version: Bristol, Roger P. (Roger Pattrell), 1903-1974. Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography. Charlottesville, Published for the Bibliographical Society of America and the Bibliographical Society of the University of Virginia [by] University Press of Virginia [1970] (COCLC)993788209 Book Book Reger P. Bristol; Charles Evans; Bibliographical Society of America.; University of Virginia. Bibliographical Society. Britan more information about: Reger P.Bristol

Figure 20. Print version of OCN 88701, *Supplement to Charles Evans' American bibliography* by Roger P. Bristol, <u>http://www.worldcat.org/oclc/88701</u>.

CONCLUSION

At the current pace, given available staffing and the number of EEBO resources lacking OCN, the time and effort spent by the Libraries' Metadata Services Department staff toward the goal of adding OCN to the OCLC EEBO KBART file, though well spent, will be years in the making. A collective effort in this endeavor by the WCKB community of users is welcomed by this author.⁵⁰ A combined effort by OCLC and ProQuest to improve discovery and link resolution services for these valuable scholarly resources could increase their discoverability exponentially, allowing MSD staff to spend more time creating and enhancing the metadata that will lead researchers to the *uncatalogued* EEBO resources they seek. As to the transition of MARC 510 field metadata to linked data, OCLC, the British Library, members of the TCP, and other stakeholders should consider their options before moving forward without it.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The author wishes to thank Karen Coyle for reading and advising on earlier versions of this paper; Becky Culbertson, Nathan Putnam, and Patricia Herron for supporting the project; and Joshua Westgard for converting the data to get the project underway. Special thanks are due to staff members of the UM Libraries, Donna King, Roselin Becker, Erica Hemsley, Yeo-Hee Koh, and Tanisha Lee, and to Freeda Brook, Luther College, for their work on the project.

REFERENCES

- 1. A KBART file is a file compliant with the NISO recommended practice, *Knowledge Bases and Related Tools (KBART)*. See KBART Phase II Working Group, *Knowledge Bases and Related Tools (KBART): Recommended Practice: NISO RP-9-2014* (Baltimore, MD: National Information Standards Organization (NISO), 2014), accessed March 14, 2017, <u>http://www.niso.org/publications/rp/rp-9-2014/</u>.
- 2. University of Maryland Libraries. "About." Last updated July 28, 2016, http://www.lib.umd.edu/about
- 3. In 2015, the Libraries implemented WorldCat Discovery, intended to be a replacement for WorldCat Local.
- Marshall Breeding, *The Future of Library Resource Discovery*, (Baltimore, MD: National Information Standards Group (NISO), 2015): 17, accessed February 18, 2017. <u>http://www.niso.org/apps/group_public/download.php/14487/future_library_resource_discovery.pdf</u>
- 5. KBART Phase II Working Group, *Knowledge Bases and Related Tools (KBART): Recommended Practice: NISO RP-9-2014,* (Baltimore, MD: National Information Standards Group (NISO), 2014), accessed April 13, 2017, http://www.niso.org/publications/rp/rp-9-2014/
- 6. Open Discovery Initiative Working Group, *Open Discovery Initiative: Promoting Transparency in Discovery: NISO RP-19-2014,* (Baltimore, MD: NISO, 2014): *13, accessed March 14, 2017,* <u>http://www.niso.org/publications/rp/rp-9-2014/</u>
- 7. University of Maryland Libraries Collection Development Council. "Meeting Notes," March 4, 2014.
- 8. "University of Maryland Libraries Master Space Plan," Nov. 2015, June 2016 update.
- See Gale's web page, "The Making of the Modern World (MOMW) FAQ," at <u>http://find.galegroup.com/mome/component/researchtools/xml/FAQ.xml</u>, accessed February 18, 2017, for a details about the collection.

WorldCat Knowledge Base collections may be created by libraries and uploaded to the Knowledge Base. Details on the process are available at http://www.oclc.org/support/services/collection-manager/documentation.en.html#knowledgebase, accessed February 18, 2017.

- 10. ProQuest's British Periodicals collection "offers facsimile page images and searchable full text for nearly 500 British periodicals published from the 17th century through to the early 21st" and "is available in four separate collections, British Periodicals Collections I, II, III, and IV, each of which can be purchased separately." ProQuest British Periodicals product description page, <u>http://search.proquest.com/britishperiodicals/productfulldescdetail?accountid=14696</u>, accessed Jan. 29, 2017
- 11. Details about resources available in EEBO are provided by ProQuest at its website, "EEBO: About EEBO," accessed January 29, 2017. <u>http://eebo.chadwyck.com/marketing/about.htm</u>
- Diana Kichuk, "Metamorphosis: Remediation in Early English Books Online (EEBO)," *Literary and Linguistic Computing*, 22:3 (2007): 291-303; Shawn Martin, "EEBO, Microfilm, and Umberto Eco: Historical Lessons and Future Directions for Building Electronic Collections," *Microform & Imaging Review*, 36:4 (2007): 159-164; Ian Gadd, "The Use and Misuse of Early English Books Online, *Literature Compass*, 6:3 (2009): 680-692; Bonnie Mak, "Archaeology of a Digitization," *Journal of the Association for Information Science and Technology*, 65:8 (2014): 1515-1526; Folger Shakespeare Library, "History of Early English Books Online," <u>http://folgerpedia.folger.edu/History of Early English Books Online</u>, last modified on 26 August 2015.
- A.W. Pollard and G. R. Redgrave. A short-title catalogue of books printed in England, Scotland, & Ireland and of English books printed abroad, 1475-1640, Rev. ed. (London: The Bibliographical Society, 1976–1991); Donald Wing, Short-title catalogue of books printed in England, Scotland, Ireland, Wales, and British America, and of English books printed in other countries, 1641-1700, 2d ed., newly rev. and enl. (New York : Modern Language Association of America, 1972-<1994>)
- 14. Gadd, "The Use and Misuse of Early English Books Online," 683.
- 15. "About EEBO."
- 16. Details on the ESTC are provided by the British Library at <u>http://www.bl.uk/reshelp/findhelprestype/catblhold/estccontent/estccontent.html</u>, viewed March 12, 2017
- 17. Gadd, "The Use and Misuse of Early English Books Online," 685-686.
- 18. Gadd, "The Use and Misuse of Early English Books Online," 686.
- 19. EEBO, "Frequently Asked Questions," accessed February 18, 2017. http://eebo.chadwyck.com/help/faqs.htm
- 20. Association of Research Libraries, *Microform Sets in U.S. and Canadian Libraries*, (Washington, D.C.: Association of Research Libraries, 1984), J-3.
- 21. Martin D. Joachim, "Cooperative Cataloging of Microform Sets," in *Cooperative Cataloging: Past, Present, and Future* (New York: The Haworth Press, 1993), 111.

- 22. Gadd, "The Use and Misuse of Early English Books Online," 686.
- 23. British Library, "Catalogs of British Library Holdings: English Short Title Catalogue content," accessed February 18, 2017. <u>http://www.bl.uk/reshelp/findhelprestype/catblhold/estccontent/estccontent.html</u>
- 24. The British Libraries ESTC codes for filmed copy locations are difficult to translate. See Meaghan J. Brown's finding aid, "STC Location Code Transcription" wherein she offers details on STC and ESTC location codes and the problem her finding aid addresses. Brown explains, "... it is currently possible to search the ESTC for items using MARC codes, but not the location codes familiar from the STC," accessed February 18, 2017. <u>http://www.meaghanbrown.com/stc-location-codes/</u>
- 25. Text Creation Partnership, accessed January 25, 2017. <u>http://www.textcreationpartnership.org/home/</u>
- 26. Text Creation Partnership, accessed January 25, 2017. http://www.textcreationpartnership.org/catalog-records/
- 27. OCLC's form is available at <u>https://www.oclc.org/content/dam/support/knowledge-base/ocn_report.xlsx</u>, accessed October 18, 2016.
- 28. See Appendix 1 for the Procedures
- 29. With streamlined KBART search features introduced by a Metadata Services Department colleague, it's expected this time may be reduced moving forward.
- 30. A June 9, 2015 email from an OCLC staff member to the <u>KB-L@oclc.org</u> listserv reported on OCLC's efforts to match OCN in its KBART files to English language of cataloging records, when available.
- 31. UM Libraries' staff use this metadata in the equivalent OCLC microfilm and e-version and EEBO resource records as match points. Staff do not verify that the images linked to the EEBO version records correspond to those in the aforementioned bibliographic records. It is hoped that ProQuest will investigate the case described in this paper in which the EEBO resource differs from its corresponding record.
- 32. "510 Citation/Reference Note," OCLC, *Bibliographic Formats and Standards*. 4th Edition, last revised August 22, 2016. <u>https://www.oclc.org/bibformats/en/5xx/510.html</u>
- 33. As of January 29, 2017, the MARC 510 field has not been indexed by OCLC. See http://www.oclc.org/support/help/SearchingWorldCatIndexes/#05_FieldsAndSubfields/5xx_fields.htm
- 34. E.g., OCLC indexes "internet resources" using a combination of MARC data elements. These are laid out in "Searching WorldCat Indexes" at http://www.oclc.org/support/help/SearchingWorldCatIndexes/#06_Format_Document_Typ http://www.oclc.org/support/help/SearchingWorldCatIndexes/#06_Format_Document_Typ http://www.oclc.org/support/help/SearchingWorldCatIndexes/#06_Format_Document_Typ http://www.oclc.org/support/help/SearchingWorldCatIndexes/#06_Format_Document_Typ http://www.oclc.org/support/help/SearchingWorldCatIndexes/#06_Format_Document_Typ http://www.oclc.org/support/help/SearchingWorldCatIndexes/#06_Format_Document_Typ">http://www.oclc.org http://www.oclc.org <a href="http://www

https://www.loc.gov/marc/bibliographic/bdleader.html provides the Leader position 06 code for "Language material." MARC Code List for Languages (http://www.loc.gov/marc/languages/) contains the language codes contained in the language of cataloging field/subfield (MARC 040 field, subfield "b").

- 35. "024 Other Standard Identifier," in OCLC, *Bibliographic Formats and Standards*, 4th edition, accessed January 25, 2017. <u>https://www.oclc.org/bibformats/en/0xx/024.html</u>
- 36. Ibid.
- 37. OCLC. Searching WorldCat Indexes, accessed February 18, 2017. <u>http://www.oclc.org/support/help/SearchingWorldCatIndexes/#05_FieldsAndSubfields/0xx</u> <u>_fields.htm%3FTocPath%3DFields%2520and%2520subfields%7C___2</u>
- 38. See *OCLC Bibliographic Formats and Standards*, Fourth edition. 024 Other Standard Identifier <u>https://www.oclc.org/bibformats/en/0xx/024.html</u>, viewed January 25, 2017
- 39. An Oct. 18, 2016 review of OCLC's all-collections-list, available at https://www.oclc.org/content/dam/support/knowledge-base/all-collections-list.xlsx indicates that 38.5% percent of the 129,498 resources on the EEBO KBART file have OCLC number coverage.
- 40. http://experimental.worldcat.org/marcusage/510.html
- 41. http://experimental.worldcat.org/marcusage/024.html
- 42. KBART Phase II Working Group, *Knowledge Bases and Related Tools (KBART): Recommended Practice: NISO RP-9-2014* (Baltimore, MD: NISO 2014), 18. http://www.niso.org/workrooms/kbart
- 43. <u>https://www.oclc.org/worldcat/data-strategy.en.html</u>, viewed Jan. 26, 2017
- 44. The image of the linked data view of Figure 14 was captured on February 18, 2017.
- 45. Carl Stahmer, "Making MARC Agnostic: Transforming the English Short Title Catalogue for the Linked Data Universe," in *Linked Data for Cultural Heritage*, (Chicago: ALA Editions), p. 23-25.
- 46. The assertion that the ESTC transformation of MARC 510 field metadata is solely based on Carl Stahmer, "The ESTC as a 21st Century Research Tool," Presentation given at the 2014 conference of the Text Encoding Initiative, viewed February 19, 2017. https://figshare.com/articles/ESTC21_at_TEI_2014/1558057
- 47. Roger P. Bristol, *Supplement to Charles Evans' American Bibliography* (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 1970).
- 48. Dianne Hillmann, Gordon Dunsire, and Jon Phipps, "Maps and Gaps: Strategies for Vocabulary Design and Development," in *DCMI International Conference on Dublin Core and Metadata Applications*, 2013: 88, accessed February 18, 2017. http://dcpapers.dublincore.org/pubs/article/view/3673/1896

- 49. See Reference 14 above.
- 50. A discussion and invitation to collaborate on this work took place in late 2016 on the OCLC WorldCat KB listserv (see http://listserv.oclc.org/scripts/wa.exe?SUBED1=kb-l&A=1). To date, the Preus Library, Luther College, will be working with the Libraries on this project.