What Do Bachelor of Indigenous Knowledge Systems Graduates Say About Their Curriculum? A Qualitative Tracer Study at the University of Venda

Nyadzani Dolphus Nevhudoli*[a] & Vhonani Olive Netshandama[a]

* Corresponding author
Email: nevhudoli@gmail.com

a. Department of Indigenous Knowledge Systems and Heritage Studies, University of   Venda, Limpopo Province, South Africa

How to cite
Nevhudoli, N. D., & Netshandama, V. O. (2023). What Do Bachelor of Indigenous Knowledge Systems Graduates Say About Their Curriculum? A Qualitative Tracer Study at the University of Venda. *Journal of Curriculum Studies Research*, 5(1), 141-158.
https://doi.org/10.46303/jcsr.2023.11

ABSTRACT
The main purpose of any degree, in any institution of higher learning is to create graduates with competent knowledge and abilities to deal with vital challenges that affect the country; any deviations to this purpose requires a review and rethinking of the whole system, such as a curriculum transformation. Grounded in a critical post humanist paradigm, qualitative reflective semi-structured interviews were held with 12 graduates to ascertain their experiences with the Bachelor of Indigenous Knowledge System (BIKS) programme delivery and content during their 4 years stay at the University of Venda. Responses from graduates indicated that BIKS's strength depend within its multidisciplinary method. It also exposed the graduates to the work environment through integrated learning program, although, there were also sentiments that such exposure was insufficient and at times irrelevant. The experience of the students provided insights into what could be the focus of the revision of the curriculum to ensure global citizenship competencies, employability and or entrepreneurial acumen amongst graduates. One of the challenges of IKS, that the students drew attention to, was a lack of the curriculum's capacity to beneficiate, as its focus was not sufficiently business oriented. Work-based learning and other forms of exposure might have to be revamped to enhance entrepreneurial skills and to ensure that students learn how to create thriving IKS inspired businesses to create employment opportunities amongst others.
KEYWORDS
Curriculum; bachelor of indigenous knowledge system; tracer studies; graduates, posthuman thinking; humanities critical thinking.

INTRODUCTION

In 2014, the Indigenous Knowledge Systems Bachelor's degree (BIKS) Program was introduced in the following Universities University of Venda and North West University in South Africa. (Ngubane, 2018). The establishment of this program was meant to develop student with the necessary knowledge, skills, and values of Indigenous Knowledge Systems (IKS), which will prepare them to deal with today's challenges that include the economic crisis. The Higher Education Act 101 focuses on the restructuring and transformation of all programmes in institutions to respond to a new and improved curriculum, however, matters of transformation of the curriculum have been inadequately addressed in response to the call (Higher Education Quality Committee, 2001). The South African Qualifications Authority (South African Qualification Authority, 2012) is the oversight body of the National Qualification Framework, in its mandate are stipulated in the National Qualification Framework Act no 67 of 2008 , and is to enhance the quality of education and training, create a single integrated national framework for learning achievements, and facilitate access to, and mobility and progression within, education, training and career paths (South African Qualification Authority, 2013).

Universities are expected to play a crucial role in contributing to the development of a country's economy, hence, the challenge of curriculum transformation is a world-wide issue. However, the posthuman predicament is framed by the political economy of advanced capitalism. Posthuman knowledges and their emerging subjects are a welcome reality of the simultaneous way in which the past meets the present in the inclusive process of becoming one with nature. According to Braidotti (2019), studies of indigenous knowledge systems, feminists, and queers, are real-life subjects whose knowledge never made it into any of the official cartographies, yet they assisted in enabling the convergence of holistic living, non-humaniser technologically-mediated existences with post humanist perspectives.

According to Sing (2010), higher education institutions need to develop their course curricula to address these objectives in order to create a highly qualified and competent workforce. Similarly, Geel (2015), indicates that the employability skills of graduates depend largely on the role of universities in the designing of their curricula. Even though there are numerous calls for the curriculum in higher education to be changed, the content of programs seems to receive less consideration when addressing curriculum reform issues. This paper addresses the urgency of tertiary curriculum transformation in teaching and learning, whilst acknowledging the complexities and the exploration of critical posthuman education synchronization in perpetuity. This paper has adopted a posthumanism framework.

The contradiction of simultaneous overexposure and human disappearance is only discernible within this framework, and it vanishes if we address it using the distinction discourse made by Deleuze and Guattari (1994) inside the fundamental concept of the present. The fact that it does not entirely correspond with the present moment is what gives the present its power and what makes it understandable. As a result of all human and non-human creatures in a neo-materialist vital system being nomadic subjects-in-process, in constant motion, and

immanent to the vitality of self-ordering matter, such synchronization is never perfect. Therefore, approaching the present has many effects. On the one hand, it brings about a strong sense of what we are ceasing to be (the end of the actual), and on the other, it brings about a perception of what is still here.

The Posthuman curriculum offers fresh perspectives on humans as non-exceptional beings who are intertwined with other beings, including instructors and students (Blaikie, et al., 2020). Blaikie, et al. (2020), Mention additionally that rethinking pedagogy, knowledge production, and dissemination are all components of adopting a posthumanist perspective to education. If a different way of viewing the world is necessary, we must "defamiliarize [our] mental patterns by shifting away from a humanist worldview," according to (Braidotti, 2019:77). The elements of posthumanism in this paper helped both the lecturer and students to understand the needs of the society and inform curricular imperatives and educational pedagogical practices of teaching and learning. It was also informed by different perspectives from the graduates; their contribution brought evidence for the need of curriculum change, with the intention that such changes will enhance graduate employability, inclusivity, sustainability, and citizenship in the economy of the country.

The main reason that the Indigenous Knowledge System degree was initiated into institutions of Higher Learning was the realization that. in practice, curricula are located in something, i.e., people's cultures, heritage, ontologies, and epistemologies. The SAQA framework Act 68 of 2008 aims to ensure that various elements of higher education are brought together effectively and made more responsive to the country's needs (SAQA, 2012). The intention was to satisfy the demands of the expanding economies, especially combined with bettering gender equality, health, peace, and stability. Institutions of Higher Learning, therefore, were generally expected by the Council of Higher Education (CHE) to achieve three distinct national goals: educating young people to be contributing members of society, meeting industry demand with a skilled and competitive workforce, and, lastly, maintaining efforts to meet international education standards by raising the quality of human capital, productivity, and economic advancement.

The relevant question at this juncture is: *How do we determine if the institutional programs/curricula are responding well to societal and national economic challenges, hence, graduates are equipped with relevant skills?*

A tracer study is essential in answering such a question. Schiefelbein (2014) defines Tracer studies are research projects in which a sample is used at a given time and then located and re-examined at one or more subsequent points throughout their lives. In South Africa, during the previous years, institutions of Higher Education have noticed a considerable increase in the number of young people without jobs, especially amongst graduates. The current Graduate unemployment is a widespread issue worldwide, but now there are concerns about the rapidly growing numbers (Brits, et al., 2019).

There is existing research on the subject, as numerous studies have been done based on longitudinal and tracer surveys of graduates during their transition from higher study to employment. In Africa, issues of unemployment amongst graduates, and the unease of not knowing the whereabouts of graduates from universities have become challenges, as curriculum planners are not well informed about the effectiveness of their programs (Mamphokhu, et al., 2022). Currently, there is a large pool of tertiary unemployed graduates in Africa; the main reason is that the continent is producing a large number of inappropriately skilled graduates.

To identify project components that are effective and ineffective, the ILO Thesaurus (2005) describes a tracer study as an assessment method that links the impact on target groups to specific project or program components. In the meantime, Schomburg (2003) notes that graduate survey data is crucial for analysing the connection between higher education and employment. Contrarily, tracer studies, according to Millington (2001), offer quantitative structural data on employment and career, the kind of work and related competencies, as well as details on the professional direction and experiences of its graduates. As information that can be used to establish a connection between the university's curriculum content and quality of higher education is provided by the collected data, it is also a significant indicator of that quality. Tracer studies, therefore, inform universities' programmes on their relevance and responsiveness to graduates' needs, especially with career development and employment. Kalaw, (2019), indicates that tracer studies gather feedback for educational institutions to check their graduates' accomplishment and development in their careers and give policy bodies critical data on key issues. The general objective of tracer studies, is to check the medium and the long-term impact of education programs. Solid objectives of tracer study include improving the education and training content and study conditions, improving the transition of graduates from education to the labour market, and better matching the supply of skills with employment demands. Kalaw (2019), confirms that this type of research is appropriate in determining the effectiveness of programs, as it is essential to find out how effective and adequate the trainings provided by the Universities, and encourage posthumanism thinking within such training. Although posthuman thinking has its own challenges that would require its own writing, it gives opportunities to understand more complex issues around the institution of Higher Education. The articulation of posthumanism within the study becomes important.

THE ARTICULATION OF POSTHUMANISMS IN THE STUDY

This paper derives from critical post humanities according to Braidotti (2019), He alluded that posthumanities is a new area of study based on the fusion of posthumanism and post-anthropocentrism. Critical posthumanism thinking in this study was centred on exploring traditional boundaries between students as human beings and curriculum developer's exceptionalism. Students should be seen as relational, embodied, engaged, affective, and accountable organisms as well as posthuman knowing subjects (Braidotti, 2019), towards building a sustainable post humanist curriculum. This paper intends to elevate the voices of the graduates to reflect on their BIKS programme student-hood, the present as graduates but the

past as students in the process of becoming accountable citizens who belong to a location that was once marginalized, and whose voices were suppressed. Furthermore, it elevates the voices of the graduates in the promotion of a transformative curriculum. Post humanism thinking posits that a curriculum will constantly adapt and change to include amongst others, physical and virtual learning. The 4th Industrial Revolution has curricular imperatives that warrant robust engagement; thus, this study created a platform for critical post-humanistic curriculum conversations. In a post humanist approach, students are seen as intertwined with, connected to, and responsible for oneself, alongside the life and habitats of all humans, non-humans, the environment, the planet, and space, including entities beyond our planet. The inclusion of curriculum within the education system and the development of a curriculum that values the interconnected existence of all beings and their actions, rooted in and beyond classroom, and through innovative pedagogical methods, will truly support globally minded citizens who are able to think and act holistically (Blaike et al., 2020).

The paper reflected on and aligned itself with the critical posthumanist approach, which challenges education to cross examine and breakup humanist structures upon which many current educations systems rest. As Blaike (2020) show concern with a question, "How we 'do' education, arguably, relies right at the centre of rising to the challenges of developing thinking-strategies for participating in the complexities of 21st century living and working (Blaike, et al, 2020). He further suggests that a posthuman pedagogy investigate and features the following key elements: re-turning to holistic ancestral and Indigenous ways of knowing, reframing relationships between scholars, teachers, and student, considering material physical learning environments in which knowledge is co-created, and support the need to move toward post disciplinary conceptions of knowing, curriculum, and knowledge creation (Blaike, et a.l, 2020). Furthermore, Blaike, et al. (2020), suggest a conception of pedagogy that is holistic, where boundaries are porous, and learners develop capacities to feel, think, and imagine oneself relationally. Indeed, relationality is at the centre of pedagogy: it is not only between students and teachers but also in relation to the settings in which teaching, and learning take place.

POSTHUMANISM AND CURRICULUM

Posthumanism discourse has been sending strong pressure through the humanities and social sciences, however, the theory has yet to make its existence felt in educational studies, despite some memorable attempts for it to gain traction (Snaza & Weaver, 2015). Posthumanism is a philosophical perspective of how change occurs in the world; the theory includes a set of questions facing us, and the way of dealing with those questions (Wolfe, 2010). Two related notions start from this claim: firstly, the mind-body continuum, i.e. the embodiment of the body and mind, and secondly, the nature-culture continuum, i.e. nature cultural transversal bonding. The article investigated these key conceptual and methodological perspectives and discusses the impact of the critical post humanities for practices in the contemporary research at the institution of higher learning. From posthuman times, the posthuman subjects of knowledge

represent within them, are producing new fields of transdisciplinary knowledge, which we call the critical post humanities.

There is a non-inclusion of posthumanism within curriculum studies and educational studies, in general. Posthumanism is a school of thought that allows us not to see students as only requiring to travel a predestined path from not knowing to knowing, and from being deficient to having skills, but, transforms educational thought, practice, and research in related ways. Cook (2016), defines posthuman curricula as those that must continually evolve along with the students' environment, therefore, those that are informed by our present milieu. In addition, in the posthumanism era, curricular imperatives should lie both in the tangible and cyberspace realms, whereas the Bachelor of Indigenous Knowledge System curricula offers intangible and theoretical pedagogy (Cook, 2016).

Posthumanism, therefore, are powerhouse with regard to how resolutely humanist almost all educational philosophy and research is. Secondly, it allows us to rethink education and focus on how we are related to machines, and things within the universe. Thirdly, building on and incorporating these first two insights, it enables us to begin investigating new post humanist directions in research, curriculum design, and pedagogical practices (Snaza, & Weaver, 2015).

In a similar perspective, one of the values of students' voices is that it enables their participation in curriculum transformation in order to generate a curriculum in which there is democratic inclusivity, there need to be ways of allowing the whole student body to participate in decision-making at the departmental level in universities and a knowledge of the variety of opinions. For this to emerge, Universities should progress from a theoretical critique of knowledge as a symptomatic foreclosure for different definitions of meaning, towards an articulation of what we might call, for lack of a better term, new research. One of the most important perspectives of recent posthuman thinking, is that it gives such space for decolonizing the universities' curricula. Snaza & Weaver (2015), indicated that posthuman theory's questions could be constitute when discussing issues related to the relationships between humans and non-humans. This would include questions, for example, related to curriculum transformation.

Curriculum studies, like other humanist structures intellectual labour, have long been anthropocentric, which means that human beings have always been at the heart, as the most important species on earth, that accounts for why curricula have endured, to a large extent, unaffected by post-humanists thinking; this indicates that the education system carry on behind current thinking. Education specialists have long showed that their curricula have been anthropocentric because they only distress human beings, or that the experiences of human beings are somehow unconnected to or should take precedence over the experiences of non-human beings (Rowe, 2016). Thus, the critical posthumanist curriculum circle is inclusive of a relational community that Deleuze and Guattari (1987; Braidotti 2019) characterize as a mobile, transversal "assemblage" that includes nonhuman actors and technology media.

Post humanist theories supply the opportunity for students to give meaningfully to centrally evolve school curricula. Curriculum-making practices in Western schools, have generally criticize student's voices. At best, student' opinions were to seek only after important decisions had already been made and the curricula had been decided by universities (Cook, 2016). Mac Ghaill (1992), suggests that, although students are regarded as the central to schooling, they are hardly consulted during curriculum-development processes. If students' input is sought at all during curriculum development, it may be solicited during the trial, or pilot, stages. Meanwhile, post humanist theories gives an understanding of the need to develop an environment for sustainable teaching and learning during the humanist era. The main purpose of the posthumanism theory with regard to education or curriculum, is to disarrange dualistic thinking and shift the controlling force, in this case of colonial curricula to a relational perspective's curriculum located in IKS, and people engagement. Our argument is that the critical posthuman enables us to critique our own curricula, across several interdisciplinary fields, the emergence of discourses which also brings to an end the categorical distinction between life as bios, the prerogative of Anthropos, as distinct from the life of animals and non-humans (Braidotti, 2006). What comes to the fore instead, is a curriculum based on human-non-human linkages, new zoontologies (De Fontaney, 1998; Gray, 2002; Wolfe, 2003), and complex media-technological interfaces (Bono, et al., 2008).

The leading argument is that because post humanist thinking conditions are increasing in teaching and learning methods globally, students' voices need to be elevated in curriculum transformation processes, which will include those new learning areas, such as of technologies, as it will also mean replacing the means of knowledge production and distribution. Kirk &Wright (1995), mentions that in the posthuman era, students should have skills that are extracted from their relationship with technology and media. White (1994), indicates that this means a new orientation to the world in which new relations are possible. Because of new electronic communication, White (1994), claims, schools should lower their reliance on print, and rethink their conceptions of students' voices and their authority. Given that we are in the post humanist era of thinking, Tinning and Fitzclarence (1992), maintain that it is important that teachers not only take account of students' shifting understandings of various activities, such as physical activity, lifestyle and the body, but also adopt curriculum approaches that intensify students' analytical capacities and foreground individual sensitivity, which is supportive, nurturing and accepting in nature.

The study was about what the Bachelor of Indigenous Knowledge Systems (BIKS) graduates say about their curriculum at the University of Venda. Universities have a strategic role to improve the effectiveness of the curriculum to be responsive and relevant curriculum, relevant to the ethical task of turning the painful experience of unreality into generative relational encounters (Braidotti, 2019), and knowledge production and sharing. We admit that it is indeed good practice to review a curriculum every three (3) years to establish its relevance. Such a review would be incomplete if it does not include the opinion of the students. The report

in this paper intended to undertake a BIKS curriculum review, thereby obtain retrospective-reflective points from the lenses of the graduates. Schomburg (2014), indicated that the objectives of a tracer project can be multiple, but frequent ones include, inquiry on students' study development, transition to work, work entrance requirements, jobs and careers, utilization of enquired skills, current occupations, and attachments to their education in their universities. Therefore, the goal of any tracer study is to assess the impact of educational initiatives over the long term.

Below are the research questions asked in the study:

- What are your experiences, opinions, and views regarding the BIKS degree?
- What happens to BIKS graduates after they complete their studies? Where are they, and what are they doing?

METHODOLOGY

The study adopted a transformative paradigm as it has centered its framework around the experience of the graduate. A qualitative tracer approach was employed in the study because it emphasizes human experiences, hence, it was deemed a logical approach when conducting a tracer survey from a group of BIKS students who graduated from the program in 2018. Semi-structured interviews were employed as a data collection, and purposeful sampling approach as a strategy. Face to face type of an interview were conducted at the University of Venda. Where possible, the interviews were conducted in the students' respective homes, while for those who did not live within the vicinity of the University of Venda, telephonic interviews were conducted. Data was generated from 12 BIKS graduates of the 2014 to 2018 cohort. These graduates from the BIKS First cohort received their degree in May 2018. Out of 12 participants, 7 were male and 5 were female. Their ages ranged from 25-30 years. This tracer study was essential to give voices to those students who went through the programme, and thus have lived experiences that allow them legitimacy to voice graduates' views of their degree's notions of relevance and responsiveness to their situation. The study revealed the responsiveness and relevance of the BIKS curriculum in the University of Venda, through shared experiences of the graduates.

FINDINGS

The findings are discussed according to the questions posed to the participants:

- What are your experiences, opinions and views with regard to BIKS degree?
- What happens to BIKS graduates after they complete their studies, where are they and what are they doing?

Experiences of graduates in the BIKS curriculum - Teaching and Learning experience

Participants indicated that the teaching and learning experiences were largely theoretical with limited practical exposure. Curricula by nature are intended to prepare students to become experts in their chosen fields of practice and exposure to both classroom and field work assists them to learn more, although, practice enhances learning more than theories. They added that

experience in first-hand practice is extremely useful in teaching and learning, but it cannot replace theories that have being taught in the classrooms. The crucial component of active learning is an emphasis on practical experience rather than merely listening as a way of acquiring knowledge. The global education is changing to such as extent that now students do not focus only on learning skills and gaining knowledge, as practical learning has more value over the theoretical components of the curriculum especially when relating it to employability.

Herbrechter (2018), indicated that as far as the pedagogical element of technology and becoming human is anxious, there has always been an educational aspect to posthumanism, but it has long remained implied. Not many people have been openly thinking about the educational implications of posthumanism. Theoretical education is necessary, however posthuman education brings practical components into existence especially in understanding life better; with the current era of fourth industrial revolution knowledge is of minimum value unless it is put into practice. Below are some of the sentiments of graduates regarding their learning experience with BIKS curriculum:

> *My experience with the curriculum is based mostly on theories, there should be a lot of practical that are done outside the classroom in modules, especially, the third and fourth years; such modules should deal with health issues, health faculties should be consulted and other traditional practitioners, as now these modules focused more on theories*. (Graduate 4)

The responses of the graduates are challenging to the coordinators of the program and the University of Venda; graduates indicated that so far there is no relation between theories that are taught in class, the practical exposure, and the needs of the students, which limits them from obtaining the most needed practical experience. Graduates further indicated that only one stream of African indigenous health care system is offered in the 3rd and 4th year of their studies, whereas the interdisciplinary nature of IKS requires them to have a multiplicity of choices and streams from which to choose. They suggested that problem-oriented content would be more beneficial as a way of capacitating problem-solving and designing skills, so that as they work through designing IKS-based solution, they will eventually be able to create their own business and so forth. The following were the responses from the graduates with regard to the question asked:

> *There is too much African theory than practical components in the content of the curriculum that does not benefits students or graduates locally; the curriculum should also integrate western science, social entrepreneurship issues to be relevant to the society*. (Graduate 1)

Graduates suggested the following in response to their dissatisfaction with curriculum relevance, responsiveness to their needs and the expectation of the society: the University of Venda's Department of Indigenous Knowledge Systems and Heritage Studies must introduce skills development modules which will enhance problem-solving, teamwork and critical thinking and collaboration, leadership, professionalism, and strong work ethic to establish work-

integrated learning initiatives. Along this sentiment, graduates mentioned that before they graduate, they should develop their own skills by initiating their own career development. Lastly, it was mentioned that BIKS lecturers must develop their own academic abilities in the directions mentioned so that they are able to develop students' employability skill through teaching and learning. These findings promote reaching out beyond the established, incorporate the elements of humanism within the education system, and calls for approaching contemporary 4IR learning from a critical post humanist point of view.

The whereabouts of BIKS graduates after they complete their studies - Where are they and what are they doing?

Employment Opportunities

Graduates indicated that the problem of unemployment is very real to them, and that the outmost appropriate and crucial strategies to handle the problem of graduate unemployment and eliminate societal issue are for the Universities to create graduates with skills that can increase human productivity. The responses highlighted the fact that the curriculum should looked into developing knowledge and skills that are practical and relevant to their needs. Considering posthuman, the Bachelor of Indigenous Knowledge Systems will be enhanced as it will be answering questions what the discipline seeks to answer, questions such as how the degree is relevant to the current era, and the curriculum can infuse posthuman elements to enhance the skills and ability of the graduates. The field of Posthuman Studies examine what it is to be human in an age of quick technological, scientific, cultural, and social evolution.

Curriculum and employment status will always be related, meaning that a robust curriculum should an aim to address things like technology capabilities, technical education practices, social entrepreneurship education and practical skills. Konst (2021), indicates that post humanist theories, as well as transhumanist reflections encourages a constructive but rigorously critical dialogue between the various beyond humanist movements. The posthuman theories will be underlying concepts within the development of the curriculum, and the degree will be enhanced by both the posthumanism and transhumanism theory.

By implementing posthuman theories in the Bachelor of Indigenous Knowledge System, the University will be preparing graduates who can survive, since they will apply their skills and knowledge in the workplace. One graduate said the following in responding to the question asked, about their status in terms of employment:

> *Right now, I am unemployed, one of the reasons might be, I was exposed to a curriculum that has strengths in terms of providing historical knowledge, however it seems to pose a threat to the graduates who do not know where their employment will come from or rather who will employ me with the knowledge and experience, I have.*
> (Graduate 5)

The concerns around unemployment, amongst all of them was very visible throughout the responses. One rationale for the study, as mentioned, was to establish the link between graduates' unemployment and the curriculum because during the interviews, it was evident that

there was a great correlation between the two. Therefore, it was necessary to understand these two phenomena in this study: BIKS curriculum, and graduates' unemployment. Several studies suggest that South African economy have encountered severe skills shortages, whilst the economy is unable to produce sufficient job opportunities for graduates. Below is one of the sentiments of graduates regarding how the issues of unemployment can be addressed to help the economy:

> *BIKS curriculum can infuse social entrepreneurship development and innovation skills by teaching students how to implement BIKS innovations within the BIKS curriculum, teach students how to be creative and innovative because if BIKS is the way to improve our economy then factors that should be covered must align with the African innovations and entrepreneurship. Equip students with necessary education that will revive the BIKS and economy of the country.* (Graduate 3)

One of the reasons the study wanted to find the whereabouts of the students was to determine how successful the program was, hence, illustrating how well the graduates are well prepared with the important abilities that may be responsive in dealing with the problem of unemployment in both their local community and across the country. Institution of higher learning are now under severe pressure from the government's institution and other external stakeholders to supply measurable outcomes of employability, as there is immense variability about the employability of the graduates and how relevant the curricula are to the articulated learning outcome of the BIKS program (Fulgence, 2015). The conversations about the possible ways in which the University can improve graduate employability emerged during the data generation process through participants' responses to the interview questions. The responses indicated that, indeed, there is a demand for curriculum transformation to assist in the employability of the graduates; below are two of the graduates' responses:

> *BIKS curriculum is a good program. The only problem we are facing is that there seems to be very low job opportunities for IKS graduates.* (Graduate   9)
>
> *Third year students should spend a lot of time in the field rather than in classroom in order to acquire skills and experience for the job market.* (Graduate 12)

It was noticeable through participant's responses that the notion of graduate employability includes a comprehensive view on the qualities of graduates needed in a society. Graduates shared their concerns that career opportunities are not guaranteed for most graduates; one of the reasons is that the content of the BIKS program itself does not reveal to them skills required for the job market, neither does the curriculum prepare them for social life after their graduation. Based on the graduates' responses it was evident that the BIKS program lacks relevant knowledge/skills/competencies in the curriculum content. Du Preez (2019), confirms that graduates must attain a variety of skills that enhance their employability and help them thrive in their desired careers; they also add that universities in the development of such skills will increase the employability of their graduates while simultaneously raising the quality and standards of their degrees.

The findings also revealed that many graduates were unemployed. Of those that are unemployed, some have opted to further their studies and or take up a different degree. Graduates who participated in the study indicated the need to acquire additional skills to make it in the job market. Below is one response:

> It is good to also include the 4th industrial revolution concept in order to develop more skills and more jobs for the upcoming youth and graduates. The adaption and infusing of technology in the curriculum will enable and expose the students to a combination of both practical and theoretical parts of what they have been taught in class and meet the demand and supply answers to the 21st century society. (Graduate 8)

Interventions may include infusing short skills programme to diversify the skills set. Given the reported high unemployment rate in the country, the questions asked of the adequacy, relevance, and responsiveness of current programme to the needs of society, needs to be re-engaged.

Furthering Studies

Why will the future of institution of higher learning will be indeed of posthumanism in particular? There is no longer time to focus only on early childhood education and primary school for the development pf awareness, skills and critical thinking, as well to make sure that the future generation are more responsible and can make sustainable decision (Konst, 2021). In real life, this means that graduates should continue their education and concentrate more on post-humanistic principles. By including these values, we hope to ensure that all graduates develop the attitudes and skills necessary to act in favour of a future that is more sustainable. Meanwhile, participants in the study indicated that after completing their degree, many of them come across questions, such as *"Where next?"* and *"How?".* Similarly, the questions in this tracer study were meant to discover the whereabouts of the graduates, hence, questions, such as *"Where are they?"* and *"What are they doing?"* were asked. With the country and society, we are living in, with graduates' employment uncertainty, furthering study was a more practical option for many graduates, and posthumanism education would introduce new approaches of thinking by graduates. Participant indicated the following reasons as to why they opted to study further after completing the BIKS undergraduate degree.

> An BIKS degree only is not enough for job market nowadays wherein there is a growing number of unemployment, because we are exposed to low levels of practical and problem-solving content, during my undergraduate study; the exposure is not enough to make you stand out from all those unemployed graduates, hence I decided to further my studies to enhance my chances, life is tough out here. (Graduate 7)

> I am a registered postgraduate student, I mean I am not working there is nothing that I can be doing except studying right now. (Graduate 11)

According to Mavundla (2021), the critical mandate of the Universities is to reshape students by increasing attitude, knowledge, skills, and abilities while simultaneously empowering them. Pursuing postgraduate studies puts students in a better position to secure

employment, as their capabilities are increased, thus making them more competent in the delivery of services that they provide. (Konst, 2021) universities should encourage graduates to further their studies towards working life needs, expectations, and aligning such studies on the market economy requirements. Therefore, the educational system needs developments and a paradigm shift. Several studies indicated that there is an importance of post humanistic viewpoint in higher education and what does it mean it practice of teaching and learning.

DISCUSSION

When reflecting on the parameters of the BIKS curriculum from a critical post humanist perspectives, we can argue that the programme would be enhanced by the embrace of the inclusion of the voices of the 'missing people' (Braidotti, 2019), in this, the graduates, whose voices hardly made it to curriculum circles, and of the complexities of navigating a space in between of a programme conceptually designed to embrace the previously marginalized voices in the knowledge production and sharing process, with the acknowledgement of the complexities of the connected way in which the disentanglement with cognitive capitalism, would necessarily occur simultaneously with the perpetual synchronization of the man with non-man and all living things and nature. A practical pedagogy is aimed at addressing unemployment, student assistance, the adoption of African pedagogies in conjunction with parallel shifts in language and history politics, and student involvement in knowledge and skill production are only a few of the transformations (Ramrathan, 2016). According to Ameyaw et al. (2019), a responsive curriculum should address students' evolving requirements by bridging the gap between contextual, constantly changing realities of daily life and the workplace on the one hand, and universal knowledge and ideas on the other.

The graduates' responses indicated that a critical thinking, entrepreneurial and problem-solving curriculum content need strengthening, that the curriculum should also focus on creativity, innovation and technology skills, to prepare students to adapt to 4IR requisites, which would add value to their awareness of the convergence between the environmental awareness, suitability and the machine, which place them in better career pathing options and perpetual inquiry about the human, the post human and the critical post human paradigms (Braidotti, 2019).

An awareness was brought forth that they should not be a resist in understanding both the post humanistic and humanistic thinking as they can add value to the philosophy, practices, and scholarship in universities; both paradigms matter in the development of the curriculum. Graduates' shared experiences with the curriculum ranged from the type of content being offered, to the implications of such content to them as graduates as the irrelevance and non-responsiveness of the curriculum were mentioned several times. The findings, therefore, calls for a more rigorous curriculum revision to include the areas mentioned by the non-working graduates, such as practical learning, placements, entrepreneurship techniques and inviting

'organic intellectuals' or what is referred to as 'grassroot professors' in teaching and learning environment, together with mentoring of students in and outside the classroom.

Self-reflexivity focuses more on issues and events in the real world. Furthermore, we argue that post humanist curriculum works through relational assemblages (of man, the living and nature), mutual respect, generative cross pollination and epistemic relations which is likely to continue releasing hybrid offspring and new heterogeneous assemblages (Deleuze & Guattari, 1994). We concur with capitalism (Braidotti, 2016), that the driving force behind curriculum transformations should not be the pursuit for disciplinary clarity, or the inspirational force of absolute dissent, but rather the modes of relational curriculum discourses to open up to the practical world.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE FINDINGS

The key argument derived from the findings are of this study are that a curriculum founded in post humanist perspective would be a constant state of transformation, however we found that the speed at which the BIKS synchronisation is not commensurate with the now in relation to the past and the future and the voices of the 'missing people': there is lack of significance of critical thinking and critical inquiry, locatedness, creativity, innovation as a constant throughout the curriculum. Graduates' experiences were largely theoretical rather than practical knowledge, which denies them opportunities to practice critical thinking expected of a post humanist graduate. A post humanist graduate we argue should be well placed to critically review and adapt either as a job seeker or as a creator of job opportunities for less privileged people. The convergence of man, the environment and technology were according to the inputs of the graduates who participated in the study, largely missing. Curricula in the institutions of Higher learning have an important role both politically and conceptually to forward attitudes, values, and ways of thinking. However, the approaches employed in teaching and learning education are traditionally very human-centric, ignoring post humanistic viewpoints. The implication of a slower pace of transformation imply that it may be irrelevant with times. Although we may argue that there may be no immediate extinction or replacement, delays may imply recycling the old to a point of perpetual dysfunctional future people who are less concerned about the implications of what they do in the present regarding life, living and the environment.

Limitations of the Study

The study was conducted during Covid-19 period and reports qualitative feedback from a limited number the first cohort of graduates of University of Venda's Indigenous Knowledge System Bachelor's degree and thus could be argues that maximum variation responses was limited.

CONCLUSION

This paper provides that basis for necessary conversations and actions about the critical post humanist curriculum review is an academic knowledge production, co-creation and exchange project that should embrace inclusivity and disrupt the popularly held view that the human

implicitly endorsed by the academic Eurocentrism and 'methodological nationalism' (Beck, 2007). It positions the BIKS curriculum as a post humanist curriculum that may not necessarily fit to the discussion and institutional arrangements of the academic disciplines. It puts the human accountability for the present as both actual (field-sites experiential learning and virtual (online tech learning). The authority of curriculum should in this regard shared amongst the people and the technology accordingly. Like Braidotti (2019), we have argued that trans-disciplinary dialogue as 'studies' and as the critical post humanities warrant serious scholarly credentials. The critical post humanities can be the epistemological vehicle for a detailed focus on the complex singularities that represent our respective curriculum transformation locations. Although there are anxieties on the slowness of curriculum transformation, we argue that the complexities of navigating the spaces in between, the need for robust engagements and the touched on a multifaceted synchronization should be a constant that should not be taken lightly. It is not a crisis but rather a critical post humanist way in which the need for curriculum transformations is in equal considerations with cognitive justice, politico-social justices, and inclusive and robust engagement with the previously marginalized- this process will inevitably happen simultaneously and with some sense of urgency and agency. The critical post humanist perspective in the study was a useful point of departure for the BIKS review lens and could be applied in the transformation of the BIKS programme and other related programmes.

The concept offered an insight into possibilities for a problem-solving curriculum that will address students' and societies' needs. The data generated from the experiences of graduate participants from the program assisted in addressing the rationales for the study, which were: to discover and address curriculum-relate issues, (which included reasons for graduates' unemployment status), to transform the curriculum for relevance and responsiveness (with the intention to infuse innovation, critical thinking, and entrepreneurial skills).

The study findings may enhance and promote the revision of the BIKS programme at University of Venda. Such revision may include the development of the curriculum according to the interest, needs or abilities of the students, updating methods of teaching and content should also be the primary focus, to new knowledge and practices, as well as to develop joint projects with holders of indigenous knowledge acting as field preceptors, informal educators, and mentors. The interdisciplinary nature of the BIKS programme requires freedoms of thinking and choices and not narrowly structured notions of career pathing that keeps students in colonial boxes. Similarly, the programme may be revised to enhance notions of connected degrees, i.e. where internship and or decolonial apprenticeship models are integrated into the curriculum delivery. The findings were specifically related to teaching and learning aspects of BIKS; however, the paper has laid a foundation for the development of a post-humanist thinking within the BIKS and other related curricula. Further studies could explore in more depth the manifestations of decolonizing a curriculum from a critical postcolonial lens.

REFERENCES

Ameyaw, J., Turnhout, E., Arts, B. & Wals, A. (2019). Creating a responsive curriculum for postgraduates: lessons from a case in Ghana. *Journal of Further and Higher Education,* 43(4), 573-588.

Banerjee, A., Duflo, E., Goldberg, N., Karlan, D., Osei, R., Parienté, W. & Udry, C. (2015). A multifaceted program causes lasting progress for the very poor: Evidence from six countrie*s*. *Science*, *348*(6236).

Beck, U. (2007) *The cosmopolitan condition: Why methodological nationalism fails. Theory*, *Culture & Society* 24(7/8), 286-290.

Blaikie, F., Daigle C. & Vasseu L. (2020). "*New pathways for teaching and learning: the posthumanist approach*", Canadian Commission for UNESCO, Ottawa, Canada, December 2020.

Bono, J. J, Dean, T. & Ziarek, E. P. (2008). *A Time for the Humanities: Futurity and the Limits of Autonomy*. Fordham: Fordham University Press.

Braidotti, R. (2019). A theoretical framework for the critical posthumanities. *Theory, Culture & Society*, *36*(6), 31-61.

Braidotti, R. (2016). Posthuman critical theory. In Banerji, D., & Paranjape, M. R. (Eds.). *Critical posthumanism and planetary futures*. (pp. 13-32). Springer, New Delhi.

Brits, H. J. & Steyn, C. (2019, October). Conducting a Graduate Tracer Study at a University of Technology: a Quest to Enhance the Learning Experience. In *Balkan Region Conference on Engineering and Business Education*, 3(1), 10-18.

CHE, (2013). *A proposal for undergraduate curriculum reform*, Pretoria, CHE.

Cook, J. (2016). *The posthuman curriculum and the teacher.* Averitt College of Graduate Studies (COGS), Georgia Southern University, Statesboro, Georgia.

Colla, S. P. (2018). Teaching "fundamental values" in the Swedish education system: Towards an anti-authoritarian Regime of Truth. *Quaderni di Sociologia*, 78, 101-124.

Cuadra, L. J., Aure, M. R. K. L. & Gonzaga, G. L. (2019). The use of tracer study in improving undergraduate programs in the university. *Asia Pacific Higher Education Research Journal* (APHERJ), 6(1). 34-52

Du Preez, M., Van der Merwe, L. J. & Swart, S. B. (2019). Employability skills: what is required of consumer sciences graduates? *Journal of Consumer Sciences*, *47*(1), 92-104.

De Fontenay. (1998). *Le silence des beˆtes*. Paris: Fayard

Deleuze, G. & Guattari, F. (1987). *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Deleuze, G. & Guattari, F. (1994). *What is Philosophy*? New York: Columbia University Press

Drine, I. (2017). *Education and entrepreneurship to address youth unemployment in MENA Region. Expert Group Meeting on Strategies for Eradicating Poverty to Achieve Sustainable Development for All*. United Nations, New York.

Fulgence, K. (2015). *Employability of higher education institutions graduates exploring the influence of entrepreneurship education and employability skills development program activities in Tanzania*. University of Siegen, Germany.

Geel, M. (2015). *An investigation into the employability skills of undergraduate Business Management students* [Doctoral dissertation].

Gines, A. C. (2014). Tracer study of PNU graduates. *American International Journal of Contemporary Research,* 4(3), 81-98.

Government Gazette Republic of South Africa. National Qualification Framework Act 67 of 2008. Pretoria: SAQA.

Herbrechter, S. (2018). Posthumanism and the ends of education. *On Education. Journal for Research and Debate*, *1*(2). https://doi.org/10.17899/on_ed.2018.2.2

Higher Education Quality Committee (HEQC). (2001). Quality Assurance in Higher Education. Pretoria. Council on Higher Education.

International Labour Organization (ILO) Thesaurus. (2005). Tracer studies. Available at http://www.tracer studies.ilo.org/public/english

Kalaw, M. T. B. (2019). Tracer Study of Bachelor of Science in Mathematics. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education*, 8(3), 537-548.

Kirk, D. & Wright, J. (1995). The social construction of bodies: implications for health and physical education curriculum*. Unicorn,* 21(4). 63-73

Konst T. (2021). Posthuman an Emerging paradigm shift in Higher Education? 15th International Technology, Education and Development Conference, 8 - 9 March 2021, (pp. 790-794.)

Mac Ghaill, M. (1992). Teachers' work: curriculum restructuring, culture, power and comprehensive schooling. *British Journal of Sociology of Education,* 13(2), 177-199.

Mamphokhu K., Bhorat , H., Oosthuizen, M., Asmal, Z., Ganyaupf, E., Netshifhefhe , E., Martin, E., Monnakgotla, J. & Rooney, C. (2022). *Report on Skills Supply and Demand in South Africa. South African Department of Higher Education*. Pretoria.

Mavundla, N. P. (2021). *The motives behind students pursuing postgraduate studies in the Humanities: a case study of the postgraduate students at the University of KwaZulu-Natal.* [Doctoral dissertation]. University of Kwazulu Natal.

Millington, C. (2001). The use of tracer study for enhancing relevance and marketability in online and distance education. http://wikieducator.org/images/e/e1/PID_424 pd

Ngubane, K. (2018). *White Paper Strategies Repot (DSI)*. Pretoria.

Ramrathan, L. (2016). Beyond counting the numbers: Shifting higher education transformation into curriculum spaces*. Transformation in Higher Education*, 1(1), 1-8. https://doi.org/10.4102/ the.v1i1.6.

Rowe, B. (2016). Challenging anthropocentrism in education: Posthumanist intersectionality and eating animals as gastro-aesthetic pedagogy. In Rice, S., & Rud, A. G. (Eds.). *The*

*educational significance of human and non-human animal interactions (*pp. 31-49).
Blurring the species line. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, New York.

Schomburg, H. (2014, March). Key Methodological Issues of Tracer Studies – Challenges for a Guide on Tracer Studies*. In Proceedings from Presentation at the Validation Seminar on Methodological Guides for Skills Anticipation and Matching*. Cedefop-ILO-ETF Expert Seminar (Prague, 6-7 March 2014). National Training Fund.

Schomburg, H. (2003). *Handbook for tracer studies 1st ed*. Germany: Centre for Research on Higher Education and Work University of Kassel.

Schiefelbein E. & Farrell, J.P (2014). Tracer Studies: Research and Studies. Psacharopoulos, Elsevier, Volume. 35, 382-385.

Sing, R. (2010). *Career Trajectories of Master's in Education (M. Ed) Students*: *A Tracer Study of the M. Ed Class of 1999.* University of the Witwatersrand.

Snaza, N. & Weaver, J. A. (Eds.). (2015). *Posthumanism and educational research*. New York, NY: Routledge.

South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA) (2012). *Policy and criteria for the registration of qualiications and part-qualifications on the National Qualifications Framework*. SAQA, Pretoria.

South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA) (2013). *National policy for the implementation of the recognition of prior learning*. SAQA, Pretoria.

Tinning, R. & Fitzclarence, L. (1992). Postmodern youth culture and the crisis in Australian secondary school physical education*. Quest,* 44(3). 287-303

White, D. (1994) *Curriculum reform: the big picture. In Deakin Centre for Education and Change, Schooling What Future? Balancing the Education Agenda*. Geelong, Victoria: Deakin Centre for Education and Change.

Wolfe, C. (2010). *What is posthumanism?* (Vol. 8). University of Minnesota Press.